LESSONS FROM THE DEVELOPMENT OF A MATERNITY
MANAGED CLINICAL NETWORK IN A LOW
VOLUME RURAL CONTEXT

Ruth Alison Stewart
MBBS (University of Melbourne 1985), FACRRM, DRANZCOG
Greater Green Triangle University Department of Rural Health,
School of Medicine,
Faculty of Health Sciences,
Flinders University,
South Australia

Degree of Doctor of Philosophy
Candidature Thesis
Submitted December 2011
## Contents

List of Figures ........................................................................................................... xi
List of Tables ........................................................................................................... xii
Thesis Abstract ....................................................................................................... xiv
Author’s Declaration ............................................................................................. xvi
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................... xvii

**Chapter One** ........................................................................................................ 1
1.1 Aim of the Thesis ............................................................................................. 1
1.2 Outline of the Thesis ....................................................................................... 3
1.3 Timeline of the Thesis ..................................................................................... 6

**Chapter Two: Literature Review** ........................................................................ 8
2.1 Search Methodology on Clinical Networks .................................................... 8
2.2 Clinical Networks — An Organisational Answer? ........................................... 10
   2.2.1 Inequality of Health Care Outcomes ..................................................... 10
   2.2.2 Inequalities of Access .......................................................................... 11
   2.2.3 ‘Unwarranted Variation’ of Outcome .................................................. 11
   2.2.4 Suboptimal Health Care Delivery ...................................................... 11
   2.2.5 International Unwarranted Variation in Health Care ......................... 11
2.3 International Clinical Networks — USA ........................................................... 12
2.4 International Clinical Networks — UK ............................................................ 13
   2.4.1 Development of Managed Clinical Networks in Scotland and England .... 18
   2.4.2 Clinical Leaders and Clinical Innovation .......................................... 18
2.5 Managing Across Diverse Networks of Care: A Systematic Literature Review of Networks of Care ................................................................. 20
   2.5.1 Network Structures .......................................................................... 20
   2.5.2 Network Management ...................................................................... 21
   2.5.3 Network Governance ...................................................................... 22
2.6 Mandated vs Voluntary Networks: Delivering Health Care through MCNs: Lessons from the North ................................................................. 24
2.7 International Clinical Networks — Europe .......................................................... 26
2.8 Clinical Networks — Australia ........................................................................ 27
   2.8.1 Clinical Networks in South Australia ......................................................... 27
   2.8.2 Clinical Networks in New South Wales .................................................... 29
   2.8.3 Clinical Networks in Western Australia .................................................... 35
   2.8.4 Clinical Networks in Victoria .................................................................. 39
   2.8.5 Clinical Networks in Queensland ............................................................. 41
2.9 Summary of Literature Review of Clinical Networks ......................................... 44
2.10 Quality of Rural Obstetric Outcomes .............................................................. 45
   2.10.1 International .......................................................................................... 45
   2.10.2 Australia .............................................................................................. 48
   2.10.3 Victoria ................................................................................................. 50
   2.10.4 The ‘Urban Myth’ about the Quality of Rural Maternity Services .......... 51
   2.10.5 Volume vs Outcome .............................................................................. 53
   2.10.6 Clinical Effectiveness ............................................................................ 54
   2.10.7 The AGREE Tool: A Validated Tool for Appraisal of Clinical Guidelines 60
   2.10.8 Available Guidelines in Obstetrics ......................................................... 61
2.11 Summary and Conclusion .............................................................................. 63

Chapter Three: The Rural Context of this Thesis ................................................. 64
3.1 Geography of Corangamite Shire ................................................................. 64
3.2 Demography of Corangamite Shire ............................................................... 66
3.3 Hospitals and Maternity Services in Corangamite Shire ............................... 67
   3.3.1 Camperdown Maternity Service ............................................................. 69
   3.3.2 Terang Maternity Service ..................................................................... 69
   3.3.3 Timboon Maternity Service .................................................................. 69
   3.3.4 Referral Patterns and Referral Decision Making for Corangamite Maternity Services ........................................................... 70
   3.3.5 Maternity Care Pathway in Corangamite Shire ..................................... 74
   3.3.6 Rural Maternity Initiative ..................................................................... 75
3.4 Quality of Outcomes of Maternity Services in Corangamite Shire Compared with other Victorian Hospitals ................................. 76
Chapter Four: Thesis Methodology

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Validity in the Empiricist and Postmodernist Traditions

