A MATTER OF URGENCY! REMOTE ABORIGINAL WOMEN'S HEALTH:

Examining the transfer, adaptation and implementation of an established holistic Aboriginal Well Women's Health program from one remote community to another with similar needs and characteristics.

Candidate

Jillian Mary Graham Mitchell RN.RM. BN. M Ed.

Thesis submitted for

Doctor of Philosophy

December 2006

School of Nursing and Midwifery Faculty of Health Sciences Flinders University

Supervisors:

Professor Charlotte de Crespigny RN. PhD. FRCNA Flinders University South Australia

Dr Kathryn Weston PhD

Former consultant to Primary Health Care Research and Development (PHCRED) Department of General Practice

Flinders University South Australia

DECLARATION

Candidate's Declaration

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without any acknowledgement, any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief, does not contain any material previously published or written by another, except where due reference is made in the text.

Signed Jillian Mary Graham Mitchell

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION	i
Candidate's Declaration	i
Glossary of Terms	xviii
Reference.	xix
Abbreviations and Acronyms	XX
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	XX
PREFACE	xxi
CHAPTER 1: A MATTER OF URGENCY!	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 The Setting	3
1.3 Higher Mortality of Aboriginal people	4
1.4 The health crisis that provided the original catalyst for my research	6
Sexual assault on women and children	9
The health of Aboriginal women	10
Figure 1: Diabetes age-specific death rates 1999-2001 (Australian Institute of	•
Health and Welfare 2004a)	12
1.5 'Aboriginal Women's Business'	12
Incidence of cancer in Aboriginal women	13
Breast cancer	15
Cervical cancer	15
Cervical screening results	17
1.6 Maternal Health	18
Figure 3 Perinatal death rates for SA, NT, WA and Queensland	19
1.7 The research question and its genesis	20
1.8 Formulating the research question	21
1.9 Clarifying the research question	21
1.10 The research methodology	22
1.11 South of the Anangu Pitjantjatjara Lands (AP Lands)	24
The recipient community	25
1.12 The community who chose to be the partner in the research	26

Being invited in	26
Adaptation of the program and tools	27
1.13 The significance of this research	28
Filling the gap	29
1.14 Well Health	30
Community development as a pathway to improved health outcomes	33
Health promotion	34
1.15 How this program fits the National Aboriginal Health Strategy	35
South Australian framework	37
Potential barriers to holistic approaches in remote Aboriginal women's	health
	38
1.16 Summary	38
CHAPTER 2: HISTORICAL OVERVIEW - PAST TO PRESENT	41
2.1 Introduction	41
2.2 Reaffirming the research question	42
2.3 Empowerment	43
The Researcher:	44
External Healthcare providers:	44
The local health providers	45
The clientele	45
2.4 How European history has impacted on Aboriginal health	47
Aboriginal Culture	47
Traditional food sources	48
Tools	49
Families and Kinship	49
2.5 The Effects of Colonisation-'The European Invasion'	50
The Impact of Dispossession	50
Loss of Lands and Cultural Life	51
Mission stations	52
The Devastation of Disease and Depravation	53
2.6 Aboriginal Women	54

2.7 Slavery and kidnapping of Aboriginal children	54
2.8 Stolen Generations	55
2.9 Discrimination and no recognition of Human Rights	57
2.10 Incarceration of Aboriginal people and deaths in custody	58
2.11 Advocacy	60
From Anthropologist to Activist	60
2.12 Advocating for the Rights of Aboriginal Women	61
2.13 The Impact of the Assimilation policy	62
Assimilation to Integration	63
The right to vote	63
2.14 The Continuing Inequality of Health	64
The Great Australian Silence	64
2.15 Control and Disempowerment	66
Discrimination and Inequity of Resources	67
2.16 Remoteness and its impact on the determinants of Aboriginal health	68
Geographical classification of areas	68
Figure 2 Areas of remoteness showing discrete Aboriginal communities	69
The issues of distance	69
2.17 Nursing History Snapshot:-the establishment of remote healthcare	70
White nurses for white settlers in the bush	70
The Nightingale influence	70
The rural/remote communities' nursing needs	71
The Bush Nurses' role	
Isolation	72
The Border Nurse	73
Duties of a Border Nurse 1924	74
Transition to nursing home clinic services	74
Aboriginal healthcare	75
John Flynn's vision and transformation of bush health services	75
The Royal Flying Doctor Service	75
Remote area nurses	76

