



Flinders
UNIVERSITY
ADELAIDE • AUSTRALIA

Discipline of Public Health

School of Medicine

Faculty of Health Sciences

UNCOVERING THE COVERED

Pregnancy and Childbirth Experiences of Women Living in Remote Mountain Areas of Nepal

Sabitra Kaphle, MPH, M.Ed., BN

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

March 2012

Certificate of Originality

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

Signed-----

Abstract

The ongoing effort to reduce maternal and neonatal mortality in developing countries has not been able to achieve the expected level of success. Although there has been progress in increasing access to medical care during pregnancy and childbirth in many countries, the associated mortality in most developing countries remains high. The Western medical model has often failed to consider the socio-cultural dimensions of women living in diverse cultural settings. The maternal and neonatal mortality rate in Nepal is still a serious public health issue. Although the maternal mortality rate of the country is declining, the neonatal mortality rate is still significantly high. The maternal and neonatal health situation in the mountain areas of the country is even worse, where the majority of births take place at home without professional assistance.

This qualitative study draws on local voices in order to understand the factors which have an impact on women's experiences of pregnancy and childbirth in remote mountainous Nepal. This study uses social constructionism and critical feminism to gain an in-depth understanding of the pregnancy and childbirth experiences of women. Fieldwork was conducted in a remote mountain district of Nepal with in-depth interviews being undertaken with pregnant and postnatal women, family members, service providers and local stakeholders in the two remote mountain villages. Data were analysed using an inductive thematic approach of qualitative data analysis from which three key themes emerged: the tradition and culture of childbirth; women, their relationships and childbirth experiences and the complexity of the context of the women. It was revealed in the study that the childbirth experiences of women are a collective socio-cultural construct which happens in a complex socio-cultural setting. A complex interaction of socio-cultural factors was found to be influential in shaping women's pregnancy and childbirth experiences which impacted their safety. The contribution of both socio-cultural and medical paradigms is therefore argued for to enhance safety during the pregnancy and childbirth experiences of women living in the remote mountain villages of Nepal. This needs consideration at both policy and practice level.

Acknowledgements

This study would not have been possible without the assistance, support and involvement of many people. Firstly, those mothers who were expecting their babies and had just been through their birthing experiences were the key in this study - without them it has no meaning. They offered their love, care and trust while sharing their stories without asking anything in return. I am indebted to them and I hope that this thesis is faithful to their contributions.

I am equally indebted to my supervisors: Frank Tesoriero, Adjunct Associate Professor of Flinders University; Dr Lareen Newman, Senior Research Fellow of Southgate Institute of Health, Society and Equity of Flinders University; and Heather Hancock, Adjunct Associate Professor of the University of Adelaide. I am grateful for their ongoing encouragement, invaluable support, insightful comments and ongoing guidance throughout the journey. They did not only guide me through the process, they also provided love and care to keep me motivated to complete this thesis.

My special thanks goes to the District Health Office team of the Mugu district for their support to complete the fieldwork in the remote villages. I also wish to remember the support from the colleagues of United Mission to Nepal and International Nepal Fellowship and for their help during the fieldwork. I am also indebted to the families I lived with during the fieldwork who are always in my memory. They kindly offered space to live and food to eat during that time, sharing love and care alongside the hardship in their lives.

I wish to thank Associate Professor Pauline Guerin of Flinders University for her support in arranging baby blankets to take to the mountain villages. I am also indebted to the members of the Zonta Club of the Adelaide Hills who kindly offered some financial support to conduct the fieldwork among women living in the remote mountain areas of Nepal. Their willingness to support this work was invaluable for collecting the stories of women who are so different to those living in Adelaide. I am also grateful to the Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations of the Government of Australia for their two year scholarship to start this PhD in Australia.

I would like to take this opportunity to thank the Faculty of Health Science for waiving my tuition fee in the final year of this PhD. Without that support, I would not have been able to continue the research. I am also thankful to the staff of the Public Health Discipline and Southgate Institute of Health, Society and Equity in Flinders University who provided ongoing support during the candidature. I wish to express my thanks to my fellow doctoral students with whom I have shared both happiness and frustration in many stages of this journey. My special thanks goes to Louise Townend for valuable comments while finalising the thesis.

I am highly grateful to Fiona Johnston who agreed to play with the mess of my writing in the final editing of the thesis. It was not easy to deal with the writing of an international student and to make it meaningful to the Western reader. I wish to express my heartfelt thanks to Fiona for her willingness and support to make this thesis meaningful.

Finally, this thesis would not have been born without the understanding and support of my family. My family, particularly my daughter, Sampada and my husband, Rajan Kadel were with me every step of the way providing love, care, encouragement and support. I also would like to offer a very special blessing to my newborn daughter Reva who brought happiness in the final stage of this journey. Similarly, my parents, though they are living back in Nepal, have always been the means of inspiration to me during the candidature. I also would like to remember my other family members and friends in Nepal who are patiently waiting for news of the completion of this PhD.

