

# **Intercultural communication in Central Australian Indigenous health care: A critical ethnography**

## **Investigator**

**Kerry Anne Taylor**

RN, MPHIC, BN, Grad.Dip Ed. Studies (Hlth), Dip. Teach

Thesis submitted to the Faculty of Health Sciences, in fulfilment of the requirements for the  
Doctor of Philosophy

The Flinders University of South Australia

2010

# Table of contents

Acknowledgements.....	v
List of tables.....	vii
List of figures.....	vii
Publications.....	viii
Selected presentations.....	viii
Transcripts.....	ix
Field notes.....	ix
Abstract.....	x
Declaration.....	xii
Chapter 1.....	1
Intercultural communication in Central Australian health care: <i>They don't understand</i> .....	1
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Why focus on intercultural communications?.....	4
1.3 Responses to Indigenous Language Speakers in Australian health care settings.....	8
1.4 Why focus on intercultural communications with Indigenous language speakers?.....	11
1.5 Language and culture in health care.....	13
1.6 Re-orienting my thinking.....	17
1.7 Locating self in the research.....	19
1.8 Potential significance of the IHCC study.....	22
1.9 Rationale for study.....	24
1.10 Aim.....	25
1.11 Research questions.....	26
1.12 Scope of the Study.....	27
1.13 Overview of study.....	28
1.14 Summary.....	30
Chapter 2.....	31
The research setting and context: <i>Its different here</i> .....	31
2.1 Introduction.....	31
2.2 National health services.....	32
2.3 Central Australian health services.....	34
2.3.1 Workforce Issues.....	39
2.4 Geographical context.....	40
2.5 Historical context—Colonisation of Australia and Central Australia.....	41
2.6 Political context.....	45
2.7 Socio-cultural context.....	51
2.7.1 Indigenous cultural groups of Central Australia.....	52
2.7.2 Non-Indigenous cultural groups of Central Australia.....	56
2.7.3 Health cultures.....	57
2.8 Summary.....	59
Chapter 3.....	61
Closing the research gap: what's in the literature and what's missing?.....	61
3.1 Introduction.....	61
3.2 Communication and intercultural health care communications.....	62
3.3 Linguistic minorities in English dominant health services.....	64
3.4 Indigenous Language Speakers, languages, health and communication research in Australia.....	69
3.4.1 Indigenous Languages in Australia.....	71
3.5 Interpreters in intercultural communications.....	73
3.6 English first language speakers.....	77
3.6.1 Language, colonisation and power.....	80
3.6.2 Anthropological literature.....	82
3.7 Philosophical developments in nursing and health disciplines.....	87

3.7.1	Transcultural nursing.....	88
3.8	Education and training in intercultural communication.....	92
3.9	Indigenous voice .....	94
3.10	Summary .....	96
Chapter 4.....		98
Methodology: Challenging the status quo in Central Australian health care communications		98
4.1	Introduction .....	98
4.2	Why critical ethnography?.....	99
4.3	Paradigmatic context .....	100
4.3.1	Critical theory and critical social science .....	103
4.3.2	Ontology and Epistemology .....	104
4.3.3	Methodological approach .....	106
4.4	Insider/outsider—Emic and etic perspectives.....	108
4.5	Theoretical and philosophical congruence – the links between critical ethnography, post-colonialism and cultural safety .....	110
4.6	Philosophical underpinnings—a cultural safety approach.....	116
4.7	Summary .....	118
Chapter 5.....		119
Methods: The right tools for the job.....		119
5.1	Introduction .....	119
5.2	Ethical considerations.....	121
5.2.1	Ensuring anonymity and confidentiality .....	121
5.2.2	Vulnerability, power and control.....	122
5.2.3	Data Storage .....	124
5.2.4	Non-maleficence and Beneficence .....	124
5.2.5	Benefits versus risk .....	126
5.3	Setting .....	128
5.4	Participant selection .....	130
5.4.1	The Participants—development of my relationships .....	133
5.4.2	Participant details.....	135
5.5	Data collection .....	137
5.5.1	Field observations and reflective field notes .....	138
5.5.2	In-depth interviews with English speaking health professionals.....	138
5.5.3	Interviews with Indigenous Language speakers .....	139
5.5.4	Video recordings .....	140
5.5.5	Documents and artefacts analysed.....	141
5.6	Thematic analysis applied to the data .....	141
5.6.1	Why thematic analysis?.....	141
5.6.2	A process of thematic analysis .....	142
5.6.3	Development of themes .....	145
5.7	Rigour of the research processes .....	147
5.8	Summary.....	149
Chapter 6.....		151
Health professionals’ findings: <i>It’s like opening a can of worms... (Sally)</i> .....		151
6.1	Introduction .....	151
6.2	Overview of main results .....	152
6.3	The health professionals’ data.....	154
6.4	Theme: Fear, frustration and stress –the IHCC experience.....	157
6.4.1	A dangerous experience for all.....	158
6.4.2	Difficult and challenging .....	159
6.4.3	A lack of awareness - <i>you don’t realise...until you look back.</i> .....	160
6.4.4	Tensions .....	162
6.4.5	It can be fun!.....	163
6.4.6	Summary of findings related to the communication experience .....	165
6.5	Theme: acceptance and complicities – continued colonisation.....	165
6.5.1	Best left unexamined – becoming complicit .....	165
6.5.2	Its different here.....	166

