Parenting groups as sources of social capital: their patterns of use and outcomes for Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal mothers of young children

Submitted by
Wendy Shulver
Bachelor of Behavioural Science (Honours)

A thesis submitted in total fulfilment of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Sociology,
School of Social and Policy Studies
Faculty of Social and Behavioural Sciences,
Flinders University,
Adelaide, Australia

October 2011
Table of Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS .................................................................................................................. iii
LIST OF FIGURES ......................................................................................................................... vi
LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................................................................ viii
SUMMARY .................................................................................................................................... xi
DECLARATION ............................................................................................................................. ix
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................................................................ xii

CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 1
  THESIS AIMS .............................................................................................................................. 3
  OUTLINE OF CHAPTERS .......................................................................................................... 6
  TERMINOLOGY ........................................................................................................................... 10
      Parenting Groups ................................................................................................................ 10
      Aboriginal and Disadvantaged Mothers ............................................................................. 10
      Aboriginal Terminology ........................................................................................................ 11
  ABORIGINAL SOCIOHISTORIC CONTEXT .............................................................................. 12
  SUMMARY .................................................................................................................................. 15

CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW ............................................................................................. 17
  SOCIAL SUPPORT OVERVIEW ................................................................................................. 17
  INFORMAL SOCIAL SUPPORT .................................................................................................. 19
  SOCIAL SUPPORT AND PARENTING ....................................................................................... 20
  SOCIAL SUPPORT AND SOCIOECONOMIC DISADVANTAGE.................................................. 21
  PLAYGROUPS ........................................................................................................................... 24
      Playgroups and Social Support ........................................................................................... 25
      Playgroup Participation and Socioeconomic Status ......................................................... 26
      Supported Playgroups ......................................................................................................... 28
      Aboriginal Supported Playgroups ..................................................................................... 30
  PARENT SUPPORT GROUPS .................................................................................................... 31
  PARENT SUPPORT GROUPS ...................................................................................................... 33
      Parent Support Groups and Social Support ...................................................................... 35
      Parent Support Groups and Psychological Adjustment ................................................... 40
      Parent Support Group Facilitators .................................................................................... 41
      Parent Support Groups and Socioeconomic Disadvantage .............................................. 41
      Aboriginal Parent Support Groups ..................................................................................... 43
  SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION ................................................................................................. 44

CHAPTER 3. THEORY .................................................................................................................. 47
  COLEMAN ................................................................................................................................. 48
  BOURDIEU ................................................................................................................................. 51
  PUTNAM ..................................................................................................................................... 55
  SOCIAL CAPITAL RESEARCH .................................................................................................. 57
      Social Capital and Health ..................................................................................................... 59
      Social Capital and Disadvantage ......................................................................................... 60
      Social Capital and the Family .............................................................................................. 63
      Social Capital and Aboriginal Research ............................................................................. 67
  CRITIQUES OF SOCIAL CAPITAL—THE CASE FOR CONTEXT ............................................. 71
  PUTTING IT ALL TOGETHER—SOCIAL SUPPORT, SOCIAL CAPITAL, CONTEXT AND THE
  SOCIAL STRUCTURE ................................................................................................................... 72
  CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................................ 75
CHAPTER 4. METHODS .......................................................................................................................... 79
Evolution of the Research Project ........................................................................................................... 79
Mixed Methods Research .......................................................................................................................... 85
Qualitative Component .............................................................................................................................. 87
Aboriginal Community Health Centre ...................................................................................................... 87
Aboriginal Mothers’ group .......................................................................................................................... 88
Aboriginal Playgroup ................................................................................................................................. 89
Non-Aboriginal Playgroup .......................................................................................................................... 89
Qualitative Procedures ............................................................................................................................... 90
Description of Sample and Qualitative Analysis ...................................................................................... 93
Aboriginal Research as a Non-Aboriginal Researcher .............................................................................. 98
Quantitative Methodology ........................................................................................................................ 102
Design ....................................................................................................................................................... 103
Weighting, Non-Response and Missing Data ............................................................................................. 105
Aboriginal Participants ............................................................................................................................... 107
Measures ................................................................................................................................................... 108
Statistical Analyses .................................................................................................................................. 112
Multivariate Model Specifications .............................................................................................................. 115
Summary .................................................................................................................................................. 119

