

Why do individuals with Asperger's Syndrome have difficulty recognising the  
emotions of others?

Alyssa Caroline Perkins Sawyer

BCA (creative writing), Grad. Dip. Psych., BA (Hons).

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of  
the requirements for the degree of  
*Doctor of Philosophy (Clinical Psychology)*

School of Psychology  
Faculty of Social and Behavioural Sciences  
Flinders University of South Australia

December, 2011

## Table of Contents

List of tables .....	vi
List of Figures .....	ix
Abstract.....	x
Declaration.....	xii
Declaration of Ethics Approval .....	xiii
Peer-reviewed Publications Arising from this Thesis .....	xiii
Conference Presentations Arising from this Thesis .....	xiii
Acknowledgements .....	xiv
Chapter one - Asperger’s Syndrome and Emotion Recognition from facial expressions .....	1
Overview .....	1
Review of the Historical Development of the Concept of Asperger’s Syndrome.....	4
Social Interaction: The Importance of Emotion Recognition Skills.....	8
Emotion recognition and Asperger’s Syndrome .....	10
How are the Emotions of Others Recognised? .....	11
Why do Individuals with Asperger’s Syndrome have Difficulties Recognising Emotions from Faces? .....	17
Chapter two - Study one: Can Gaze Avoidance Explain why Individuals with Asperger’s Syndrome have Difficulty Recognising Emotions from Facial Expressions?.....	18
Overview .....	18
Method.....	23
Participants. ....	23
Design.....	24
Apparatus.....	24
Materials. ....	25
Wechsler Abbreviated Scale of Intelligence. ....	25
Depression Anxiety and Stress Scale – Short form. ....	26
Emotion synonym task. ....	27
Stimuli. ....	27
Emotion recognition task: Development. ....	27

Emotion recognition task: Format. ....	29
Procedure. ....	31
Results .....	31
Differences in emotion recognition accuracy due to diagnosis, face region condition and expression type. ....	31
Differences in eye tracking due to diagnosis, face region condition and expression type. ....	34
Relationship between looking at the eye and mouth region and emotion recognition accuracy. ....	36
Differences in eyetracking during the passive viewing task and the active emotion recognition task. ....	37
Discussion.....	39
Summary of findings. ....	39
Eye gaze relationship with emotion recognition accuracy. ....	39
Emotion recognition accuracy from the eye only and mouth only conditions.....	40
Emotion recognition accuracy overall: The effect of expression type. ....	41
Eye gaze while recognising emotions from whole faces.....	43
Eye gaze during passive viewing of faces in comparison to active emotion recognition. ....	46
Explanations for emotion recognition deficits in Asperger’s Syndrome. ....	46
Conclusion. ....	49
Chapter three – Study two: Meta-cognitive Processes in Emotion Recognition. Are They Different in Adults with Asperger’s Syndrome? .....	50
Overview .....	50
The Relationship between Confidence, Anxiety and Accuracy .....	51
Meta-Cognitive Skill: Discriminating Accurate from Inaccurate Judgments on the Basis of Confidence.....	53
Meta-cognitive Skill: Effective Filtering .....	55
Summary.....	57
Method.....	58

Participants.....	58
Design.....	59
Materials.....	60
Wechsler Abbreviated Scale of Intelligence.....	60
Depression Anxiety and Stress Scale – Short form.....	60
Stimuli.....	60
Emotion recognition task.....	60
General knowledge task.....	62
Passive viewing task.....	63
Procedure.....	63
Assessment of meta-cognitive measures.....	63
Accuracy discrimination ability.....	63
Engagement in filtering.....	64
Filtering effectiveness index (d prime).....	64
Results.....	65
Overview of statistical analyses.....	65
Emotion recognition and general knowledge accuracy.....	65
Average confidence and anxiety.....	66
Are there differences between the AS and no-AS groups in self- reported confidence and anxiety?.....	66
The relationship between confidence, anxiety and accuracy for the AS and no-AS groups.....	68
Meta-cognitive skill: Accuracy discrimination.....	71
Differences between the AS and no-AS groups for the emotion recognition and general knowledge tasks.....	71
Relationship between accuracy discrimination confidence, accuracy and anxiety in the AS and no-AS groups.....	72
Meta-cognitive skill: Filtering effectiveness.....	75
Filtering engagement for the AS and no-AS groups.....	75
Effectiveness in filtering responses AS versus no-AS group.....	78
Discussion.....	82

