AN ASSESSMENT OF PERFORMANCE AND SUSTAINABILITY OF MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS:

A Case Study of Village Credit Institutions in Gianyar, Bali, Indonesia

> by Lincolin Arsyad

Doctorandus in Economics, Gadjah Mada University, Yogyakarta, Indonesia Master of Science, the University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, USA

Thesis Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy Faculty of Social Sciences, Flinders University Adelaide, Australia 2005

ABSTRACT

Microfinance institutions have evolved as an economic development tool intended to benefit low-income people. The benefit, however, can only be achieved if the institutions have a good financial and outreach performance. This study has three objectives. The first objective is to assess the influences of informal and formal institutions and their interrelationships on the practical operational arrangement of Village Credit Institutions of Bali (*Lembaga Perkreditan Desa* or LPD). Second, to evaluate the financial performance and outreach indicators of the institutions and to assess the influence of informal and formal and formal institution on the sustainability of the institutions, which has received little attention from previous studies. Finally, to outline some elements of a strategic business plan for two selected village credit institutions (LPDs) in Gianyar district, LPD Mas and LPD Kerta.

By using a case study approach, this study finds that the informal institutions (such as social values, norms, and sanctions) have significant influences on the practical arrangements of the LPDs, including the organisation, recruitment procedure, delivery mechanism, and remuneration system. Along with the influence of informal institutions, the formal institutions have also had some direct influences on the practical operational arrangements of the LPDs that are reflected in the supervision and guidance system of LPDs, an obligation to apply prudential principles of banking, and the remuneration system. The findings also show that the local government regulations (formal institutions) concerning the LPDs have accommodated the informal institutions of the Balinese in the background of their establishment, status and ownership, and organisation of the LPDs.

Based on the performance indicators - portfolio quality, leverage, capital adequacy ratio (CAR), productivity, efficiency, profitability, self-sufficiency, and outreach – the LPDs in Gianyar district could be considered as success microfinance institutions. The success is influenced by some important factors. First, the use of local people in managing the LPDs and the application of character-based lending system in screening the clients. This has resulted in a high clients' sense of belonging and moral obligation to support the development of the LPD Second, the use of social (custom) sanctions in the contractual enforcement has forced the borrowers to comply with their credit contract in a timely fashion. Third, the use of local community personnel whose remuneration is based on performance and low transaction costs has resulted in the high efficiency of LPDs. Fourth, a growing economy and supporting government policy at all levels through provision of a legal basis for the LPDs and the Central Bank regulation (formal institutions) have also contributed to the success of the LPDs. Thus, based on the necessary conditions of sustainable microfinance institution proposed by some scholars(Yaron 1994; Christen 1998), it can be concluded that the Gianyar district LPDs have been sustainable, and by that implication they have positive net social benefits for their clients.

Any attempt, however, to replicate the achievements of the LPDs by imitating its mode of operations should be conducted with great caution. A mechanism that works well in one socioeconomic environment (in this instance, in Bali) will not necessarily work in another, where the social system including social norms and values are different. But, the experience of the LPDs is a valuable thing since it has highlighted some critical issues that should be considered when handling the complex issue providing financial services to rural people

CANDIDATE'S DECLARATION

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university, and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another except where due reference is made in the text

> Lincolin Arsyad / /2005

SUPERVISORS' DECLARATION

We believe that this thesis is properly presented, conforms to the specifications of thesis presentation in the University and is *prima facie* worthy of examination.

Assoc. Professor Susanne Schech

Joe Williams

/

/ /2005

/2005

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank Associate Professor Susanne Schech from Development Studies within the School of Geography, Population and Environmental Management, and Dr. Don Fuller and Joe Williams, MBA from the School of Business Economics at Flinders University who supervised this thesis. Dr. Schech's broader development perspective enriched my analysis and interpretation of the research material. Dr. Fuller and Mr. Williams guided this thesis with their knowledge of business economics, and gave me much encouragement and support to enable completion of the study.

This thesis would not have been possible without the financial support provided by the Quality for Undergraduate Education (QUE) Project funded by the World Bank. I would like to give my thanks to Mr. Faried Widjaja Mansoer and Mr. Ahmad Jamli, who managed the project. I am also grateful to all my colleagues at the Research Center for Economic and Public Policy Studies of Gadjah Mada University for their warm attention and support for my study, among others: M. Masykur Wiratmo, Wihana K. Jaya, Akhmad Makhfatih, Catur Sugiyanto, and Tri Widodo.