CHAPTER 5. QUANTITATIVE RESULTS—BIVARIATE ................................................................................. 125
Sample Characteristics .............................................................................................................................. 126
Aboriginal Status and Disadvantage ........................................................................................................... 128
Low Income and Disadvantage .................................................................................................................. 129
Age ............................................................................................................................................................. 131
Household Composition ............................................................................................................................. 132
Work Status ................................................................................................................................................ 135
Important Sources of Support ..................................................................................................................... 137
Informal Supports ....................................................................................................................................... 139
Group Parenting Supports .......................................................................................................................... 141
Playgroups .................................................................................................................................................. 142
Parent Support Groups ............................................................................................................................... 155
Health, Well-being and Parenting .............................................................................................................. 161
Global Health .......................................................................................................................................... 162
Parenting Self-Efficacy ............................................................................................................................... 166
Coping ......................................................................................................................................................... 171
Conclusion .................................................................................................................................................. 174

CHAPTER 6. QUANTITATIVE RESULTS—MULTIVARIATE ........................................................................... 177
Explanatory Factors for Parenting Group Use ............................................................................................ 177
Aboriginal Status ....................................................................................................................................... 178
Socioeconomic Status ............................................................................................................................... 178
Demographic Variables .............................................................................................................................. 185
Informal Supports ..................................................................................................................................... 186
Parent Support Group Participation and Health and Well-being .............................................................. 188
Parent Group Use ................................................................................................................................... 195
Aboriginal Status ....................................................................................................................................... 196
Socioeconomic Status ............................................................................................................................... 198
Demographic Variables ............................................................................................................................. 198
Informal Supports ..................................................................................................................................... 199
Summary—Quantitative Results .................................................................................................................. 199

CHAPTER 7. QUALITATIVE RESULTS AND DISCUSSION—PATTERNS OF PARENT GROUP PARTICIPATION AND ACCESS ISSUES ........................................................................................................................ 203
Informal Supports ....................................................................................................................................... 204
Prevalence of Playgroup Versus Parent Support Group Participation ..................................................... 205
List of Figures

5.1. Weekly household income by Aboriginal status, LSAC mothers ..................129
5.2. Age range of LSAC mothers by Aboriginal status ....................................131
5.3. Age range of LSAC mothers by weekly income ........................................132
5.4. Relationship status of LSAC mothers by weekly income .........................134
5.5. Number of children in the household by weekly income ...........................135
5.6. Work status of LSAC mothers by Aboriginal status ....................................136
5.7. Work status by weekly income ..................................................................137
5.8. Family, friends and formal services as important sources of 4 types of support..138
5.9. Level of help received from family and friends ...........................................140
5.10. Attachment to family and friends ...............................................................141
5.11. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by age, Wave 1 .........................143
5.12. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by age, Wave 2 .........................144
5.13. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by work status, Wave 1 ...............145
5.14. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by work status, Wave 2 ...............146
5.15. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by relationship status, Wave 1 .......147
5.16. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by relationship status, Wave 2 ........148
5.17. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by number of children in the household,
    Wave 1 ..............................................................................................................149
5.18. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by number of children in the household,
    Wave 2 ..............................................................................................................150
5.19. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by Aboriginal status, Wave 1 ..........151
5.20. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by Aboriginal status, Wave 2 ..........152
5.21. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by weekly income, Wave 1 ............153
5.22. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by weekly income, Wave 2 ............153
5.23. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by level of help received from family and
    friends, Wave 1 ...............................................................................................154
5.24. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by attachment to family, Wave 1 ....155
5.25. Use of playgroups in the last 12 months by attachment to friends, Wave 1 ....155
5.26. Use of parent support groups in the last 12 months by work status, Wave 1 ...158
5.27. Use of parent support groups in the last 12 months by level of help received from
    family and friends, Wave 1 .............................................................................160
5.28. Use of parent support groups in the last 12 months by attachment to family, Wave 1
    ......................................................................................................................160
5.29. Use of parent support groups in the last 12 months by attachment to friends, Wave 1.............................................................................................................................. 161
5.30. Global health, LSAC mothers ................................................................................162
5.31. Global health by Aboriginal status ....................................................................... 164
5.32. Global health by weekly income .......................................................................... 165
5.33. Global health by playgroup participation ............................................................... 166
5.34. Global health by parent support group participation .............................................. 166
5.35. Parenting self-efficacy, LSAC mothers .................................................................. 167
5.36. Parenting self-efficacy by Aboriginal status .......................................................... 168
5.37. Parenting self-efficacy by weekly income ............................................................. 169
5.38. Parenting self-efficacy by playgroup participation .............................................. 170
5.39. Parenting self-efficacy by parent support group participation ............................... 170
5.40. Level of coping, LSAC mothers ............................................................................ 171
5.41. Level of coping by Aboriginal status .................................................................... 172
5.42. Level of coping by weekly income ........................................................................ 173
5.43. Level of coping by playgroup participation ........................................................... 173
5.44. Level of coping by parent support group participation ....................................... 174
H1. Family as important sources of support by Aboriginal status ................................. 319
H2. Friends as important sources of support by Aboriginal status ............................... 320
H3. Government, community and welfare organisations as important sources of support
    by Aboriginal status .................................................................................................. 321
H4. Family as important sources of support by weekly income .................................... 322
H5. Friends as important sources of support by weekly income .................................... 323
H6. Government, community and welfare organisations as important sources of support
    by weekly income ................................................................................................... 324
H7. Level of help received from family and friends by Aboriginal status ....................... 325
H8. Level of help received from family and friends by weekly income .......................... 326
H9. Attachment to family by Aboriginal status .............................................................. 327
H10. Attachment to friends by Aboriginal status ............................................................ 327
H11. Attachment to family by weekly income ................................................................ 328
H12. Attachment to friends by weekly income ............................................................... 328
I1. Frequency of contact with informal support networks ............................................ 329
List of Tables