2.18 Current context of Aboriginal women's health in remote communities	77
Inability of RAN workforce and resources to meet needs	78
Control and dominance of non-Aboriginal nurses	79
Limited opportunities for Aboriginal Registered Nurses	79
2.19 Context for Remote Health Services in Far North West of SA	82
2.20 Women's Health	82
Women's Health Reform	83
Planning healthcare to benefit Aboriginal women and their families	84
Attention to the remote environment of Aboriginal women	85
Summary	87
CHAPTER 3: SUCCESSFUL WOMEN'S HEALTH RESEARCH AND	
RESEARCH TRANSFER	88
3.1 A Feminist approach	88
3.2 A holistic approach to women's health	90
3.3 Primary Health Care (PHC)	91
3.4 Determined Principles of Success	91
Key elements of an effective and sustainable program	92
3.5 Exemplars of Successful Aboriginal Women's Health Strategies	93
Poor Nutrition and Low Birth weight	94
Improved Nutrition	95
Program strategies	96
Program strengths	96
3.6 Maternal and Infant Health	97
Program strategies	97
Program strengths	98
3.7 Aboriginal women's screening programs	99
Cancer	99
Cervical cancer	100
Breast Cancer	101
Program strengths	101
3.8 Sexual Health	102

Program strategies	103
Program strengths	105
3.9 Young teenage women	107
A holistic approach to meet the needs of Aboriginal women	108
3.10 Aboriginal Well Women's Holistic Health Care in Central Australi	an Remote
Communities	109
Program strategies and strengths	109
3.11 Mental Health	110
Program strategies	113
Program strengths	113
Comorbidities	114
3.12 Family Violence and Sexual Assault	115
3.13 Trauma from sexual assault	116
Program strategies	117
Program strengths	117
SUMMARY	118
3.14 Research Transfer	118
Dissemination and effective implementation of research transfer	118
Implementation principles	120
Key Elements of program success	122
3.15 Concepts of transferability	123
3.16 Summary	125
CHAPTER 4: METHODOLOGY	126
4.1 Introduction	126
4.2 Overview of the study design	128
4.3 Ethical considerations	132
Researcher accountability	132
The community expectations	132
Cultural considerations	133
4.4 A Partnership Model for Ethical Indigenous Research	135
Ethics applications	136

4.5 Participation	136
Informed consent	136
4.6 Benefits to the community	137
4.7 Theoretical Framework	139
Using Theory to Develop a Useful Model	139
A synthesis of Naturalistic Inquiry and Critical Social Theory and the	use of
multiple methods	141
4.8 Naturalistic Inquiry	143
4.9 The Rationale for Naturalistic Inquiry	144
4.10 The context using Naturalistic Inquiry	145
4.11 Critical Theory applied to Aboriginal Women's Health	146
Powerlessness to empowerment	149
4.12 The Rationale for Critical Social Science	151
Human consciousness	154
Oppression	154
4.13 Other philosophers of Critical Social Theory	157
The Historical Passage of Critical Theory from the 1920s	158
War, oppression and human atrocity	158
Freedom and expression	160
4.14 Revival through Habermas	161
Linking Critical theory with this Aboriginal Well Women's Health Resea	rch163
4.15 The Rationale for (Triangulation) mixed methods	163
4.16 Bringing Naturalistic Inquiry, Critical Social Theory, PAR and Con	ımunity
Development together: application to practice	166
Exploring the context	168
4.17 The background to community empowerment models in Aboriginal v	research
	170
Anthropology	
Applied Anthropology	
4.18 Participatory Action Research (PAR)	
4.19 Participatory Action Research and Community Development	174