Many great thanks go to my senior colleagues at the Faculty of Economics at Gadjah Mada University for their encouragement, among others: Dr. Soetatwo Hadiwigeno, Professor Sukanto Reksohadiprodjo, Professor Nopirin, Professor Zaki Baridwan, Dr. Iswardono S. Permono, and Rimawan Pradiptyo who is now at York University, UK. I would particularly like to thank Professor Gunawan Sumodiningrat for introducing me to the world of microfinance ten years ago. Many thanks also go to my friends in Adelaide for their warm and sincere friendship, among others: John Soeprihanto, M. Mas'ud Said, I Gusti Ngurah Darmawan, Afrizal, Mirza Hasan, Edi Winarko, Andy Fefta Widjaja, Aldian Amira, Muhammad Wayong, and Siswanda Hadisumarto.

I wish to thank a number of individuals and organizations who greatly assisted the fieldwork of this study, in particular Wayan Dade Wiweka and Ida Bagus Mayun

Warsana of Bank BPD Bali, I Gusti Ketut Narya of the Bureau of Finance of the Bali Provincial Government, Faisal Issom of the Bank Indonesia (Bali Branch office), I Made Ardana of the LPD Mas, I Ketut Kurniawan of the LPD Kerta, and I Nyoman Cendikiawan of the LPD Talepud.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my family for their love and support throughout my study. Many great thanks go to my wife, Ine, who constantly supported and encouraged me throughout the entire process. I owe her the utmost debt of gratitude. My three lovely children, Vania, Senna, and Gibran also deserve to receive my great thanks. I sincerely hope that my success will inspire them. Lastly, I would like to thank my Mum and my parents in law in my country for blessing me throughout my life and study.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| ABS | IRACTi | |
|--------------------------|--|----|
| CAN | DIDATE'S DECLARATIONi | |
| SUP | ERVISORS' DECLARATIONii | |
| ACK | NOWLEDGEMENTSiii | |
| TAB | LE OF CONTENT v | |
| LIST | OF FIGURESix | |
| LIST | OF TABLES x | |
| ABB | REVIATIONSxii | |
| | PTER ONE Error! Bookmark not defined. ODUCTION Error! Bookmark not defined. | |
| 1.1 1.2 1.3 1.4 | THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY Error! Bookmark not defined. MICROFINANCE AND MSEs DEVELOPMENT IN INDONESIAError! Bookmark not de OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY AND RESEARCH QUESTIONSError! Bookmark not def ORGANISATION OF THE THESIS Error! Bookmark not defined. | |
| MIC | PTER TWO Error! Bookmark not defined. ROFINANCE, INSTITUTIONS, AND PERFORMANCE: A LITERATURE IEW Error! Bookmark not defined. | |
| 2.1 2.2 | INTRODUCTION | |
| 2.3 | THE ROLE OF MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS AS FINANCIAL INTERMEDIARIES | |
| 2.4 | INSTITUTIONS AND MICROFINANCE PERFORMANCEError! Bookmark not defined. Imperfect information in credit markets | |
| 2.5 | PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT OF MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONError! Bookma | rl |
| 0.0 | | |