4.3 The Researcher’s Stance

4.4 A Narrative of the Development of this Research Project

4.5 Ethics

4.5.1 Australian Regulation for Ethical Health Research

4.5.2 NHMRC Principles of Ethical Research

4.5.3 The Ethics of Study Three

4.5.4 The Ethics of Studies One, Two and Four

4.6 Summary

Chapter Five: Study One — ‘Corangamite Maternity Services: What Was and What Could Be’

5.1 Introduction

5.1.1 Aim of Study One

5.1.2 Methodology of Study One

5.1.3 Participants in Study One

5.1.4 Instruments of Study One

5.1.5 Study One Procedure

5.1.6 Study One Analysis

5.2 Data Analysis of Study One

5.3 Theme One: Networking

5.3.1 Defining the Network

5.3.2 Inter-hospital Relationships within the Network

5.3.3 Sharing Workforce

5.3.4 Continuity of Service

5.3.5 Relationship with ‘the Boss’ — Government, Department of Human Services Victoria and CMCN

5.3.6 Model of Care

Consumer focus

 "Lessons From The Development Of A Maternity Managed Clinical Network In A Low Volume Rural Context" Ruth Stewart, Doctoral Thesis, Flinders University
6.2.1 Preparation for Cooperation between Maternity Services in Corangamite Shire

6.2.2 Development of Corangamite Managed Clinical Network

6.2.3 Activity of the CMCN Steering Committee

6.2.4 Quality Assurance Activities within CMCN

Terms of reference and goals of the quality guidelines and protocols committee.

Quality assurance activities.

Impact of CMCN clinical practice guidelines.

Implementation and distribution of clinical practice guidelines.

6.2.5 Educational Activities of CMCN

Education subcommittee terms of reference and goals.

Outcomes from the education subcommittee.

Educational needs analysis.

Funding educational events within CMCN.

Recommended core competencies.

Educational events.

Obstetric emergencies training program.

6.2.6 Workforce Development Activities within CMCN

Workforce: terms of reference and goals.

Workforce survey.

Midwifery workforce survey responses.

GP workforce survey February 2006.

Workforce shortage within CMCN.


Movement of clinicians.

Enhanced Midwifery Skills in Collaboration Model of Maternity Care.

Demonstration of the managed clinical network model.

6.2.7 Funding of the Corangamite Managed Clinical Network

6.2.8 Collapse of a Network
6.3 Study Two Discussion ................................................................. 193
   6.3.1 Education ............................................................................. 193
   6.3.2 Quality Assurance and Clinical Practice Guideline Activity ............................................................................. 194
   6.3.3 Discussion of Workforce Committee Activity .................... 197
   6.3.4 Development of CMCN Team Resilience and Fragility ...... 198
   6.3.5 Conclusion of Study Two ...................................................... 198

Chapter Seven: Clinical Audit in the Corangamite Managed Clinical Network ................................................................. 200

7.1 Introduction ............................................................................... 200
   7.1.1 Aim of Study Three .............................................................. 200
   7.1.2 Methodology of Study Three .............................................. 200
   7.1.3 Participants in Study Three ................................................ 201
   7.1.4 Study Three Procedure ....................................................... 201
   7.1.5 Implementation of Information Technology-based Information Tool ................................................................. 204
   7.1.6 Implementation of the Victorian Maternity Record ............ 204
   7.1.7 Analysis ............................................................................... 205

7.2 Results of Study Three ............................................................. 205
   7.2.1 Numbers of Births in Corangamite Shire Hospitals ............ 205
   7.2.2 Spontaneous Labour ............................................................ 206
   7.2.3 Inductions within CMCN ................................................... 207
   7.2.4 Caesarean Sections within CMCN ...................................... 207
   7.2.5 Epidural/Spinal Anaesthesia during Labour and Delivery in Camperdown, Terang and Timboon ......................... 208
   7.2.6 Forceps Deliveries within CMCN ...................................... 209
   7.2.7 Postpartum Haemorrhage ................................................... 209

7.3 Study Three Discussion ............................................................ 210
   7.3.1 Numbers of Births in Corangamite Shire hospitals ............ 210
   7.3.2 Spontaneous Labour ............................................................ 211
   7.3.3 Indications for Induction of Labour ................................... 211
   7.3.4 Increased Rate of Vaginal Birth after Caesarean Section .... 213
7.3.5 Anaesthesia .................................................................213
7.3.6 Forceps Deliveries .......................................................214
7.3.7 Postpartum Haemorrhage ............................................214
7.3.8 Concluding Comments ...............................................216

Chapter Eight: Study Four — ‘The Corangamite Managed
Clinical Network — What Happened?’ ..................................217