Self-reported anxiety: Comparison of emotion recognition, passive face viewing and general knowledge tasks, and the relationship between anxiety confidence and accuracy. ....	83
Relationship between confidence and accuracy: Accuracy discrimination index for adults with and without Asperger’s Syndrome. ....	86
Response filtering: Engagement, and effectiveness. ....	88
Conclusions. ....	90
Chapter 4 – Study 3: Are Adults with Asperger’s Syndrome Better at Recognising the Emotions of Familiar People than Unfamiliar People? .....	92
Overview .....	92
The Effect of Familiarity and the Role of Generalisation .....	93
The Role of Confidence and Anxiety .....	97
Summary .....	97
Method .....	98
Participants. ....	98
Design. ....	99
Stimuli. ....	99
Familiar and unfamiliar emotion recognition task: Development. ....	99
Familiar and unfamiliar emotion recognition task: Format. ....	101
Procedure. ....	103
Results .....	103
Discussion .....	107
Chapter 5 – Study 4: The Relationship between Social Skills, Emotion Recognition Accuracy, Meta-cognitive Skill and Theory of Mind Ability. ....	112
Overview .....	112
The Relationship between ToM and Meta-cognitive Skill, and their Effect on Social Skills .....	113
The Relationship between Emotion Recognition and Social Skill .....	117
Summary .....	120
Method .....	120

Participants.....	120
Materials.....	121
Social Skills Inventory.....	121
Tests of Theory of Mind ability.....	121
Stimuli.....	125
Emotion recognition task.....	125
Results.....	125
Social skills: Relationship with ToM and meta-cognitive skill.....	125
The relationship between ToM, meta-cognitive skill and emotion recognition accuracy.....	125
Do ToM, meta-cognitive skill and/or emotion recognition accuracy predict social skills?.....	128
Discussion.....	131
Meta-cognitive skill, ToM and social skills.....	131
Emotion recognition skills and social skills.....	134
Summary.....	136
General Discussion.....	136
Overview.....	136
What Have we Learnt about the Emotion Recognition Abilities of Individuals with Asperger's Syndrome?.....	138
The Importance of Meta-cognitive Skills and ToM Ability for Social Skill.....	148
Summary.....	153
References.....	154

## List of tables

Table 2.1 <i>Emotion Recognition Accuracy (% correct) for AS and No-AS Groups from the Full Face, Eyes-Only and Mouth-Only Conditions .....</i>	32
Table 2.2 <i>Emotion Recognition Accuracy Scores (%) for AS and no-AS Group for Basic and Complex Emotions .....</i>	33
Table 2.3. <i>Observation Length (in Seconds) by AS and no-AS Group to the Eye and Mouth Region of Photographs of Basic and Complex Expressions. ....</i>	36
Table 2.4. <i>Correlations between Observation Length and Emotion Recognition Accuracy for Basic and Complex Expressions .....</i>	37
Table 3.1. <i>Means (Standard Deviations) for Percentage Accuracy, Confidence and Anxiety Reported by Adults with and without Asperger's Syndrome (AS) during the Emotion Recognition Task and the General Knowledge Task .....</i>	67
Table 3.2. <i>Correlations (with 95% Confidence Intervals in Brackets) between Confidence, Anxiety (Measured Separately in the two Tasks) and Accuracy During the Emotion Recognition and General Knowledge Tasks.....</i>	70
Table 3.3. <i>Means (Standard Deviations) and 95% Confidence Intervals for Gamma Correlations for Adults with and without Asperger's Syndrome (AS) During the Emotion Recognition and the General Knowledge Tasks .....</i>	72
Table 3.4. <i>Correlations (with 95% Confidence Intervals in Brackets) between Gamma Correlation Scores, Anxiety and Confidence (both Measured Separately in the Two Tasks), and Accuracy During the Emotion Recognition and General Knowledge Tasks .....</i>	74

