# LESSONS FROM THE DEVELOPMENT OF A MATERNITY MANAGED CLINICAL NETWORK IN A LOW VOLUME RURAL CONTEXT

Ruth Alison Stewart

MBBS (University of Melbourne 1985), FACRRM, DRANZCOG

Greater Green Triangle University Department of Rural Health,

School of Medicine,

Faculty of Health Sciences,

Flinders University,

South Australia

Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

**Candidature Thesis** 

Submitted December 2011

# **Contents**

List of Figures	xi
List of Tables	xii
Thesis Abstract	xiv
Author's Declaration	xvi
Acknowledgements	xvii
Chapter One	1
1.1 Aim of the Thesis.	1
1.2 Outline of the Thesis.	3
1.3 Timeline of the Thesis	6
Chapter Two: Literature Review	8
2.1 Search Methodology on Clinical Networks	8
2.2 Clinical Networks — An Organisational Answer?	10
2.2.1 Inequality of Health Care Outcomes.	10
2.2.2 Inequalities of Access.	11
2.2.3 'Unwarranted Variation' of Outcome	11
2.2.4 Suboptimal Health Care Delivery	11
2.2.5 International Unwarranted Variation in Health Care	11
2.3 International Clinical Networks — USA	12
2.4 International Clinical Networks — UK	13
2.4.1 Development of Managed Clinical Networks in	
Scotland and England.	18
2.4.2 Clinical Leaders and Clinical Innovation.	18
2.5 Managing Across Diverse Networks of Care: A Systematic	
Literature Review of Networks of Care	20
2.5.1 Network Structures	20
2.5.2 Network Management.	21
2.5.3 Network Governance	22
2.6 Mandated vs Voluntary Networks: Delivering Health	
Care through MCNs: Lessons from the North	24

2.7 International Clinical Networks — Europe	26
2.8 Clinical Networks — Australia	27
2.8.1 Clinical Networks in South Australia.	27
2.8.2 Clinical Networks in New South Wales	29
2.8.3 Clinical Networks in Western Australia.	35
2.8.4 Clinical Networks in Victoria.	39
2.8.5 Clinical Networks in Queensland.	41
2.9 Summary of Literature Review of Clinical Networks	44
2.10 Quality of Rural Obstetric Outcomes.	45
2.10.1 International	45
2.10.2 Australia.	48
2.10.3 Victoria	50
2.10.4 The 'Urban Myth' about the Quality of	
Rural Maternity Services	51
2.10.5 Volume vs Outcome	53
2.10.6 Clinical Effectiveness.	54
2.10.7 The AGREE Tool: A Validated Tool for	
Appraisal of Clinical Guidelines.	60
2.10.8 Available Guidelines in Obstetrics.	61
2.11 Summary and Conclusion.	63
Chapter Three: The Rural Context of this Thesis	64
3.1 Geography of Corangamite Shire.	
3.2 Demography of Corangamite Shire	
3.3 Hospitals and Maternity Services in Corangamite Shire	
3.3.1 Camperdown Maternity Service.	
3.3.2 Terang Maternity Service.	
3.3.3 Timboon Maternity Service	
3.3.4 Referral Patterns and Referral Decision Making	
for Corangamite Maternity Services.	70
3.3.5 Maternity Care Pathway in Corangamite Shire	
3.3.6 Rural Maternity Initiative	
3.4 Quality of Outcomes of Maternity Services in Corangamite	
Shire Compared with other Victorian Hospitals	76