Community Empowerment and Development	177
4.20 The Emergent AWWH Model	179
Building on Policy and Research Findings	179
4.21 Evaluation using Critical Social Science	182
4.22 Process evaluation	184
Impact Evaluation	184
4.23 Summary	185
CHAPTER 5: METHODS	186
5.1 Introduction	186
My Role as the Researcher	186
5.2 Researcher access to the field	187
Community approval	187
Access to the Pitjantjatjara Lands	188
Access to effective health programs for Aboriginal women's health	189
Invitations into the community	190
Access into a South Australian remote community	191
5.3 Research integrity	193
Responsiveness	194
Leadership	195
Reciprocity	196
5.4 Validity (Trustworthiness)	198
Credibility	199
Transferability	200
Dependability	201
Confirmability	201
Reliability	202
Interrelater reliability	203
5.5 Research Design	204
5.6 Adaptation of Wolcott's Model to this research	204
5.7 Sampling	207
The samples	207

Participants experiencing the program	208
Healthcare providers implementing and adapting the program	209
SUMMARY	209
5.8 Data collection tools	209
AWWH checklist	210
Semi-structured interviews and questionnaire	210
The participating Aboriginal women's semi-structured interview question	onnaire
	210
Healthcare provider's semi-structured questionnaire	211
5.9 Data Collection	212
5.10 Examining (Archival research)	215
Non-participant strategies	215
5.11 Experiencing (Participant observation)	216
5.12 Enquiring (Interviewing)	218
Key Informants	218
Healthcare providers in Central Australia and participating women	218
Healthcare providers working in the AWWH team in SA	219
The Community Women participating in the SA AWWH program	220
Ethics in Action	221
Informed consent	221
Data Ownership and Management	222
5.13 Qualitative data analysis	222
Thematic Analysis	222
5.14 The data analysis process	223
5.15 Quantitative data analysis	226
5.16 Evaluation of the AWWH program	227
5.17 Aylward's Evaluation Model	228
5.18 The Program Evaluation Objectives	230
5.19 The Evaluation Strategies	230
Process evaluation	231
Impact Evaluation	232

5.20 Links with others	232
5.21 Program Management	233
5.22 Resource mobilisation	233
5.23 Organisational structures	234
5.24 Participation	236
Individual women	236
Healthcare providers	236
The community	237
5.25 Leadership	237
5.26 Problem assessment	238
5.27 The role of outside agents	239
5.28 Asking why	240
5.29 Summary	241
CHAPTER 6: RESULTS	242
6.1 Introduction	242
Phase 1	242
The progress of consultation	242
The Sample	243
6.2 Major Themes from Key Informant data	243
Drug and Alcohol and Inhalant substance use	243
Interfamily violence	243
Sexual health Screening	244
Well health screening strategies	244
Practical management and research implementation concern	es244
6.3 Document review	245
6.4 Field notes	245
Summary of findings in Phase 1	246
Phase 2 - The consultation process and interaction	246
The Sample	247
Aboriginal Women Community Leaders	248
6.5 Major themes	249

Core elements of successful programs	250
Difficulties encountered with health programs	251
Women's Sexual Health	252
Teenage Girls	253
Breast Screening	254
A holistic approach to women's health	254
Disability programs and rehabilitation	255
Nurse Practitioners	255
CA Well Women's health program (described in Chapter 2)	256
Central Australian Aboriginal women's views	256
The needs of Aboriginal women in the recipient SA remote comm	unity258
6.6 Document review	259
6.7 Field Notes	259
SA Recipient community	262
Summary of findings	262
Phase 3 The continuing consultation process, implementation an	d evaluation of
the program	263
6.7 The Transferred Program Evaluation	265
6.8 Establishing the Program	265
6.9 Results	266
Process Evaluation	266
The original CA program checklist components	267
The Requirements of the reciprocal community	268
6.10 Evaluating the AWWH Checklist as a useful screening tool	271
Health information	271
The Project Advisory Group	276
PAG meetings	277
PAG minutes	
The organisation of the first intensive screening program	278
6.11 Evaluation of the PAG	278
The role of the GP in the PAG	279