8.1 Introduction ................................................................217
8.1.1 Aim of Study Four ......................................................217
8.1.2 Methodology of Study Four ........................................217
8.1.3 Study Four Participants .............................................217
8.1.4 Study Four Instruments .............................................219
8.1.5 Study Four Procedure ..............................................220
8.1.6 Study Four Analysis ..................................................221

8.2 Results of Study Four ....................................................222
8.2.1 Theme One: Being a Network ....................................223
Participants’ perception of the network’s
achievements and impact ..................................................223
Problems experienced in the network ................................224

8.2.2 Theme Two: Maternity Service Delivery .......................226
Sharing workforce ..........................................................226
Model of care development ..............................................227
Network influence on ways of working ............................230
After hours work ...........................................................231

8.2.3 Theme Three: Internal Network Relationships ................231
Teamwork and conflict .....................................................231
Relationships across hospital boundaries .........................234
Role of the project coordinator .......................................235
Timboon withdrawal .......................................................235

8.2.4 Theme Four: Relationships External to the Network .......236
Relationship with Warrnambool obstetricians
and administration .......................................................236
Relationship with Department of Human Services
Victoria ...........................................................................238
Regional network ................................................................. 239

8.2.5 Theme Five: Education, Quality Assurance and
Risk Management Education ........................................... 239
Quality assurance and clinical audit ................................. 241
Clinical guidelines ............................................................ 244
Risk management ............................................................... 249

8.3 Study Four Limitations and Discussion .......................... 251
8.4 Study Four Conclusions .................................................. 254

Chapter Nine: Conclusion — Lessons Learnt from
the Development of Corangamite Managed Clinical Network .......... 257
9.1 Introduction ................................................................... 257
9.2 Comparison of the Findings of Corangamite Managed
Clinical Network with the Literature ................................. 258
9.3 How Management of CMCN Compares with the
Literature on Network Management ........................................ 258
  9.3.1 Network Structure ..................................................... 259
  9.3.2 Network Management ............................................... 261
  9.3.3 Network Governance ................................................ 265
  9.3.4 Power over Policy and Strategy in CMCN ..................... 266
9.4 Diffusion of Innovations and the Culture of Health Care
Organisations ................................................................. 268
  9.4.1 CMCN as a learning organisation ................................. 269
  9.4.2 Innovation and organisational receptivity ...................... 274
9.5 Areas for Further Study .................................................. 276
9.6 Conclusion .................................................................... 277

Appendices ..................................................................... 278
Appendix One: Managed Clinical Networks in the United Kingdom .......... 279
Appendix Two: Key Lessons for Network Management in Health
Care from Networks Briefing .............................................. 288
Appendix Three: Perinatal Data Collection For, Hard copy ..................... 290
Appendix Four: Submission for Funding of the Corangamite
Managed Clinical Network .................................................. 292
Appendix Five: Corangamite Managed Clinical Network Meeting
Etiquette........................................................................................................306
Appendix Six: Interview Questions for Study One........................................308
Appendix Seven: Corangamite Managed Clinical Network
Steering Committee........................................................................................310
Appendix Eight: Memorandum of Understanding — Corangamite
Managed Clinical Network..............................................................................314
Appendix Nine: Terms of Reference and Goals of the Quality,
Guidelines and Protocols Committee............................................................320
Appendix Ten: CMCN Clinical Practice Guidelines.........................................323
Appendix Eleven: Terms of Reference CMCN Education
Subcommittee..................................................................................................410
Appendix Twelve: Terms of Reference CMCN Workforce
Subcommittee..................................................................................................413
Appendix Thirteen: Results of the CMCN Midwifery Workforce
Survey, March 2006.......................................................................................416
Appendix fourteen: CMCN Maternity Audit Forums.......................................422
Appendix Fifteen: CMCN Clinical Audit Data................................................426
Reference list....................................................................................................432
List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Timeline for the development of Corangamite Managed Clinical Network and Studies One to Four
Figure 2.1: Clinical Effectiveness Cycle
Figure 2.2: Overview of the SIGN guideline development process
Figure 3.1: Map of the spatial relationship of Timboon, Terang and Camperdown
Figure 3.2: Age structure of Corangamite Shire and Victoria, 2006 (enumerated data)
Figure 3.3: Algorithm for management of preterm labour in Corangamite Shire
Figure 4.1 Roles of researchers involved in studies one to four
Figure 5.1: Representation of grounded theory analysis, from Punch
Figure 6.1: Committee structure of CMCN
Figure 6.2: GPs in Corangamite with obstetric, obstetric anaesthetic and caesarean skills, January 2006–January 2008
Figure 6.3: Distribution of GPs across CMCN, August 2008
Figure 6.4: Algorithm of progression of a woman with an uncomplicated pregnancy in the EMSiC model
Figure 6.5: Algorithm of the progress of a woman with a complicated pregnancy in the EMSiC model.
Figure 7.1: Clinical effectiveness cycle
Figure 9.1: Competing values model of culture types for organisation

