



**Increasing fish consumption in
women of child-bearing age:
an evaluation of risks and benefits**

Lily Lai Hang Chan

Bachelor of Nutrition and Dietetics

Bachelor of Science (Honours)

Bachelor of Pharmacy

Nutrition and Dietetics

School of Health Sciences

Faculty of Medicine, Nursing and Health Sciences

Flinders University

A thesis submitted for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

2015

Table of Contents

List of Figures	v
List of Tables	vi
List of Abbreviations	x
Summary	xiii
Declaration	xv
Presentations	xvi
Acknowledgments	xvii
Overview and thesis structure	1
Chapter 1 Project rationale, aims and objectives	4
1.1 Rationale	4
1.2 Aims and objectives.....	5
Chapter 2 Literature review — Long chain n-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids and fish intakes on maternal and infant outcomes	7
2.1 Long chain n-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids (LCn3PUFA) and maternal & infant outcomes.....	7
2.1.1 Pregnancy outcome and maternal health	9
2.1.2 Child health and development.....	33
2.1.3 Conclusion.....	68
2.2 Fish intakes and maternal & infant outcomes.....	69
2.2.1 Evidence based on randomised controlled trials	69
2.2.2 Evidence based on seminal and/or large scale observational studies ...	70
2.2.3 Considerations by Australian and overseas health organisations.....	77
2.2.4 Conclusion.....	78
2.3 Final conclusion	79
Chapter 3 Fish consumption in Australian women of child-bearing age	80
3.1 Data from 1995 National Nutrition Survey (NNS).....	82
3.1.1 1995 NNS Survey and analysis methods.....	82
3.1.2 1995 NNS Survey results	83
3.2 Data from the Australian Longitudinal Study on Women’s Health (ALSWH)	85
3.2.1 ALSWH Survey and analyses methods.....	85
3.2.2 ALSWH Survey results	87

3.3	Discussion.....	91
Chapter 4 Dietary Modelling—Comparing nutrient profiles of diets of differing fish and seafood contents 94		
4.1	Background.....	94
4.2	Method.....	95
4.3	Statistical analysis.....	101
4.4	Results and discussion	101
Chapter 5 Compositional data of selected fish and fish products113		
5.1	Background.....	113
5.2	Purpose of analysis.....	114
5.3	Process.....	114
5.3.1	Fish and fish products included for analysis	114
5.3.2	Selection of suitable laboratory to conduct the analysis	115
5.3.3	Analytes included and method of analysis	116
5.3.4	Preparation of samples.....	122
5.3.5	Quality assurance and quality control.....	124
5.3.6	Calculated versus analysed results for cooked products	124
5.4	Results and discussion	125
5.4.1	Proximates.....	126
5.4.2	Long chain n-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids (LCn3PUFA).....	126
5.4.3	Mercury and other metals	127
5.4.4	Vitamins A, D and E	128
5.4.5	Raw and cooked products	128
Chapter 6 Acceptability and effects of a higher fish diet — a randomised controlled trial153		
6.1	Methods.....	154
6.1.1	Study design.....	154
6.1.2	Study population	154
6.1.3	Study intervention.....	155
6.2	Study outcomes – methods of assessment.....	161
6.2.1	Single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) analysis.....	161
6.2.2	Dietary assessment	163
6.2.3	Fatty acids analysis.....	163
6.2.4	Lipids study	164
6.2.5	Iron study and haemoglobin	165

6.2.6	Mercury analysis	166
6.2.7	Selenium analysis.....	167
6.2.8	Inflammatory marker analysis (C-reactive protein)	167
6.2.9	Anthropometric and other assessments	167
6.3	Sample size and statistical analyses	169
6.4	Results.....	170
6.4.1	Single Nucleotide Polymorphisms (SNPs).....	171
6.4.2	Dietary assessment	175
6.4.3	Fatty acids	182
6.4.4	Lipids study	191
6.4.5	Iron status and haemoglobin level.....	192
6.4.6	Mercury.....	193
6.4.7	Selenium	195
6.4.8	Inflammatory marker (C-Reactive Protein).....	196
6.4.9	Anthropometric and other assessments	197
6.5	Discussion.....	200
6.6	Conclusions	204
	Chapter 7 Cost-effective analysis of a higher fish diet.....	205
7.1	Introduction.....	205
7.2	Methods.....	205
7.3	Results.....	209
7.4	Discussion.....	210
	Chapter 8 Conclusion, implications for future practice and research.....	212
	References.....	217
	Appendices.....	234
	Appendix 1 Search Strategy for the literature review	234
	Appendix 2 Description of studies included in the literature review	236
	Appendix 3 Summary of risk of bias assessment for each included study.....	245
	Appendix 4 Foods included in the dietary modelling	248
	Appendix 5 List of omega-3 rich food or drinks to avoid or limit to small amounts during the trial period.....	253
	Appendix 6 Diet acceptability questionnaire	254
	Appendix 7 Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale (CES-D)	255