3.4.1 Methodology	77
3.4.2 Implications of Corangamite Shire Perinatal Statistics	82
Chapter Four: Thesis Methodology	84
4.1 Introduction	94
4.2 Validity in the Empiricist and Postmodernist Traditions	86
4.3 The Researcher's Stance.	89
4.4 A Narrative of the Development of this Research Project.	90
4.5 Ethics	93
4.5.1 Australian Regulation for Ethical Health Research	93
4.5.2 NHMRC Principles of Ethical Research.	94
4.5.3 The Ethics of Study Three.	95
4.5.4 The Ethics of Studies One, Two and Four.	95
4.6 Summary	97
Chapter Five: Study One — 'Corangamite Maternity Services:	
What Was and What Could Be'	98
5.1 Introduction	98
5.1.1 Aim of Study One.	98
5.1.2 Methodology of Study One.	98
5.1.3 Participants in Study One.	98
5.1.4 Instruments of Study One.	100
5.1.5 Study One Procedure.	101
5.1.6 Study One Analysis.	102
5.2 Data Analysis of Study One	104
5.3 Theme One: Networking.	106
5.3.1 Defining the Network	118
5.3.2 Inter-hospital Relationships within the Network	108
5.3.3 Sharing Workforce.	109
5.3.4 Continuity of Service.	110
5.3.5 Relationship with 'the Boss' — Government,	
Department of Human Services Victoria and CMCN	111
5.3.6 Model of Care	113
Consumer focus	114

Longitudinal care of childbearing women	116
Local versus regional care	117
Visions for future models of care	119
5.4 Theme Two: Workforce	121
5.4.1 Workforce Shortage.	121
5.4.2 Workforce Ageing and Lack of Succession.	124
5.4.3 Scope of Practice and Skills.	127
5.5 Theme Three: Relationships	130
5.5.1 Teamwork	130
5.5.2 Pressure to Centralise	132
5.5.3 Clinical Leadership.	132
5.5.4 Relationship of CMCN with the Regional Hospital	135
5.5.5 Service Adapted to the Community	137
5.5.6 Relationship of CMCN with the Community	138
5.6 Theme Four: Other	139
5.6.1 Funding.	139
5.6.2 Safety, Risk and Quality Assurance.	141
5.6.3 Education.	146
5.6.4 Change Management.	148
5.7 Results and Discussion of Study One	150
Chapter Six: Study Two — Development and Collapse of	
Corangamite Managed Clinical Network	152
6.1 Introduction	152
6.1.1 Aim of Study Two.	152
6.1.2 Methodology of Study Two.	152
6.1.3 Participants in Study Two.	154
Steering committee	154
Quality guidelines and protocols subcommittee	155
Workforce subcommittee	156
Education subcommittee	156
6.1.4 Instruments and Procedure for Study Two.	156
6.1.5 Study Two Analysis.	157
6.2 Results for Study Two.	157

6.2.1 Preparation for Cooperation between Maternity	
Services in Corangamite Shire	7
6.2.2 Development of Corangamite Managed	
Clinical Network. 159	)
6.2.3 Activity of the CMCN Steering Committee	1
6.2.4 Quality Assurance Activities within CMCN	
Terms of reference and goals of the quality guidelines	
and protocols committee	4
Quality assurance activities	5
Impact of CMCN clinical practice guidelines	3
Implementation and distribution of clinical	
practice guidelines	)
6.2.5 Educational Activities of CMCN. 170	)
Education subcommittee terms of reference and goals170	)
Outcomes from the education subcommittee	0
Educational needs analysis	)
Funding educational events within CMCN	2
Recommended core competencies	2
Educational events	3
Obstetric emergencies training program	6
6.2.6 Workforce Development Activities within CMCN. 178	3
Workforce: terms of reference and goals	8
Workforce survey	8
Midwifery workforce survey responses	8
GP workforce survey February 2006	9
Workforce shortage within CMCN	0
On-call arrangements in Corangamite Shire	
2006–2008	2
Movement of clinicians	4
Enhanced Midwifery Skills in Collaboration Model	
of Maternity Care185	5
Demonstration of the managed clinical network model	9
6.2.7 Funding of the Corangamite Managed Clinical Network	1
6.2.8 Collapse of a Network	1