Preface

I was the only child of my parents born in a hospital because of the problems while my mother was trying to give birth at home. Being the youngest child, I did not get the opportunity to observe my mother giving birth but I was able to hear the childbirth stories of my mother and grandmother. My grandmother, who is now 98 years old, was one source of historical knowledge about the tradition and culture of childbirth in Nepal. She had all her births in the Goth (animal shed), experiencing several losses of newborns. During the time of my mother, my grandmother was the source of knowledge and support during childbirth. Later on, I saw my mother taking the role of helping my two sisters-in-law during pregnancy and childbirth. There was a dark room without a window in the corner of our house, where my mother experienced the birth of her other three children. After 17 years, my sister-in-law came back from the capital city to give birth to her second baby in the same dark corner of the house. After the experience of hospital birth of her first baby, my sister-in-law decided to come to the village to experience traditional childbirth.

It was about 20 years ago when I saw my next door aunt having labor pains for about three days at home. I noticed that her mother-in-law called the traditional birth attendant on the third day to help her to give birth. My aunt ended up having a healthy and live baby in the evening of that day. Both my sisters-in-law and aunt spent their 21 polluted days staying in the dark room in the corner of their house in the village. At that time, observing the cultural practices in the village made me upset about being a girl, thinking about the future of my life. I thought that I would be going the same way during childbirth. Around the same time, my paternal aunt died because of not being able to give birth in a remote village. I heard from my grandmother that she went through 19 pregnancies but did not have any live children. My child mind was upset hearing this reality but I did not have any clue at that time why mothers and babies die during childbirth. Instead, I wished to not get married and to remain safe.

There was a dream in my family to make me a medical doctor, but I ended up being a nurse midwife. During the nursing training, I got the opportunity to learn about the medical causes of death of mothers and babies during childbirth. So I then thought it

was beyond my aunt's ability to access medical care from her village. But when I started my clinical work in the hospital, I saw most of the women coming to the hospital were from the urban areas. Then I started working in the rural villages where I saw women still giving birth at home in the traditional and cultural way. It made me think about the childbirth services and preferences of rural women and their socio-cultural circumstances of living. Several encounters with women experiencing childbirth problems and related pregnancy and newborn losses in rural villages did not give me peaceful thoughts and I started thinking about them all the time.

While I was giving birth to my first daughter, I was in a district hospital of my marital town. Though I was myself a qualified nurse, I did not find my birth a satisfactory experience. The hospital was overcrowded and I was asked to rest on the dirty floor of the hospital on a bare mattress after the birth. I did not find myself medically and emotionally safe in that environment. I requested the discharge nurse, but she did not let me go home. I spoke with the attending obstetrician and convinced him that I would feel better at home than staying in the hospital environment. Finally he gave me discharge but with the condition that I would be responsible for any problems arising after leaving hospital. I agreed with their terms and conditions and went home. I did not experience any valuing or respect of my feelings, knowledge, skills and ability while I was giving birth in the hospital.

It was a really big dream to achieve a PhD for a village girl like me in Nepal. Both my personal and professional experiences prompted me to initiate this PhD. My commitment to work for improving maternal and newborn health in rural and remote areas of Nepal contributed to the production of this thesis. While I was trying to finalise the thesis, I got a message from home that my grandmother had died. I felt empty. I became disillusioned about my writing. Nevertheless, I was awakened by her dearest dream that her granddaughter would find ways to make remote Nepali women's childbirth experiences more safe and satisfying

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents	Page
Certificate of Originality	ii
Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Preface.....	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	viii
LIST OF PLATES.....	xiii
LIST OF DIAGRAMS	xiv
LIST OF MAPS	xv
LIST OF TABLES	xvi
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Childbirth: A Public Health Issue	2
1.2 The Socio-cultural Perspective of Childbirth: Conceptual Basis in Public Health	3
1.2.1 Definition of the Concept of ‘Socio-cultural’	3
1.2.2 The Socio-cultural Concept in Public Health.....	4
1.3 Definition of Concepts - Safety, Choice, Risk and Trust.....	7
1.3.1 Concept of Safety	8
1.3.2 Concept of Choice.....	9
1.3.3 Concept of Risk.....	9
1.3.4 Concept of Trust.....	10
1.4 Introduction to Theoretical Concepts.....	11
1.4.1 Social Constructionism	11
1.4.2 Critical Feminism.....	12