The role of the Social Health and Well Being Coordinator in the PAG	279
Combining skills and expertise with the government employed Women's H	lealth
Nurse	280
The role of the CEO of the Aboriginal health service in the PAG	281
The role of the clinic team in the program and the PAG	282
Visiting team members	282
The researcher	283
Participatory role of critique and continual improvement of the program.	283
6.12 The Delivery of the Program	284
Program 1 November 2004	284
6.13 Reporting the AWWH screening results	287
Screening Results Program 1 Nov 30 -Dec 3 2004	288
Table 1 Screening results program 1	289
Health Education sessions	290
6.14 Summary	292
Table 2 Screening results program 2	293
6.15 Health information sessions	294
Lifestyle sessions	295
SUMMARY	295
Screening results Program 3 June 13-16 2005	296
Table 3 Screening results program 3	296
Health Information	297
Lifestyle sessions	297
Screening results Program 4 September 5-9 2005	297
Table 4 Screening results program 4	298
SUMMARY	299
Screening Results Program 5 27-31 March 2006	300
Table 5 Screening results program 5	300
Health information	301
Lifestyle sessions	301
Table 6 Screening results program 6	301

Cervical screening	301
Table 7 Age groups of women attending the sixth AWWH program	302
Health Education sessions	302
Lifestyle sessions	302
SUMMARY	303
6.16 The Impact of the AWWH Program	304
Culturally acceptability	304
Reaching the target group of Aboriginal women not accessing mainstream	
services for well health screening.	304
Sexual Health Screening Results	305
Table 8 Pap smears for AWWH program Nov 2004 –July 2006	305
Figure 3 Comparison by graph of the cervical screening data across programs	306
Breast screening	307
Statistical evidence	308
Comparison of sexually transmitted diseases across programs	308
Table 9 Sexually transmitted infections	309
Comparison of renal screens across programs	309
Dental disease in the women in this community	311
Table 11 Dental disease	312
Figure 4 Reported dental disease	312
Access to dental services	313
Family violence and drug and alcohol issues	313
SUMMARY	314
6.17 Evaluation of Community empowerment	314
Table 12 Health Principles Domains Evaluation	315
6.18 Program management (domain)	316
PAR critique Program 1	316
PAG Critique Program 2	318
PAG Critique Program 3	319
6.19 Leadership (domain)	321
PAG Critique Program 4	322

6.20 Resource mobilisation (domain)	325
The need for Child Care throughout the program	327
6.21 Recommendations from the PAG	327
A Coordinator	327
Health Education	328
Encouraging women's participation in activities	328
Designated times for the younger women to attend	328
School Students	329
Sustainability and Effectiveness	329
6.22 Participation (domain)	329
Integrated Services and collaboration	330
6.23 Healthcare providers	331
6.24 Problem Assessment and Resolution (domain)	331
6.25 Resource Mobilisation (domain)	333
6.26 The Roles of Outside Agents (domain)	335
6.27 Organisational structures (domain)	335
Table 13 Healthcare providers suggestions for lifestyle and information sessions	.339
6.28 Participation (domain)	339
The views of participating community women	339
Program attendance	339
Table 14 Age groups of women responding to the best time to attend AWWH	
program	340
Program content	340
Table 15 Women's responses in age groups to if the AWWH program met their n	ieeds
	341
Helping to improve Aboriginal women's health	342
Table 16 How the AWWH program had helped the women who responded	342
Table 17 Aboriginal Women's comments on sessions and improvements they wo	uld
like included in the AWWH program	343
Health sessions	343
Activities	343

Health sessions	343
Activities	343
Health sessions	343
Activities	343
6.29 Strengths of the Program	345
Interest and support of community women	345
6.30 Limitations	346
Problem assessment (domain)	346
Links with others (domain)	348
Lack of structured health information sessions	348
Lack of a Coordinator	348
Lack of community programs in chronic disease managen	nent and mental health
	349
6.31 Concluding Remarks of Results	349
6.32 Key findings	351
For the Aboriginal community women	351
6.33Transfer and potential for sustainability	352
CHAPTER 7: DISCUSSION	353
7.1 Introduction	353
Primary Health Care	355
7.2 The Need for Comprehensive Primary Health Care to Ad	ddress Aboriginal
Health	357
Compounding issues that have delayed an effective compo	rehensive approach to
Primary Health	358
7.3 The Strengths and Limitations of the Transfer of an ef	fective AWWH
program	359
Strengths	359
Limitations	361
7.4 Dental Health	362
7.5 Renal disease	363
7.6 Identifying deficits in health	364