Table 3.5. <i>Comparison of Accuracy, Confidence, Anxiety and Gamma Correlation Scores between those Participants with Asperger's Syndrome who did or did not Withhold Responses in the Emotion Recognition Task</i> .....	77
Table 3.6. <i>Means (Standard Deviations) and 95% Confidence Intervals (CIs) for d' Scores for Adults with and without Asperger's Syndrome (AS) During the Emotion Recognition Task and the General Knowledge Task</i> .....	79
Table 3.7. <i>Correlations (with 95% Confidence Intervals in Brackets) between d' Scores, Confidence, Anxiety (Measured Separately in the two Tasks) and Accuracy During the Emotion Recognition and General Knowledge Tasks</i> .....	81
Table 4.1. <i>Means (Standard Deviations) for Demographic Details of Adults in the Asperger's Syndrome (AS) Group and Familiar Other Group</i> .....	99
Table 4.2. <i>Means (Standard Deviations) for Percentage Accuracy, Confidence, Anxiety and Reaction Time for Adults with Asperger's Syndrome in Response to Photographs of Familiar and Unfamiliar Faces During the Emotion Recognition Tasks</i> .....	104
Table 4.3. <i>Correlations (with 95% Confidence Intervals in Brackets) between Confidence, Anxiety, and Accuracy in Response to Familiar Faces and Unfamiliar Faces</i> .....	107
Table 5.1. <i>Percentage Scores for Adults with and without Asperger's Syndrome (AS) on the Strange Stories Task and the Theory of Mind (ToM) Animations Task</i> .....	123
Table 5.2. <i>Means (Standard Deviations) for Adults with and without Asperger's Syndrome on the Strange Stories Task and the Theory of Mind (ToM) Animations Task</i> .....	124
Table 5.3. <i>Correlations (with 95% Confidence Intervals in Brackets) between ToM and Meta-cognitive Skills for the AS and No-AS Groups</i> .....	126

Table 5.4. <i>Correlations (with 95% Confidence Intervals in Brackets) between Scores From the ToM Tasks, Meta-cognitive Skill and Emotion Recognition Accuracy for the AS and No-AS Groups</i> .....	127
Table 5.5. <i>Correlations (with 95% Confidence Intervals in Brackets) between the Social Skills Inventory (SSI), Meta-cognitive Skill, ToM, and Emotion Recognition Accuracy Scores</i> .....	129

## List of Figures

<i>Figure 1.</i> The presentation order of stimuli in the full face, eyes-only and mouth-only conditions.....	31
---	----

## Abstract

Humans have a well-developed ability to recognise the emotions of others on the basis of their facial expressions. However this skill does not appear to be intuitive for some populations, such as people with Asperger's Syndrome. The aim of this thesis was to understand why individuals with Asperger's Syndrome have difficulties recognising emotions on the basis of facial expressions and more broadly, how this may relate to their difficulties with social interaction.

Three factors that have the potential to explain impaired emotional recognition among individuals with Asperger's Syndrome were investigated: (i) avoidance of eye contact when scanning the facial expressions of others; (ii) problems using meta-cognitive skills (such as using confidence as a guide to the accuracy of decisions); and (iii) problems using cognitive processes when interpreting the facial expressions of unfamiliar people.

In Studies 1 and 2, the first two factors were investigated using an emotion recognition task developed and validated specifically for use in these studies. Both studies compared the emotion recognition performance of individuals with Asperger's Syndrome to individuals without Asperger's Syndrome. In Study 1, I found that there was no difference in the way individuals with Asperger's Syndrome scanned key regions of facial expressions. However, they were less able to accurately recognise both basic and complex emotions from facial expressions as compared to individuals without Asperger's Syndrome. As no difference was found in the way the two groups scanned facial expressions, the ability of the two groups to use meta-cognitive skills when making emotion recognition decisions was examined in Study 2. It was found that individuals with Asperger's Syndrome were able to use confidence as a guide to the accuracy of their

decisions similarly to individuals without Asperger's Syndrome. However, individuals with Asperger's Syndrome had more difficulty using this information to "filter" their responses (i.e., identifying which of their decisions were accurate versus which were inaccurate).