6.3 Study Two Discussion.	193
6.3.1 Education.	193
6.3.2 Quality Assurance and Clinical Practice Guideline	
Activity	194
6.3.3 Discussion of Workforce Committee Activity	197
6.3.4 Development of CMCN Team Resilience and Fragility	198
6.3.5 Conclusion of Study Two.	198
Chapter Seven: Clinical Audit in the Corangamite Managed	
Clinical Network	200
7.1 Introduction	200
7.1.1 Aim of Study Three.	200
7.1.2 Methodology of Study Three	200
7.1.3 Participants in Study Three.	201
7.1.4 Study Three Procedure.	201
7.1.5 Implementation of Information Technology-based	
Information Tool.	204
7.1.6 Implementation of the Victorian Maternity Record	204
7.1.7 Analysis	205
7.2 Results of Study Three.	205
7.2.1 Numbers of Births in Corangamite Shire Hospitals	205
7.2.2 Spontaneous Labour.	206
7.2.3 Inductions within CMCN.	207
7.2.4 Caesarean Sections within CMCN.	207
7.2.5 Epidural/Spinal Anaesthesia during Labour and	
Delivery in Camperdown, Terang and Timboon.	208
7.2.6 Forceps Deliveries within CMCN.	209
7.2.7 Postpartum Haemorrhage	209
7.3 Study Three Discussion.	210
7.3 1 Numbers of Births in Corangamite Shire hospitals	210
7.3.2 Spontaneous Labour.	211
7.3.3 Indications for Induction of Labour.	211
7 3 4 Increased Rate of Vaginal Birth after Caesarean Section	213

	7.3.5 Anaesthesia.	213
	7.3.6 Forceps Deliveries.	214
	7.3.7 Postpartum Haemorrhage.	214
	7.3.8 Concluding Comments.	216
Chap	ter Eight: Study Four — 'The Corangamite Managed	
Clinic	cal Network — What Happened?'	217
8.1 In	troduction	217
	8.1.1 Aim of Study Four	217
	8.1.2 Methodology of Study Four.	217
	8.1.3 Study Four Participants.	217
	8.1.4 Study Four Instruments.	219
	8.1.5 Study Four Procedure	220
	8.1.6 Study Four Analysis	221
8.2 Re	esults of Study Four	222
	8.2.1 Theme One: Being a Network.	223
	Participants' perception of the network's	
	achievements and impact	223
	Problems experienced in the network	224
	8.2.2 Theme Two: Maternity Service Delivery	226
	Sharing workforce	226
	Model of care development	227
	Network influence on ways of working	230
	After hours work	231
	8.2.3 Theme Three: Internal Network Relationships	231
	Teamwork and conflict	231
	Relationships across hospital boundaries	234
	Role of the project coordinator	235
	Timboon withdrawal	235
	8.2.4 Theme Four: Relationships External to the Network	236
	Relationship with Warrnambool obstetricians	
	and administration	236
	Relationship with Department of Human Services	
	Victoria	238

Regional network	239
8.2.5 Theme Five: Education, Quality Assurance and	
Risk Management Education.	239
Quality assurance and clinical audit	241
Clinical guidelines	244
Risk management	249
8.3 Study Four Limitations and Discussion	251
8.4 Study Four Conclusions	254
Chapter Nine: Conclusion — Lessons Learnt from	
the Development of Corangamite Managed Clinical Network	257
9.1 Introduction.	257
9.2 Comparison of the Findings of Corangamite Managed	
Clinical Network with the Literature	258
9.3 How Management of CMCN Compares with the	
Literature on Network Management.	258
9.3.1 Network Structure.	259
9.3.2 Network Management.	261
9.3.3 Network Governance.	265
9.3.4 Power over Policy and Strategy in CMCN	266
9.4 Diffusion of Innovations and the Culture of Health Care	
Organisations	268
9.4.1 CMCN as a learning organisation.	269
9.4.2 Innovation and organisational receptivity	274
9.5 Areas for Further Study	276
9.6 Conclusion.	277
Appendices	278
Appendix One: Managed Clinical Networks in the United Kingdom	279
Appendix Two: Key Lessons for Network Management in Health	
Care from Networks <i>Briefing</i>	288
Appendix Three: Perinatal Data Collection For, Hardcopy	290
Appendix Four: Submission for Funding of the Corangamite	
Managed Clinical Network.	292