Comorbidity of disease	365
Governance	365
Leadership	366
The demise of communication and individual contribution and voice	es through
the PAG	367
7.7 Moving Aboriginal Women's Health Forward	368
7.8 Conclusion	371
CHAPTER 8: CONCLUSION	373
8.1. Introduction	373
8.2. The contribution of this research	373
A transfer model	373
Evaluating empowerment	373
Evaluating the program	374
Change of practice to Primary Health Care	374
8.3 How this research has filled a gap in the knowledge	375
8.4 Implications	376
8.5 The transferable model of an effective health program	377
8.6 Strengths of the study	378
Mixed Methods	378
8.7 Limitations of the Research	380
Generalisations	380
Community women's views	380
Quantitative data	381
The attendance of the researcher at all AWWH programs	381
8.8 Recommendations	382
8.9 Concluding statements	384
REFERENCES	385
DATA TOOLS	406
APPENDIX 1	406
Well Women's Health Checklist	406
Physical and Mental health and Social Wellbeing Assessment	406

Mental Health continued, family history, doctors comments and referrals	406
Sexual Health "Special Women's Business"	406
APPENDIX 2	410
First Semi Structured Questionnaire for Staff (2004-2005)	410
First Semi Structured Questionnaire for Staff (2004-2005)	
APPENDIX 3	
Evaluation of the Aboriginal Well Women's Health Program 2006	

Glossary of Terms

Aboriginal - A person of Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander descent:- this is often the preferred title by Aboriginal people for themselves.

Capacity building - 'an approach to the development of sustainable skills, organisable structures, resources and commitment to health improvement in health and other sectors'. *Better Choices Better Health p 199*

Cross Cultural - A term used to express an awareness of more than one culture also used as awareness that people of other cultures have different needs, values and experiences and lifestyles (Shine SA Cultural Training Package, 2000.

Community. is seen as a geographical concept a group of people living in a particular local area, or it can be known as having a psychological sense of membership, as aligned with social networks or associations.

Cultural respect - Refers to the recognition, protection and continued advancement of the inherent rights, cultures and traditions of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people and is achieved when cultural differences are respected. (AHMAC 2003)

Equity - 'Fairness, people's needs meet the distribution of opportunities for well being' (*Better Choices Better Health p 199*)

General Practitioner -' a medical practitioner who provides primary comprehensive and continuing care (where possible) to patients and their families within the community'.(Royal Australian College of General Practitioners cited in Better Choices Better Health p199)

Health Promotion - '... A process of enabling people to increase control of the determinants of health and thereby improve their health '(Better Choices Better Health p 199).

Health Status - 'a description and/or measurement of the health of an individual or population at a particular point in time against identifiable standards '*Better Choices Better Health p200*

Indicator -' A specific measure for assessing progress against goals,...that reflects, directly or indirectly, the performance of an intervention ... in maintaining or increasing the wellbeing of its target population '(Better Choices Better Health p 200)

Indigenous - A popular term used in Australia to describe Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people actually translated it means 'born to the land'. This could also

be applied to other non- Indigenous people and therefore many Aboriginal people are concerned about the correctness of this term.

Medicare - 'Australia's universal health insurance scheme introduced in 1984. Australia's public hospital system is funded jointly by the Commonwealth, state and territory governments and is administered by state or territory health departments. The Health Insurance Commission administers the Medicare program which includes enrolments and benefits' (*Better Choices Better Health p 200*).

Outcome - 'A measurable change in the health of an individual, a group of people or a population, which is attributable to an intervention or a series of interventions.' *Better* (*Choices Better Health p 200*)

Oppression - The systemic use of power or authority to treat others unjustly.

Quality of life - 'An individual's perception of their position in life in the context of the culture and value system where they live and in relation to their goals and expectations, standards and concerns.' Better Choices Better Health p 201

Social determinants of health - specific features of and pathways by which societal conditions affect health and that potentially can be altered by informed action. Better Choices Better Health $p\ 201$

Standardised mortality rate - 'the number of deaths in the population within a year expressed as a percentage of deaths that would be expected if the population concerned had experienced the same sex and age related specific mortality rates as those recorded for a population as a whole'. **Better Choices Better Health p 201**

Whitefellas - A term used by some Aboriginal people to describe non Aboriginal people

Reference.