2.6 SUMMARY..... Error! Bookmark not defined.

| CHAPTER THREE Error! Bookmark not defined. MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS IN INDONESIA: THEIR DEVELOPMENT, LANDSCAPE, AND REGULATION Error! Bookmark not defined. | | | |
|--|---|---|--|
| 3.1 3.2 3.3 | INTRODUCTION THE DEVELOPMENT OF MICROFINANCE INS INDONESIA The Colonial Period Independence Period (1) During the Soekarno administration (2) Soeharto administration until present THE LANDSCAPE OF MICROFINANCE INSTIT | TITUTIONS IN Error! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. | |
| 5.5 | INDONESIA | Error! Bookmark not defined. | |
| 3.43.5 | LEGISLATION, REGULATION, AND SUPERVIS MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS IN INDONES Regulation and supervision for the Bank BRI Unit I Regulation and supervision of People's Credit Bank Regulation and supervision of non-bank financial In Regulation and supervision of cooperatives and NG SUMMARY. | IAError! Bookmark not defined. DesaError! Bookmark not defined. (BPR)Error! Bookmark not defined. IstitutionsError! Bookmark not defined. OsError! Bookmark not defined. | |
| | APTER FOUR E SOCIO-ECONOMIC ENVIRONMENT OF BALI | | |
| 4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 4.5 | INTRODUCTION GEOGRAPHIC AND DEMOGRAPHIC CONDITI GOVERNMENT ADMINISTRATION SYSTEM SOCIO-CULTURAL CHARACTERISTICS ECONOMIC SITUATION Economic growth and sectoral changes Employment condition Tourism-based economy SUMMARY | ONSError! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. | |
| | APTER FIVE | | |
| RES | EARCH METHODOLOGY | Error! Bookmark not defined. | |
| 5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 | INTRODUCTION RESEARCH PARADIGMS AND TRIANGULATI A CASE STUDY STRATEGY RESEARCH DESIGN A field-base case study The selection of a case The collection of data Methods and tool of analysis | ONError! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. | |

| | (2) A SWOT Analysis Towards policy recommendations | |
|---|---|---|
| THE | APTER SIX ROLE OF INSTITUTIONS IN THE MANAGE DIT INSTITUTIONS OF BALL | EMENT OF VILLAGE |
| 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 6.5 | INTRODUCTION. THE DEVELOPMENT OF LEMBAGA PERKRED THE LEGISLATIONS OF LEMBAGA PERKREDI SUPERVISION AND GUIDANCE SYSTEM OF TH THE MANAGEMENT OF LPD Organisation and planning. Recruitment procedure. Principle of operational arrangement Delivery mechanism Remuneration system SUMMARY | ITAN DESAError! Bookmark not defined TAN DESAError! Bookmark not defined HE LPDError! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| PER OF | APTER SEVEN FORMANCE ANALYSIS VILLAGE CREDIT INSTITUTIONS WITHIN GI I PROVINCE | Error! Bookmark not defined. ANYAR DISTRICT IN |
| 7.1 7.2 7.3 7.4 7.5 7.6 7.7 7.8 7.9 | INTRODUCTION SOCIO-ECONOMIC INDICATORS OF GIANYAR THE GROWTH OF LPD OF GIANYAR DISTRICT PORTFOLIO QUALITY, LEVERAGE, AND CAPI PRODUCTIVITY AND EFFICIENCY PROFITABILITY AND FINANCIAL VIABILITY OUTREACH | R DISTRICTError! Bookmark not defined TError! Bookmark not defined. TAL ADEQUACYError! Bookmark not of Error! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. LOGISTIC ANALYSISError! Bookmark |
| CRE | PTER EIGHT ATING ELEMENTS OF A STRATEGIC BUSINES JBUD AND LPD KERTA OF PAYANGAN, GIANY | S PLAN FOR LPD MAS |
| 8.1 8.2 | INTRODUCTION SWOT ANALYSIS OF LPD MAS OF UBUD, GIA Summary of main strengths Summary of main weaknesses Summary of opportunities Summary of threats Main implications of the SWOT Analysis Recommended Mission Statement for LPD Mas of U | NYAR, BALIError! Bookmark not define Error! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. Error! Bookmark not defined. |

Recommended Objectives for LPD Mas of Ubud Error! Bookmark not defined. Recommended Strategies for LPD Mas of Ubud Error! Bookmark not defined.

| 91 | INTRODUCTION | Error! Bookmark not defined |
|------|--|------------------------------|
| | SUMMARY OF FINDINGS | |
| | The influence of informal institutions | Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| | The influence of formal institutions | Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| | The relationship between informal and formal institu | |
| 9.3 | IMPLICATIONS OF THE STUDY | Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| BIBL | JOGRAPHY | Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| APPI | ENDICES | Error! Bookmark not defined. |

LIST OF FIGURES

- Figure 2.1 Assessing the Performance of Microfinance Institutions**Error! Bookmark not defined.**
- Figure 4.1 Map of Indonesia..... Error! Bookmark not defined.
- Figure 4.2 Map of Bali Province and Its Administrative SubdivisionsError! Bookmark not defined
- Figure 6.1 LPD Organisation and Supervision...... Error! Bookmark not defined.
- Figure 9.1 Factors Affecting Performance and Sustainability of Village Credit Institutions (LPDs) of Bali...... Error! Bookmark not defined.