6.6	Theme: Power and powerlessness .....	167
6.6.1	A lack of power .....	167
6.6.2	Lack of ‘informed’ consent.....	170
6.6.3	Summary of power issues .....	171
6.7	Theme: Individual and systemic barriers - cultural danger.....	171
6.7.1	Attitudes to Indigenous Language speakers .....	172
6.7.2	Labelling.....	175
6.7.3	Workforce issues —‘The short termers’ .....	176
6.7.4	Summary of individual and system barriers .....	177
6.8	Theme: Toward culturally safe communications .....	177
6.8.1	Preparation – ‘it finally twigged’ .....	178
6.8.2	Whose deficit is it? Decolonising through re-orienting thinking.....	180
6.8.3	Make the time! .....	181
6.8.4	Making use of available resources. ....	182
6.9	Summary .....	185
	Chapter 7.....	186
	Indigenous First language speakers: <i>my veins are aching and they don’t even tell us why...</i> (Ngangale) .....	186
7.1	Introduction .....	186
7.2	Overview of main results .....	187
7.3	Powerlessness and privilege— ‘ <i>the doctors don’t tell them ...</i> ’ (Jakamarra) .....	189
7.4	Fear and oppression – ‘ <i>I was really scared you know...</i> ’ .....	191
7.4.1	Signs and symbols.....	193
7.5	Closing the communication gap - ‘ <i>talk right way</i> ’ .....	195
7.5.1	Construction of ‘others’ .....	197
7.6	Cultural safety- individual and systemic facilitators .....	199
7.6.1	<i>We need... our language speaker to be with us</i> – responses to Interpreters in health care.....	199
7.6.2	Importance of own Language – <i>Keep that language strong...</i> .....	201
7.7	Beginning awareness – some linguistic features.....	202
7.7.1	Code Switching.....	203
7.7.2	Potential for Miscommunication .....	204
7.7.3	Silence.....	204
7.7.4	Gratuitous concurrence.....	205
7.7.5	Use of Pronouns, Tenses and Repetition.....	205
7.7.6	Eye contact .....	206
7.7.7	Non-verbal communications .....	206
7.7.8	Triangular communication.....	207
7.7.9	Aboriginal English .....	207
7.8	Summary .....	210
	Chapter 8.....	211
	Discussion: Culturally safe health care – does it exist, can it exist?.....	211
8.1	Introduction .....	211
8.2	Engaging in dialogue.....	213
8.2.1	Well <i>they</i> never tell you do they...they never let you know!.....	215
8.2.2	Information ‘Dumbed-Down’: superficial and minimised communications.....	217
8.2.3	‘Culturally appropriate’ resources .....	219
8.2.4	Secret English, Hard English .....	221
8.3	De-colonising practice: ‘...strengthening the whip that’s always been there ...’ .....	223
8.4	Critical Reflection: ‘ <i>It’s not good, is it?</i> ’ .....	232
8.5	Power, privilege and whiteness .....	235
8.6	Examining own culture and its impact on others: Cultural and linguistic awareness.....	236
8.7	Indigenous personnel in health care services .....	237
8.8	Summary .....	240
	Chapter 9.....	242
	Conclusions: Culturally Safe Intercultural Communication.....	242
9.1	Introduction .....	242