Better Choices Better Health. Final Report of the South Australian Generational Health Review (Department of Human Services Generational Health Review Committee 2003, p274).

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ABS - Australian Bureau of Statistics

ACCHS – Aboriginal Community Controlled Health Service

AHAC - Aboriginal Health Advisory Committee

AHCSA - Aboriginal Health Council of South Australia

AHS – Aboriginal Health Strategy

AHW - Aboriginal Health worker

AMA - Australian Medical Association

AHMAC - Australian Health Minsters Advisory Council

ATSIC - Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission

AWWH Aboriginal Well Women's Health

CRCATH - Cooperative Research Centre for Aboriginal and Tropical Health

DHS - Department of Human Services

HIV - Human Immunodeficiency Virus

MBS - Medicare Benefits Scheme

MSHR - Menzies School of Health Research

NAHS - National Aboriginal Health Strategy

NATSIHC – National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Health Council

NHMRC – National Health and Medical Research Council

NPHP – National Public Health Partnership

NPY WC - Ngaanyatjarra Pitjantjatjara Yankunytjatjara Women's Council

SHINE SA - Sexual Health Information Networking and Education South Australia

SMR - Standardised Mortality Ratio

STIs – Sexually transmitted Infections

WHO - World Health Organisation

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to acknowledge the following organisations who have supported this research SARNET Bursary \$5000

Royal College of Nursing Bursary \$5000

Cooperative Centre of Research Aboriginal Health \$4000

I would like to acknowledge and thank my Supervisors for their continued support.

Professor Charlotte de Crespigny and Dr Kathryn Weston and initially Professor Judith Clare.

I also wish to thank all those wonderful people who walked beside me, as together we worked to make a difference and improve Aboriginal health in one remote community in South Australia.

PREFACE

Introducing my interest in remote Aboriginal health

My allure to Indigenous health began many years ago when I first completed my nursing registration and moved to Darwin for my husband's work commitments. The Northern Territory provided me with an opportunity to work with the Commonwealth Home Nursing Service. This community-established health service included school children, Fanny Bay gaol prisoners, people requiring home visits in Darwin as well as those further 'down the track'. There were a high proportion of Aboriginal clients and some of these lived 'out bush' at least 18 km from any amenity. It was often difficult to locate these clients as they moved to where food and water were available. During my stay I learnt much about the multiple health problems of this community. When I returned to Adelaide to undertake midwifery training, an essential requirement to complement my general nursing skills, my goal was to return to the Northern Territory as soon as possible. However, I was unable to return as intended.

Some years later, I filled a temporary remote nursing role, relieving the solitary Registered Nurse in Fregon, a remote community in the Pitjantjatjara Lands of Far North West South Australia (SA). This Aboriginal community had a population that varied from 180 to 400 people, depending on the time of year and ceremonies taking place. Over the Christmas period, my family, together with two office workers and two mechanics, were the only non-Aboriginal persons ("whitefellas") in the community, as all teaching and administration staff had headed south for holidays and family reunions. It was a welcoming community and my work involved a daily

routine of providing clinics, occasional midwifery services and using my trauma and suturing skills. I remember one man who sat patiently through the seventeen sutures I applied to his wound, which had occurred when his tomahawk tool used for carving wood, held by his feet, missed its target and sliced cleanly through his calf.

My worst experience was trying to suture my own son's arm in a stifling hot clinic, with what appeared to be dozens of large dark eyes peering through the window. All were interested in the noise forthcoming from my seven-year-old who had slipped climbing the iron fence surrounding the house. Nevertheless, I enjoyed the work and living in the community, but all too soon it was time to leave.

Idealistically, I made myself a promise that at some time in the future, I would again use my nursing skills to assist Aboriginal health and although it is now many years later, I believe this study has offered this opportunity.

To convey and clarify to the reader about my role in this research and its findings, I will use the first person from time to time. To maintain confidentiality, the name of the recipient remote community in South Australia has not been identified and it has been referred to as 'the recipient remote community'.