1.5 A Missing Consideration: The Socio-cultural Context of Childbirth for Remote Mountain Women in Nepal	13
1.6 The Research Aim, Question and Specific Objectives	15
1.7 A Note on Language: Expressions and Use of Specific Terms	16
1.8 Outline of the Thesis	18
Conclusion.....	19
Chapter 2: The Socio-cultural View of Pregnancy and Childbirth.....	20
2.1 The Meaning of Pregnancy and Childbirth.....	20
2.2 Forms and Authority of Knowledge	22
2.3 Ownership of Experiences	25
2.4 Dimensions of Safety, Choice and Risk in Childbirth.....	27
2.4.1 The Socio-cultural Concept of Safety	27
2.4.2 The Concept of Choice - Agency/Structure Relationship.....	29
2.4.3 Sociological Critique of the Medical Concept of Risk	30
2.5 Dimensions of Power and Empowerment.....	32
2.6 Dimensions of Gender and Relationships.....	34
2.7 Structural Dimensions.....	35
2.8 Dimensions of Culture, Tradition, Religion and Spirituality.....	37
2.9 Understanding Childbirth Experiences of Remote Nepalese Women: Government Policy and Everyday Practice.....	38
2.10 Developing Shared Understanding and Collective Ownership – Theoretical and Conceptual Basis	42

Conclusion.....	45
Chapter 3: Methodology	46
3.1 Research Approach	46
3.2 Methodological Principles	48
3.2.1 Experiences are An Authentic Source of Knowledge.....	48
3.2.2 Pregnancy and Childbirth Experiences are Naturally Occurring Interactions	49
3.2.3 The Researcher’s Reflexivity in Research	50
3.3 Field Work	50
3.3.1 The Field Area.....	51
3.3.2 Study Villages	54
3.3.3 Maternal Health Initiatives and Resources in the District	56
3.3.4 Status of Women in Remote Mountain Villages.....	57
3.4 Recruitment of Research Participants	58
3.4.1 Recruitment Process.....	59
3.5 Ethical Considerations of the Study	60
3.6 Sources of Data	62
3.6.1 In-depth Interviews	62
3.6.2 Field Notes and Photography	64
3.6.3 Document Review	65
3.7 Information Processing and Analysis.....	65
3.8 Methodological Rigor	72

3.9 Limitations of the Study.....	74
Conclusion.....	74
Chapter 4: ‘God Inside’: The Tradition, Culture and Spirituality of Pregnancy and Childbirth	76
4.1 ‘Never Been Outside’: Empowering Self and Maintaining Safety	76
4.2 ‘Better than Polluting’: Negotiated Practice and Respect for Tradition	87
4.3 ‘Whatever Happens’: Accepting the Conditions of Childbirth.....	93
4.4 ‘Will survive or die’: Certainty and Uncertainty of Birth Outcomes.....	98
4.5 ‘Sickle or Blade’: A Dilemma of Ensuring Safety.....	105
4.6 Discussion	108
Conclusion.....	112
Chapter 5: Women’s Social Position, Relationships and Childbirth Experiences...	114
5.1 Social Roles and Positioning of Women.....	115
5.2 ‘Being Together or Apart’: The Crucial Influences of Family Relationships	124
5.2.1 Mother-in-law and Daughter-in-law: A Crucial Relationship	124
5.2.2 Mother-in-law’s Support during Childbirth: Respect for Knowledge, Experience and Embedded Trust	137
5.2.3 When Mothers-in-law Were Not Available – Other Childbirth Support	142
5.2.4 Husband and Wife Relationship: Understanding and Childbirth Support	148
5.2.5 Father-in-law: A Patriarchal Influence.....	154
5.3 ‘Outside Home’: The Stakeholders’ Influences	158

5.4 ‘Left Uninformed’: The Professional’s Control of Birth	164
5.6 Discussion	172
Conclusion.....	176
Chapter 6: The Complexity of the Context: Looking Through the Safety	178
6.1 Traditional Childbirth Practice and Place of Institutional Birth	179
6.2 Socio-economic Circumstances of Women – Challenging Safety.....	184
6.3 Whose Responsibility? - The Tendency to Blame.....	196
6.4 Discussion	208
Conclusion.....	213
Chapter 7: Discussion, Possible Implications and Conclusion	215
7.1 A Complex Array of Relationships and Influences – Socio-cultural Dimensions of Pregnancy and Childbirth	216
7.2 Possible Implications	219
7.3 Conclusion.....	223
References	225
Appendices	263

LIST OF PLATES

Plate	Page
Plate 1: Geographic Terrains of the Mugu district – Photo Credit: Author	52
Plate 2: First study village - Photo Credit: Author	54
Plate 3: Second study village - Photo Credit: Author	55
Plate 4: Goth - Photo Credit: Author	77
Plate 5: Outside corner of the house - Photo Credit: Author	88
Plate 6: Inside corner of house - Photo Credit: Author	89
Plate 7: A separate room to give birth and to spend postnatal days - Photo Credit: Author	90

LIST OF DIAGRAMS

Diagram	Page
Diagram 1: Initial Thematic Map.....	68
Diagram 2: Initial Thematic Exercise	69
Diagram 3: Revised Thematic Map	70

LIST OF MAPS

Map	Page
Map 1 - Nepal Country Map	51
Map 2: Mugu District Map, Source: District Development Committee, Mugu	53

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
Table 1: Initial Codes	68