9.1.1	Review of aims and research questions .....	244
9.1.2	Overview of Study Conclusions.....	244
9.2	Study Limitations.....	246
9.3	What has been added to the body of Intercultural Communication knowledge?.....	248
9.3.1	Significance of this Intercultural Health Care Communication Study.....	250
9.4	Towards a model of culturally safe intercultural communication .....	251
9.4.1	What is needed?.....	251
9.4.2	Ways of addressing racism, discrimination and privilege .....	255
9.4.3	A model for culturally safe intercultural communications .....	256
9.4.4	The Model explained .....	257
9.5	Conclusion.....	259
10.0	Appendices .....	263
10.1	Abbreviations .....	264
10.2	Operational definitions .....	267
10.3	Glossary of Indigenous Languages' words and phrases.....	279
10.3.1	Central Australian Indigenous Language words and phrases to describe pain. .....	280
10.3.2	Eastern and Central Arrernte words for pain assessment (Dobson, 2001)....	280
10.4	Aboriginal English terms and phrases .....	281
10.5	Flinders University Social and Behavioural Research Ethics Committee Approval	282
10.6	Four Level Thematic Analysis –sample.....	283
10.7	Letter of Introduction English Speaking Participants (on Flinders University letterhead) .....	284
10.8	Letter of Introduction Indigenous Language participants (on Flinders University letterhead) .....	286
10.9	Consent -Plain English for translation to Indigenous Languages.....	288
10.10	Consent form for observation of professional activity .....	289
10.11	Interview Guide: Intercultural Communication in health care.....	290
10.12	'Culturally appropriate' pain tool used in Central Australia tertiary health service	291
	References .....	292

## Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge the unwavering support of a number of people who have been with me since beginning this research and without whom, I know it absolutely would never have come to fruition. Since beginning this study, there have been a number of personal and professional hurdles that kept appearing, as I'm sure many other PhD students have experienced, but I have to say the last few years have been exceptionally challenging.

Throughout, my primary supervisor, Dr Jane Neill, has stayed with me, even beyond her retirement! She has been a constant support, mentor, colleague and most importantly, friend. There are not enough words to say about what this extraordinary woman has done that is above and beyond the expectations of a supervisor. I have not made it easy and I can't thank her enough.

Dr Sheryl de Lacey, Professor Charlotte de Crespigny and Professor Judith Clare have all also had a supervisory role at different times throughout this candidature. Their advice, feedback and support is also acknowledged, and appreciated. Dr Colin Watson, thank you for your inspirational work in highlighting communication issues in health care and encouraging me with my interests.

Dr Melissa Lindeman is also acknowledged for her role as a colleague, 'critical friend' and more importantly an uncritical friend who has been instrumental in encouraging me and supporting me to keep going when I was overwhelmed and unbelieving that I would ever finish. Thank you 'Napangardi'.

To the health professionals and Indigenous Language participants in this study, I give my sincere thanks for your time and support and I hope that I have told this 'story' –tjukaruru (straight) and that your contributions will lead to a better dialogue between us all.

Finally, I want to thank my family (immediate and extended), most specifically Vick and Kit, for putting up with years of ‘absences’ while I chipped away at this thing! For all the cuppas, cooking, support and so much more, ...thank you!

## List of tables

Table 1. Policies affecting Central Australian Indigenous People since 1788.....	48
Table 2. Indigenous Language Groups, Languages and Dialects of Central Australia.....	54
Table 3. Participant details.....	136
Table 4. Phases of thematic analysis.....	145
Table 5. Summary comparison of linguistic features.....	209

## List of figures

Figure 1. Central Australian Health services area and the position of the research context within the Northern Territory and Australia.....	32
Figure 2. ASGC-RA Map of Australia.....	35
Figure 3. Map of Indigenous language groups.....	53
Figure 4. ‘The real Australians’ Nicholson in Centralian Advocate 2008.....	55
Figure 5. Overview of methodology and methods for the Intercultural Health Care Communication study.....	120
Figure 6. Health professionals’ data sources for the Intercultural Health Care Communication study in Central Australia.....	156
Figure 7. Summary of health professional themes.....	157
Figure 8. Summary of Indigenous Language Speakers’ Themes.....	189
Figure 9. Signage in Alice Springs Hospital .....	193
Figure 10. Model of culturally safe intercultural communication.....	259



## Publications

Taylor, K. & Guerin, P. (2010). *Health care and Indigenous Australians: Cultural safety in practice*. Melbourne: Palgrave Macmillan.

Edwards, T. & Taylor, K. (2008). Decolonising cultural awareness. *Australian Nursing Journal*, 15(10), 31-33.

## Selected presentations

Taylor, K. (2010). *Intercultural communications in Central Australian health care*, Poster presentation, International Conference on Communication in Health Care, European Association for Communication in Healthcare, (September 5<sup>th</sup>-8<sup>th</sup>) Verona, Italy.

Taylor, K. (2010). *Cultural safety*, Rheumatic heart disease workshop presentation, for Rheumatic Heart Disease Foundation, (April 22<sup>nd</sup>) Alice Springs, Australia.

Taylor, K. (2010). *Indigenous health—a cultural safety approach*. Medical Grand Rounds presentation, (April 9<sup>th</sup>) Alice Springs Hospital, Alice Springs, Australia.