LIST OF TABLES

| Table 1.1 | Micro, Small, Medium, and Large Enterprises in Indonesia, 1999- |
|-----------|---|
| | 2003 Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 1.2 | Number of Establishments of Small-scale Manufacturing Industry in |
| | Bali Province by Source of Capital Ownership, 1996Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 2.1 | Microfinance Assessment Performance ApproachesError! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 2.2 | The Performance Indicators of Microfinance Institutions |
| | (Ledgerwood's Approach) Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 3.1 | Landscape of Microfinance Institutions in IndonesiaError! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 3.2 | Size of Microfinancial Services in Indonesia Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 3.3 | Supervisory Arrangements of Microfinance Institutions in IndonesiaError! Bookmark r |
| Table 3.4 | BRI Village Unit Loan Classification and Reserves Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 4.1 | Land Area, Population, and Population Density of Bali Province by |
| | City/Districts, 2001 Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 4.2 | City/Districts, Sub-districts, and Administrative Villages in Bali |
| | Province, 2001 Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 4.3 | Distribution of Gross Regional Domestic Product of Bali Province at |
| | Constant 1993 Price by City/district, 1996 and 1999Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 4.4 | Employment by Economic Sectors in Bali Province, 1997 and 2001Error! Bookmark n |
| Table 5.1 | Number of LPDs in Gianyar District by Sub-districts and Economic |
| | Characteristic, 2001 Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 5.2 | Independent Variables and Expected Signs of Logit Model for the |
| | Repayment Rate of the LPDs Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 5.3 | SWOT Scoring Interpretation Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 6.1 | Selected Indicators of LPD Development Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 6.2 | Distribution of LPDs in Bali by District, 1998 and 2000Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 7.1 | Socio-economic Indicators of Gianyar District of Bali Province, 1997 |
| | and 2001 Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 7.2 | General indicators of Village Credit Institutions (LPDs) within |
| | Gianyar District of Bali Province, 1999-2001 Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 7.3 | Portfolio quality, leverage, and CAR of LPDs within Gianyar District |
| | of Bali Province, 1999 and 2001 (means) Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 7.4 | Arithmetic Means and the Results of the Mann-Whitney Test for |
| | Portfolio Quality, Leverage, and CAR between Two Group of LPDs, |
| | 2001 Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 7.5 | Productivity and Efficiency of LPDs within Gianyar District of Bali |
| | Province, 1999 and 2001 (Means) Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 7.6 | Arithmetic Means and the Results of the Mann-Whitney Tests for |
| | Productivity and Efficiency between Two Groups of LPDs, 2001Error! Bookmark not |
| Table 7.7 | Profitability and Financial Viability of LPDs within Gianyar District |
| | of Bali Province, 1999 and 2001 (Means) Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 7.8 | Arithmetic Means and Results of the Mann-Whitney Tests for |
| | Profitability and Financial Viability between Two Groups of LPDs, |
| | 2001 Error! Bookmark not defined. |

| Table 7.9Outreach of LPDs within Gianyar District of Bali Province, 1999 and | |
|--|---|
| | 2001 Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 7.10 | A Comparison of Some Outreach Indicators between Two Groups of |
| | LPDs, 2001 Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 7.11 | Arithmetic Means and the Results of the Mann-Whitney Test for the |
| | Outreach between Two Groups of LPDs, 2001Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 7.12 | Logistic Regression Analysis of the Repayment RateError! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 8.1 | SWOT Analysis Table LPD Mas of Ubud, Gianyar, BaliError! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 8.2 | SWOT Analysis Table LPD Kerta of Payangan, Gianyar, BaliError! Bookmark not def |
| | |