Appendix Five: Corangamite Managed Clinical Network Meeting	
Etiquette	306
Appendix Six: Interview Questions for Study One	308
Appendix Seven: Corangamite Managed Clinical Network	
Steering Committee	310
Appendix Eight: Memorandum of Understanding — Corangamite	
Managed Clinical Network	314
Appendix Nine: Terms of Reference and Goals of the Quality,	
Guidelines and Protocols Committee.	320
Appendix Ten: CMCN Clinical Practice Guidelines	323
Appendix Eleven: Terms of Reference CMCN Education	
Subcommittee	410
Appendix Twelve: Terms of Reference CMCN Workforce	
Subcommittee	413
Appendix Thirteen: Results of the CMCN Midwifery Workforce	
Survey, March 2006.	416
Appendix fourteen: CMCN Maternity Audit Forums	422
Appendix Fifteen: CMCN Clinical Audit Data	426
Reference list	432

# **List of Figures**

- **Figure 1.1:** Timeline for the development of Corangamite Managed Clinical Network and Studies One to Four
- Figure 2.1: Clinical Effectiveness Cycle
- Figure 2.2: Overview of the SIGN guideline development process
- Figure 3.1: Map of the spatial relationship of Timboon, Terang and Camperdown
- **Figure 3.2:** Age structure of Corangamite Shire and Victoria, 2006 (enumerated data)
- Figure 3.3: Algorithm for management of preterm labour in Corangamite Shire
- Figure 4.1 Roles of researchers involved in studies one to four
- **Figure 5.1:** Representation of grounded theory analysis, from Punch
- Figure 6.1: Committee structure of CMCN
- **Figure 6.2:** GPs in Corangamite with obstetric, obstetric anaesthetic and caesarean skills, January 2006–January 2008
- Figure 6.3: Distribution of GPs across CMCN, August 2008
- **Figure 6.4:** Algorithm of progression of a woman with an uncomplicated pregnancy in the EMSiC model
- **Figure 6.5:** Algorithm of the progress of a woman with a complicated pregnancy in the EMSiC model.
- Figure 7.1: Clinical effectiveness cycle
- **Figure 9.1:** Competing values model of culture types for organisation

## In the Appendices:

- **Figure 7.2:** Number of births per hospital 2000–2007
- **Figure 7.3:** Reasons for induction of labour within CMCN during 2005 compared with state average as a percentage of total inductions
- Figure 7.4: Reasons for induction of labour within CMCN, 2006
- Figure 7.5: Reasons for induction of labour within CMCN, 2007
- Figure 7.6: Rate of caesarean sections as a percentage of total births in Camperdown,
- Terang and Timboon 2000–2007
- Figure 7.7: Emergency caesarean section according to hospital
- **Figure 7.8:** Forceps deliveries in CMCN as a percentage of total births in Camperdown,
- Terang and Timboon 2000–2007
- **Figure 7.9:** Postpartum haemorrhage in Camperdown, Timboon, and Terang 2000–2007