4.1. Qualitative Participants..................................................................................................... 95
4.2. Description of Regression Variables .................................................................................. 121
5.1. Distribution of LSAC Wave 1 Data by Aboriginal Status............................................. 127
5.2. Distribution of LSAC Wave 1 Data by Weekly Income .................................................. 127
5.3. Distribution of LSAC Wave 2 Data by Aboriginal Status............................................. 127
5.4. Distribution of LSAC Wave 2 Data by Weekly Income .................................................. 128
5.5. Global Health Ratings, LSAC Wave 1 and 2, and ABS Females 2004-05 .................... 163
6.1. Probit Regression Models for Playgroup and Parent Support Group Use .................. 179
6.2. Ordered Probits for Global Health, Parenting Self-efficacy and Coping .................... 189
G1. LSAC Demographic Variables ....................................................................................... 301
G2. LSAC Service Use Variables ......................................................................................... 309
G3. LSAC Health and Well-being Variables ........................................................................ 315
G4. LSAC Informal Support Variables .................................................................................. 317
Summary

Motherhood involves significant lifestyle upheavals and ongoing challenges. Though motherhood can be isolating, social support is beneficial to the health and well-being of mothers. This holds for disadvantaged mothers, though they are likely to suffer both significant life stressors and a lack of social support. Whilst informal networks are often examined in the context of social support and parenting, this thesis examines two types of group-based formal parenting support service, namely playgroups and parent support groups. There is a dearth of Australian research on parenting groups, and up-to-date national participation figures are unavailable. Research examining parenting groups that target disadvantaged and Aboriginal families is scarce.

The broad aim of this thesis is to examine the ways in which parenting groups operate as supportive resources for mothers. Towards this aim, two key research questions are addressed: which mothers participate in parenting groups; and what are the outcomes of participation? The thesis employs a mixed method design, capitalising on the data condensing advantages of quantitative methods and the contextual specificity of qualitative methods. The quantitative component addresses the research questions on a national scale, using data from the Longitudinal Study of Australian Children to compile participation figures, as well as assess the outcomes of participation in terms of mothers’ health and well-being. Qualitative interviews with Aboriginal and disadvantaged mothers participating in facilitated parenting groups, give insight into the ways in which these mothers engage with parenting groups and the perceived benefits of participation.

Social capital, which is concerned with social networks and their benefits, is the theoretical framework for the thesis. Much of the relevant parenting literature refers to the concept of social support. However, social support was found to be insufficient as a conceptual lens for the purposes of this research. The work of three key theorists, Coleman, Putnam and Bourdieu are drawn on. It is argued that Bourdieu, who takes into account the influence of the social structure on access to social capital, is most relevant here. Bourdieu’s broader theory of social practice is also drawn on for its insights into the wider implications of the social structure on individuals’ location within it. Putnam’s concepts of bonding and bridging social capital, and their extension, linking social capital, are here integrated with Bourdieu towards a theoretical framework that is analytically useful, both in terms of understanding structural constraints on the distribution of social capital and the ways in which such constraints can be overcome.