ABBREVIATIONS

| AVB | Algemeene Volkscredietbank (General Popular Credit Bank), a |
|---------------|---|
| | precursor of BRI |
| Bank Pasar | market bank, a secondary bank |
| Bank Umum | general bank, the first of two bank categories recognized by the |
| | 1992 Banking Law |
| BI | Bank Indonesia (Central Bank of Indonesia) |
| BIMAS | Bimbingan Massal (Mass Guidance), the government's |
| | subsidized agricultural credit program operated through BRI, |
| | 1970-175. |
| BKD | Badan Kredit Desa (village credit board), village-owned credit |
| | organizations established in the late 19 th century during the |
| | Dutch colonial era; today they are supervised by BRI |
| BKK | Badan Kredit Kecamatan, sub-district credit board in Central |
| | Java and South Kalimantan |
| BPD | Bank Pembangunan Daerah (Regional Development Bank), |
| | classified as general bank under the 1992 Banking Law |
| BRI | Bank Rakyat Indonesia (People's Bank of Indonesia), a state- |
| | owned bank |
| BRI Unit Desa | The lowest-level permanent outlet of BRI which is located in at |
| | sub-district level and provide financial services to the villages of |
| | their sub-districts. |
| BPR | Bank Perkreditan Rakyat (People's Credit Bank) |
| BPUPKI | Badan Penyelidik Untuk Persiapan Kemerdekaan Indonesia |
| | (Investigation Committee for the Preparation of Indonesia's |
| | Independent) |
| CAMEL | Capital, Asset quality, Management, Earnings, Liquidity |
| CAR | Capital Adequacy Ratio |
| CGAP | Consultative Group to Assist the Poorest |

| GBPKMI | Gerakan Bersama Pengembangan Keuangan Mikro Indonesia |
|---------|--|
| | (United Movement for the Development of Indonesian |
| | Microfinance) |
| GDP | Gross Domestic Product |
| GRDP | Gross Regional Domestic Product |
| GNP | Gross National Product |
| GTZ | Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (German Agency |
| | for Technical Assistance) |
| IDT | Inpres Desa Tertinggal (Presidential Instruction on Backward |
| | Villages) |
| KLBIs | Kredit Likuiditas Bank Indonesia (Bank Indonesia liquidity |
| | credits) |
| KOSIPA | Koperasi Simpan Pinjam (Saving and Loan Cooperative) |
| KSM | Kelompok Swadaya Masyarakat (Self-help Group) |
| KUD | Koperasi Unit Desa (Village Unit Cooperative) |
| KUK | Kredit Usaha Kecil (small business credit program) |
| KUKESRA | Kredit Usaha untuk Kesejahteraan Rakyat, the credit component |
| | of Prosperous Family Program |
| KUPEDES | Kredit Umum Pedesaan, the loan product of BRI's unit desa |
| KURK | Kredit Untuk Rakyat Kecil, small enterprise credit institutions in |
| | East Java |
| KUT | Kredit Usaha Tani (Credit for Farm Enterprise Program), a |
| | government-subsidised agricultural credit that is channeled |
| | through BRI's branches, but not through BRI Unit Desa. |
| LDKP | Lembaga Dana dan Kredit Pedesaan, rural fund and credit |
| | institutions owned by provincial or local governments. |
| LPD | Lembaga Perkreditan Desa, village-owned credit institution/s |
| | supervised by the provincial government of Bali |
| LPN | Lumbung Pitih Nagari, Village's Credit Bank in West Sumatra |
| MFI | Microfinance Institutions |
| NBFI | Non-bank Financial Institution |

| NGO | Non-government Organization |
|------------|---|
| P4K | Pembinaan Peningkatan Pendapatan Petani-Nelayan Kecil |
| | (Income Generating Program for Small Farmers and Fishermen), |
| | a program sponsored by Indonesia's Ministry of Agriculture |
| PERBARINDO | Persatuan Bank BPR seluruh Indonesia (Association of |
| | Indonesian Rural Credit Banks) |
| PHBK | Pengembangan Hubungan Bank dengan KSM (Project Linking |
| | Banks with Self-help Groups) |
| PLPDK | Pembina Lembaga Perkreditan Desa Kabupaten/Kota |
| PLPDP | Pembina Lembaga Perkreditan Desa Propinsi |
| PT | Perusahaan Terbatas (limited company) |
| ROSCA | Rotating Saving and Credit Association (Kelompok Arisan) |
| SIMASKOT | Simpanan Perkotaan (urban savings), a savings product offered |
| | by BRI's Unit Desa |
| SIMPEDES | Simpanan Pedesaan (rural savings), a savings product offered by |
| | BRI's Unit Desa |
| SME | Small and Medium Enterprise |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Programme |
| USAID | United States Agency for International Development |
| WOCCU | World Council of Credit Unions |