#### List of Tables

- **Table 3.1:** Demography of the research locale
- **Table 3.2:** Numbers of midwives and doctors in Corangamite Shire hospitals, October, 2004
- **Table 3.3:** Total births and confinements in Corangamite Shire compared with other Victorian rural areas, urban Level II and Level III hospitals, 1996–2004
- **Table 3.4:** Birth weights in Corangamite Shire compared with other Victorian rural, urban excluding Level III, and Level III hospitals, 1996–2004
- **Table 3.5:** Types of birth in the Corangamite Shire compared with other rural, urban excluding Level III, and Level III hospitals, in Victoria, 1996–2004
- **Table 3.6:** Apgar scores for births in Corangamite Shire, other rural, urban excluding Level III, and Level III hospitals in Victoria, 1996–2004
- **Table 5.1:** Interviewees' roles in CMCN and pseudonyms assigned to them
- **Table 6.1** Tasks completed by the Quality Guidelines and Protocols Committee
- **Table 6.2** Process for identification and adaptation of evidence based guidelines.
- **Table 6.3** Guidelines developed and approved within the CMCN
- **Table 6.4** Guidelines developed within the CMCN for which approval had not been completed
- **Table 6.5** CMCN process for updating clinical practice guidelines
- **Table 6.6** Key tasks of the CMCN education committee
- **Table 6.7:** Summary of results from educational needs analysis survey within CMCN
- Table 6.8 Core Competencies for clinicians in the CMCN
- **Table 6.9** CMCN educational events
- **Table 6.10** CMCN Educational experiences for midwives to learn acoucheur skills
- **Table 6.11** Midwives responses to the workforce survey
- **Table 6.12:** Travel by doctors within CMCN
- **Table 6.13** Attributes of the Proposed Enhanced Midwifery Skills in Collaboration (EMSiC) for CMCN
- **Table 6.14** Where and when presentations were made about the CMCN

- **Table 8.1:** Interviewees' roles in CMCN and pseudonyms assigned to them
- **Table 9.1:** Corangamite Managed Clinical Network and the key features identified by Mannion, Davies and Marshall of a learning organisation
- **Table 9.2:** Characteristics of culture types in the competing values framework In the Appendices:
- **Table 7.1:** Numbers of births in CMCN per calendar year by hospital and in total
- **Table 7.2:** Percentage of births occurring from spontaneous onset of labour within **CMCN**
- **Table 7.3:** Percentages of deliveries that are caesarean sections in CMCN 2000–2005
- **Table 7.4:** Parity of mothers birthing in CMCN in 2007 as a percentage of total births in each hospital
- **Table 7.5:** Numbers of vaginal births after caesarean section in CMCN 2006–2007 in Camperdown, Timboon and Terang
- **Table 7.6:** Epidural anaesthesia for multiparous births within CMCN from 2000 to 2005 as a percentage of total multipara births
- **Table 7.7:** Epidural Anaesthesia for primiparous births in Camperdown, Terang and Timboon 2000–2005 as a percentage of total primiparous births
- **Table 7.8:** Epidural Anaesthesia for all women within CMCN 2006 and 2007
- **Table 7.9:** Percentage of total births in which a postpartum haemorrhage occurred in Camperdown, Terang and Timboon 2000-2007

### **Thesis Abstract**

This thesis describes the rise and fall of a small rural maternity managed clinical network: the Corangamite Managed Clinical Network (CMCN). Although the context of the CMCN is a rural maternity service, the network themes are relevant to health care everywhere because of the lessons that can be drawn.

The managed clinical network model addresses three important contemporary rural health issues: the struggles of small health services to enact quality assurance, to provide continuing professional development and to attract clinicians. Over the past twenty years, there has been a sharp decline in the number of rural maternity services in Australia. Maternity service models that are sustainable in the current health service environment are required. The successes of Corangamite Managed Clinical Network (CMCN) show what can be achieved in a low volume, rural maternity service. The failures of the CMCN are a cautionary tale for those interested in network development.

The thesis comprises four studies that used quantitative and qualitative methods to examine the development of the CMCN. The researcher adopted a relativist ontology and subjectivist epistemology and used naturalistic research methodologies. She performed literature reviews to build an historical case; interviews and grounded theory to assess what the actors believed about the maternity services and network; participant observation and narrative inquiry to describe what happened and how, and finally a quantitative clinical audit to provide a different perspective of clinical and educational activity within the CMCN. In this way a comprehensive picture of the CMCN is painted. The depiction enables detailed analysis of the CMCN to occur.