The research found that playgroup use is much more prevalent than parent support group use, a finding that appears to be influenced by perceptions of playgroups as offering child-related advantages, rather than focusing solely on mothers. This pattern persists among disadvantaged and Aboriginal mothers, though they appear to begin participating in playgroups later than more affluent, non-Aboriginal mothers. A positive relationship was found between playgroup
participation and better health ratings, congruent with other research evidence of strong links between social participation and health.

The qualitative analyses found that both supported playgroups and parent support groups can offer Aboriginal and disadvantaged mothers benefits in the form of peer support, information and guidance. In addition to child-related benefits, playgroups promoted family social capital. The Aboriginal parent support group had far-reaching impacts on mothers in terms of empowerment. Expert facilitators were found to be key sources of support, offering crucial bridging and linking social capital that disadvantaged mothers’ informal networks are less able to provide. It is argued that the potential of parenting groups as quality support services for disadvantaged mothers may be maximised by combining the strengths of supported playgroups and parent support groups in a single model. The thesis concludes that, though parenting groups will not ameliorate the effects of socioeconomic disadvantage, nor surpass informal support networks in importance, they can be a valuable source of support that can make a difference on an individual basis.
Declaration

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgment any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

Wendy Shulver
October 2011
Acknowledgements

This paper uses unit record data from *Growing Up in Australia, the Longitudinal Study of Australian Children*. The study is conducted in partnership between the Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (FaHCSIA), the Australian Institute of Family Studies (AIFS) and the Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS). The findings and views reported in this paper are those of the author and should not be attributed to FaHCSIA, AIFS or the ABS.

The Aboriginal component of this thesis includes data from an evaluation project on which the maternal and child health team at the Aboriginal health centre involved collaborated. The contribution of these Aboriginal health workers to this research is acknowledged. Ownership of the cultural and intellectual property rights of the Aboriginal participants in this research is acknowledged.
Acknowledgements Continued

Completing this thesis has been one of the hardest undertakings of my life. For this reason it will also be one of my biggest achievements. However, it would not have been possible without the help and assistance of a great many people:

I am greatly indebted to the Aboriginal health centre staff, particularly the maternal and child health team, and the facilitators of the Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal parenting groups I participated in for the qualitative component of this thesis, for being friendly and welcoming ‘gatekeepers’, and for all of their help and assistance along the way. The work that they do truly does make a difference in the lives of the women and families they work with and I am pleased to present a piece of research that demonstrates and acknowledges this.

I am also sincerely grateful to the women participating in the parenting groups, for allowing me to join in their groups and for taking the time to talk to me about their lives. The time I spent as part of these groups, getting to know them and their families was one of the most enjoyable aspects of this research process, and I thank them for that experience.

I would also like to thank the Aboriginal health centre maternal and child health team, for acting as my Aboriginal reference group, and Kim O’Donnell for her feedback on the Aboriginal component of my thesis.

My supervisors, Associate Professor Maria Zadoroznyj and Associate Professor Eileen Willis have given me invaluable advice, encouragement, guidance and feedback over the last six years. I thank you for sticking with me throughout the ups and downs of this long, long process. I would also like to thank Dr Mary Holmes for keeping me on track as my fill-in supervisor for the several months that Maria was away, and Professor Sharyn Roach Anleu, who saw me through the post examination revisions.

To Dr Laurence Lester for gently, patiently and painstakingly guiding me along the very steep learning curve that is multivariate statistical techniques. Thanks to his assistance the quantitative component of my thesis is far superior to anything I could have imagined when I started this work.

This thesis is about social support, and I am fortunate to have a strong and generous support network. In particular, I thank my parents-in-law, Rob and Dot for the quality time you spend with our children, helping out in our business and all the myriad little (and big) things you do to help us. It is these things that have afforded me the time and energy to work on this thesis. Without your support, completing it would not just have been harder, but downright impossible. I owe this thesis to you.
To my wonderful partner, Michael, who encouraged and supported me every step of the way. Your belief that I could do this never wavered, even at those times when mine did. Finally, to my two proudest achievements, William and Benjamin, both born during my candidature. By showing me the joys, and challenges, but mostly the joys of motherhood you have not only enhanced my thesis, but more importantly, my life. So, to my three boys, I dedicate this thesis to you.