In the Appendices:
Figure 7.2: Number of births per hospital 2000–2007
Figure 7.3: Reasons for induction of labour within CMCN during 2005 compared with state average as a percentage of total inductions
Figure 7.4: Reasons for induction of labour within CMCN, 2006
Figure 7.5: Reasons for induction of labour within CMCN, 2007
Figure 7.6: Rate of caesarean sections as a percentage of total births in Camperdown, Terang and Timboon 2000–2007
Figure 7.7: Emergency caesarean section according to hospital
Figure 7.8: Forceps deliveries in CMCN as a percentage of total births in Camperdown, Terang and Timboon 2000–2007
Figure 7.9: Postpartum haemorrhage in Camperdown, Timboon, and Terang 2000–2007
List of Tables

Table 3.1: Demography of the research locale
Table 3.2: Numbers of midwives and doctors in Corangamite Shire hospitals, October, 2004
Table 3.3: Total births and confinements in Corangamite Shire compared with other Victorian rural areas, urban Level II and Level III hospitals, 1996–2004
Table 3.4: Birth weights in Corangamite Shire compared with other Victorian rural, urban excluding Level III, and Level III hospitals, 1996–2004
Table 3.5: Types of birth in the Corangamite Shire compared with other rural, urban excluding Level III, and Level III hospitals, in Victoria, 1996–2004
Table 3.6: Apgar scores for births in Corangamite Shire, other rural, urban excluding Level III, and Level III hospitals in Victoria, 1996–2004
Table 5.1: Interviewees’ roles in CMCN and pseudonyms assigned to them
Table 6.1 Tasks completed by the Quality Guidelines and Protocols Committee
Table 6.2 Process for identification and adaptation of evidence based guidelines.
Table 6.3 Guidelines developed and approved within the CMCN
Table 6.4 Guidelines developed within the CMCN for which approval had not been completed
Table 6.5 CMCN process for updating clinical practice guidelines
Table 6.6 Key tasks of the CMCN education committee
Table 6.7: Summary of results from educational needs analysis survey within CMCN
Table 6.8 Core Competencies for clinicians in the CMCN
Table 6.9 CMCN educational events
Table 6.10 CMCN Educational experiences for midwives to learn acoucheur skills
Table 6.11 Midwives responses to the workforce survey
Table 6.12: Travel by doctors within CMCN
Table 6.13 Attributes of the Proposed Enhanced Midwifery Skills in Collaboration (EMSiC) for CMCN
Table 6.14 Where and when presentations were made about the CMCN
Table 8.1: Interviewees’ roles in CMCN and pseudonyms assigned to them

Table 9.1: Corangamite Managed Clinical Network and the key features identified by Mannion, Davies and Marshall of a learning organisation

Table 9.2: Characteristics of culture types in the competing values framework

In the Appendices:

Table 7.1: Numbers of births in CMCN per calendar year by hospital and in total

Table 7.2: Percentage of births occurring from spontaneous onset of labour within CMCN

Table 7.3: Percentages of deliveries that are caesarean sections in CMCN 2000–2005

Table 7.4: Parity of mothers birthing in CMCN in 2007 as a percentage of total births in each hospital

Table 7.5: Numbers of vaginal births after caesarean section in CMCN 2006–2007 in Camperdown, Timboon and Terang

Table 7.6: Epidural anaesthesia for multiparous births within CMCN from 2000 to 2005 as a percentage of total multipara births

Table 7.7: Epidural Anaesthesia for primiparous births in Camperdown, Terang and Timboon 2000–2005 as a percentage of total primiparous births

Table 7.8: Epidural Anaesthesia for all women within CMCN 2006 and 2007

Table 7.9: Percentage of total births in which a postpartum haemorrhage occurred in Camperdown, Terang and Timboon 2000-2007
Thesis Abstract

This thesis describes the rise and fall of a small rural maternity managed clinical network: the Corangamite Managed Clinical Network (CMCN). Although the context of the CMCN is a rural maternity service, the network themes are relevant to health care everywhere because of the lessons that can be drawn.

The managed clinical network model addresses three important contemporary rural health issues: the struggles of small health services to enact quality assurance, to provide continuing professional development and to attract clinicians. Over the past twenty years, there has been a sharp decline in the number of rural maternity services in Australia. Maternity service models that are sustainable in the current health service environment are required. The successes of Corangamite Managed Clinical Network (CMCN) show what can be achieved in a low volume, rural maternity service. The failures of the CMCN are a cautionary tale for those interested in network development.