This thesis measures the CMCN against four theoretical models that have been used to qualitatively evaluate health services: systems thinking, the learning organisation, the diffusion of innovation within organisations and criteria for receptivity to innovation within them, organisational culture and service performance. Using these models this thesis finds that the CMCN performed as a clinical microsystem in an unsupportive macrosystem. It was a learning organisation under command of a less reflective

organisation. It was receptive to innovation and its diffusion within a context that did not support innovation and finally, the CMCN displayed health service cultural characteristics that have been associated with high performing health services and the regional health service culture did not. It is noteworthy that these contradistinctions occurred in the rural context.

The CMCN achieved its aims to provide maternity services using a patient-centred model, to share expertise and resources between the hospitals, to deliver a quality assurance program, to facilitate local team-based multidisciplinary professional development and to develop a sustainable workforce model. The CMCN was internally strong with a good management structure and committed clinicians. Yet despite these strengths, it collapsed. The tragic flaw of the CMCN that spelt its end was that it did not fully engage with a culturally dissonant regional health service management.

## **Author's Declaration**

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.



**Ruth Alison Stewart** 

# **Acknowledgements**

I wish to acknowledge:

My husband, **Dr Anthony Brown**, for his steadfast personal, domestic and professional support as I struggled with the process of becoming a researcher who completed the task. He has allowed me to disappear from most of our shared activity for the past ten months. He has never abandoned hope that the pupa will emerge an imago.

**Professor James Dunbar,** my supervisor, who has inspired me to greater heights, focused my aim, and called me to attention when I have needed it.

**Associate Professor Karen Stagnitti,** my co-supervisor, for her support, her encouragement and for giving structure to my rambling.

**Professor Roger Strasser,** my co-supervisor, without whose encouragement this thesis would have been abandoned. His sage advice was a beacon in the dark night of this research project.

**Dr John Menzies** for the encouragement he offered me to change a sense of outrage into a research question and for his vision and drive to establish the Corangamite Managed Care Network.

**Ms Jillian Donnelly,** CMCN coordinator who was the boundary spanner and inspired so many of the clinicians within the CMCN, including myself.

The doctors, nurses, and health administrators of the Corangamite Shire who *were* the Corangamite Managed Clinical Network.

My son **Hamish Brown**, who worked as a research assistant, providing prompt and skilled transcription, coding and statistical services.

My daughter **Grace Brown**, who also provided prompt and skilled transcription and coding services and encouragement.

All my children, **Hamish** and **Grace** as mentioned but also **Duncan and Lachlan**, who have watched their mother disappear time and time again to work and still have the trust to love me and engage with me when I come back.

My editors Alison Caddick and Crissene Fawcett of Sans Serif Editing and Publishing, for their patience and control of fonts, spaces, cases, commas and syntax. Any polish in this thesis was given by them.

To my colleagues in the Deakin University IMMERSe program for giving me space to concentrate on this thesis during 2011.

Professor Jeffrey Robinson, University of Adelaide, Department of Obstetrics
Professor Ross Haslam, University of Adelaide, Department of Neonatology
Dr David Morris, University of Adelaide, Department of Obstetrics
Dr Brian Peat, University of Adelaide, Department of Obstetrics
Ms Christine Cornwell, Divisional Chief Nursing, Women's and Children's Hospital Adelaide

**Ms Alison Rogers**, Project officer, South Australian Health Start Perinatal Practice Guidelines project

**Dr Mike Moynihan** for passing on to me the fruits of his many years of work and campaigning for rural obstetrics.

**Dr James King,** chair of the Consultative Committee on Paediatric and Perinatal Mortality and Morbidity, Victoria.

**Dr Karen Lane,** School of History Heritage and Society, Deakin University, for advice on methodology.

The Staff of the Document Delivery Service of Flinders University Library, who diligently searched and worked for a student they had never met who kept asking for papers to be brought forth from obscurity.