In Study 3, the extent to which individuals with Asperger's Syndrome have a specific problem with unfamiliar faces was investigated. Specifically, whether they had a problem generalising emotion recognition skills to recognise emotions from the facial expressions of unfamiliar people rather than a more general problem using emotion recognition skills (i.e., regardless of the familiarity of a face). Emotion recognition tasks were created for each participant, one displaying photographs of a familiar person's facial expressions, and one displaying photographs of an unfamiliar person's facial expressions. It was found that there was no difference in the accuracy with which individuals with Asperger's Syndrome were able to recognise emotions from familiar versus unfamiliar faces. Furthermore, there were no differences in the ability of individuals with Asperger's Syndrome to use meta-cognitive skills to make emotion recognition decisions in response to familiar versus unfamiliar faces.

Finally, in Study 4, I investigated the relationships between (a) emotion recognition skills and social skills, and (b) Theory of Mind (ToM), meta-cognitive skills and social skills. The key finding from this study was that ToM and meta-cognitive skills independently contributed to social skills, while emotion recognition skills did not. This finding is limited due to low power to detect significant relationships within each group, however the findings suggest that a focus on improving both meta-cognitive and ToM skills in order to improve the social skills of individuals with Asperger's Syndrome is a promising avenue for further research.

### **Declaration**

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgment any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

Alyssa Sawyer, BCA (creative writing), Grad. Dip. Psych., BA (Hons).

### **Declaration of Ethics Approval**

All studies presented in this thesis received ethics approval for the Flinders University Social and Behavioural Research Ethics Committee. Approval numbers are as follows:

- Study 1: 4296; Study 2: 4719; Study 3 and 4: 4838

### **Peer-reviewed Publications Arising from this Thesis**

Sawyer, A., Williamson, P., & Young, R. (2011). Can gaze avoidance explain why individuals with Asperger's Syndrome can't recognise emotions from facial expressions? *Journal of Autism and Developmental Disorders*. Advance online publication. doi: 10.1007/s10803-011-1283-0

### **Conference Presentations Arising from this Thesis**

Sawyer, A., Young, R., & Williamson, P. (2009, August). *Understanding the eyes: Face processing and emotion recognition in Autism Spectrum Disorders*. Poster session presented at the meeting of the Asia Pacific Autism Conference, Sydney, Australia.

Sawyer, A., Williamson, P., Young, R., & Sawyer, M. (2010, October). *Can gaze avoidance explain why young people with Asperger's Syndrome have difficulty recognising emotions from faces?* Poster session presented at the meeting of the American Academy of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry, New York.

Sawyer, A., Young, R., & Williamson, P. (2011, September). *Meta-cognitive processes in emotion recognition: Are they different for adults with Asperger's Syndrome*. Paper presented at the meeting of the Asia Pacific Autism Conference, Perth, Australia.

## Acknowledgements

First of all I would like to thank my supervisors, Dr Paul Williamson and Associate Professor Robyn Young, for their guidance, knowledge and time. Particularly to Paul for always getting me to think above and beyond (even when I didn't think I could). I would also like to thank Bec for taking and editing all the photographs used in this thesis. Also thanks are due to Autism SA for assisting with recruitment and to all the participants who happily participated and gave up their time simply with the hope of helping to advance knowledge.

And on a personal note thanks are due to:

- My parents for inspiring a life-long journey for knowledge and understanding, and providing endless support and encouragement along the way.
- My wonderful Jim for always being there (with ginger chicken) when the going got tough, and for never failing to make me laugh.
- My office buddies and fellow PhD friends for preserving my sanity, even at the darkest moments, and for all the laughs and the gossip and the many many lunch dates. Particularly to Kate and Jemma for also always keeping me fed. I have been thoroughly blessed to be on this roller coaster with such intelligent, dynamic and fabulous women.
- Kat for quietly being there to help, whether it be to go through a practise testing session at the last minute or to format this entire thesis, without fuss and always with a smile.
- To my Mum and Kerry, thank you for not only proof-reading this thesis but also saying that it was interesting.
- Finally, mostly importantly, to all my friends and family. You are the back bone of my life. Without you all this journey would not have been possible.