Taylor, K. (2009). *It's amazing how you can get by with body language*. Intercultural communication in Central Australia, Council of Remote Area Nurses Australia (CRANA) Conference, Alice Springs, Australia.

Taylor, K. (2009). *Privileging English in Central Australian health care communications*. Seminar series, (February 25<sup>th</sup>) Centre for Remote Health, Alice Springs, Australia.

Taylor, K. (2009). *Informed consent for Indigenous patients*. [Invited panel member] The Northern Territory Peri-operative Nurses (NTPN) Conference, (May 8<sup>th</sup>) Alice Springs.

Taylor, K. (2006). *Practical strategies in enhancing health care communications*. Paper presented at the Chronic Diseases Network 10th Annual Conference, (May 9<sup>th</sup>) Darwin, NT.

## Transcripts

Throughout the thesis, participants' transcripts (quotes) appear in italics using pseudonyms. The quotes are indented. The pseudonym and date identify the excerpts from the participant interviews or observation. Quotes from Indigenous First Language participants appear in shaded text, whilst the quotes from English only speaking participants are simply italicised.

For example:

*Our people are dying ... because they don't understand what doctors and nurses are saying to them (Jakamarra, 2007)*

*Not a priority at all. Totally – no priority. Aboriginal Languages are not appreciated in the hospital ... (Sally, 2007)*

## Field notes

Field notes are identified by the abbreviation FN and are presented in italics and indented. My own comments in relation to the field notes immediately follow on in standard indented text. For example:

*He rolled his eyes and looked uncomfortable. (FN, 2006)*

This young nurse was a new graduate. He appeared disapproving of the medical officer's approach, but seemed powerless to say anything.

## **Abstract**

Communication is crucial to safe, effective health care. There is growing realisation however, that ineffective intercultural communication may be thwarting efforts to address the unacceptable state of Indigenous health in Australia today. English is Australia's language of government and mainstream populations. In Central Australia, Indigenous languages remain 'unexpectedly' in current use, albeit tenuously so. Consequently, the rights and needs of Indigenous language speakers have been overlooked at times, within Australian health care services. This thesis contends that systemic and individual lack of attention to intercultural communications and the wider social discourses that influence this inattention, impacts on health professionals' capacity to provide culturally safe, effective care.

The aim of this study therefore, was to explore and examine the experiences of intercultural healthcare communications in Central Australia. To allow cultural issues, discrimination, racial and systemic inequalities and power differentials to surface, a critical ethnography involving Indigenous First Language speakers and English First Language speaking health professionals was undertaken. Given the recent and arguably ongoing colonising experiences of Indigenous people within Central Australia, this study considered post-colonial theoretical frameworks incorporating operationally defined cultural safety philosophies.

Two broad cultural groups were involved. Indigenous language speakers who were also health service users and non-Indigenous English-speaking health professionals shared their experiences of intercultural communications within Central Australian health care settings. Data collection strategies involved in-depth interviews, non-participant observation of client-worker interactions, video recording of selected health care encounters, and a review of other mediated communications such as signage and targeted health resources. Data analysis involved synthesising and applying three approaches to thematic analysis.

Findings showed common themes that characterised intercultural communications as relevant to both participant groups. These common themes were about fear, power,

acceptance, barriers, and facilitators. Themes related to individual issues and broader systemic levels. Health care communications were described as frustrating, difficult, ineffective, and personally and financially costly. Both groups identified systemic, institutional and individual barriers to effective communication, while key components of cultural safety, namely dialogue and de-colonisation, were mostly absent. Providers and recipients of care were unable, or sometimes unwilling to recognise health consequences of ineffective intercultural communication. There was also a tacit acceptance of these barriers as somehow relating to the unique context of Central Australia. Most health care communications were culturally unsafe, which resulted in an inferior standard of care for Indigenous clients and a sense of powerlessness for participants. From a more positive perspective, both groups acknowledged their goodwill and genuine desire for more effective dialogue, Australia's rich Indigenous cultural and linguistic heritage, and a changing relationship between non-Indigenous English First Language health professionals and Indigenous people.

Interpreting the findings from a cultural safety perspective within a post-colonial framework highlighted on-going colonising practices, attitudes, beliefs and power structures. These influences affect health care communications in potentially harmful and/or counterproductive ways. A model of intercultural communication based on critical reflection and cultural safety principles was developed to facilitate an improved experience of intercultural communications, and health care for Indigenous language speakers and English-speaking health professionals.

## Declaration

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgment any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

*K. A. Taylor*

---

Kerry Taylor

---

Date: 1<sup>st</sup> October, 2010