The thesis comprises four studies that used quantitative and qualitative methods to examine the development of the CMCN. The researcher adopted a relativist ontology and subjectivist epistemology and used naturalistic research methodologies. She performed literature reviews to build an historical case; interviews and grounded theory to assess what the actors believed about the maternity services and network; participant observation and narrative inquiry to describe what happened and how, and finally a quantitative clinical audit to provide a different perspective of clinical and educational activity within the CMCN. In this way a comprehensive picture of the CMCN is painted. The depiction enables detailed analysis of the CMCN to occur.

This thesis measures the CMCN against four theoretical models that have been used to qualitatively evaluate health services: systems thinking, the learning organisation, the diffusion of innovation within organisations and criteria for receptivity to innovation within them, organisational culture and service performance. Using these models this thesis finds that the CMCN performed as a clinical microsystem in an unsupportive macrosystem. It was a learning organisation under command of a less reflective
organisation. It was receptive to innovation and its diffusion within a context that did not support innovation and finally, the CMCN displayed health service cultural characteristics that have been associated with high performing health services and the regional health service culture did not. It is noteworthy that these contradistinctions occurred in the rural context.

The CMCN achieved its aims to provide maternity services using a patient-centred model, to share expertise and resources between the hospitals, to deliver a quality assurance program, to facilitate local team-based multidisciplinary professional development and to develop a sustainable workforce model. The CMCN was internally strong with a good management structure and committed clinicians. Yet despite these strengths, it collapsed. The tragic flaw of the CMCN that spelt its end was that it did not fully engage with a culturally dissonant regional health service management.
Author's Declaration

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

Ruth Alison Stewart
Acknowledgements

I wish to acknowledge:

My husband, Dr Anthony Brown, for his steadfast personal, domestic and professional support as I struggled with the process of becoming a researcher who completed the task. He has allowed me to disappear from most of our shared activity for the past ten months. He has never abandoned hope that the pupa will emerge an imago.

Professor James Dunbar, my supervisor, who has inspired me to greater heights, focused my aim, and called me to attention when I have needed it.

Associate Professor Karen Stagnitti, my co-supervisor, for her support, her encouragement and for giving structure to my rambling.

Professor Roger Strasser, my co-supervisor, without whose encouragement this thesis would have been abandoned. His sage advice was a beacon in the dark night of this research project.

Dr John Menzies for the encouragement he offered me to change a sense of outrage into a research question and for his vision and drive to establish the Corangamite Managed Care Network.

Ms Jillian Donnelly, CMCN coordinator who was the boundary spanner and inspired so many of the clinicians within the CMCN, including myself.

The doctors, nurses, and health administrators of the Corangamite Shire who were the Corangamite Managed Clinical Network.

My son Hamish Brown, who worked as a research assistant, providing prompt and skilled transcription, coding and statistical services.
My daughter Grace Brown, who also provided prompt and skilled transcription and coding services and encouragement.

All my children, Hamish and Grace as mentioned but also Duncan and Lachlan, who have watched their mother disappear time and time again to work and still have the trust to love me and engage with me when I come back.

My editors Alison Caddick and Crissene Fawcett of Sans Serif Editing and Publishing, for their patience and control of fonts, spaces, cases, commas and syntax. Any polish in this thesis was given by them.

To my colleagues in the Deakin University IMMERSe program for giving me space to concentrate on this thesis during 2011.

Professor Jeffrey Robinson, University of Adelaide, Department of Obstetrics
Professor Ross Haslam, University of Adelaide, Department of Neonatology
Dr David Morris, University of Adelaide, Department of Obstetrics
Dr Brian Peat, University of Adelaide, Department of Obstetrics
Ms Christine Cornwell, Divisional Chief Nursing, Women’s and Children’s Hospital Adelaide
Ms Alison Rogers, Project officer, South Australian Health Start Perinatal Practice Guidelines project
Dr Mike Moynihan for passing on to me the fruits of his many years of work and campaigning for rural obstetrics.
Dr James King, chair of the Consultative Committee on Paediatric and Perinatal Mortality and Morbidity, Victoria.
Dr Karen Lane, School of History Heritage and Society, Deakin University, for advice on methodology.
The Staff of the Document Delivery Service of Flinders University Library, who diligently searched and worked for a student they had never met who kept asking for papers to be brought forth from obscurity.

*Lessons From The Development Of A Maternity Managed Clinical Network In A Low Volume Rural Context* Ruth Stewart, Doctoral Thesis, Flinders University