List of Figures

Figure 2.1 Essential fatty acid production and metabolism to form eicosanoids	10
Figure 3.1 Per capita consumption of fish and seafood in Australia 1970–2009 according to the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) <i>Source: FAOSTAT</i>	80
Figure 3.2 Per capita consumption of fish and seafood of developed countries within the North American, Asian and Oceanic and the European Union regions in 2009 according to the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) <i>Source: FAOSTAT</i>	81
Figure 3.3 Mean fish daily intake in 2003 and 2009 by pregnancy status in the young cohort of the Australian Longitudinal Study on Women’s Health as estimated by the Dietary Questionnaire for Epidemiological Studies (Version 2)	90
Figure 5.1 Illustration of the draining process for canned fish.....	123
Figure 5.2 Equipment used to homogenise samples.....	124
Figure 6.1 A graphical representation of study protocol for the randomised controlled trial examining the acceptability and effects of a higher fish diet.....	156
Figure 6.2: Intervention group study food	157
Figure 6.3: Control group study food.....	158
Figure 6.4 Flow diagram of the progress through phases of the randomised control trial aimed at examining the acceptability and effects of a higher fish diet.....	170
Figure 6.5 Contribution of various macronutrients towards total energy intake during the run-in period (i.e. two weeks prior to randomisation) and trial period (i.e. Week 7 and Week 8 of the study period).....	180
Figure 6.6 Ratio of monounsaturated, polyunsaturated and saturated fats observed during the run-in period (i.e. two weeks prior to randomisation) and trial period (i.e. Week 7 and Week 8 of the study period).....	180
Figure 6.7 Correlations between erythrocyte EPA and plasma phospholipids EPA at baseline (a), 4-week (b) and 8-week (c).....	182
Figure 6.8 Correlations between erythrocyte DHA and plasma phospholipids DHA at baseline (a), 4-week (b) and 8-week (c).....	183
Figure 6.9 Correlations between erythrocyte DPA and plasma phospholipids DPA at baseline (a), 4-week (b) and 8-week (c).....	184
Figure 6.10 Correlations between erythrocyte AA and plasma phospholipids AA at baseline (a), 4-week (b) and 8-week (c).....	185

List of Tables

Table 1. Project tasks.....	3
Table 2.1 RCTs with pregnancy outcomes (length of gestation, pre-term and post-term delivery rates)	16
Table 2.2 RCTs with pregnancy outcomes (pregnancy-induced hypertension, pre-eclampsia, eclampsia)	25
Table 2.3 RCTs with maternal health as outcome (perinatal depression).....	31
Table 2.4 RCTs with child health at birth as outcomes (Birth weight, birth length, head circumference, low birth weight, IUGR)	38
Table 2.5 RCTs with child health as outcomes (physical growth pattern).....	45
Table 2.6 RCTs with child health as outcomes (neurological development)	52
Table 2.7 RCTs with child health as outcomes (visual function).....	60
Table 2.8 RCTs with child health as outcomes (atopic disease).....	66
Table 3.1 Proportion of women (18–49 years) consuming fish and seafood products and dishes on the day of the 1995 National Nutrition Survey by 24-hour recall (n=3576)	83
Table 3.2 Mean daily intake of fish and seafood products and dishes on the day of the 1995 National Nutrition Survey by 24-hour recall (n=3576)	84
Table 3.3 Median daily intake of fish and seafood products and dishes amongst consumers on the day of the 1995 National Nutrition Survey by 24 hour recall.....	84
Table 3.4 Proportion of women (18–49 years) who consumed fish twice a week or more as reported in the 1995 National Nutrition Survey Food Frequency Questionnaire (n=2649)	85
Table 3.5 The number of women included and excluded from analysis.....	87
Table 3.6 Mean weekly intake frequency scores of fish in the young cohort of the Australian Longitudinal Study on Women’s Health who consumed fish twice a week or more in 2003 and 2009 as estimated by the Dietary Questionnaire for Epidemiological Studies (Version 2).....	88
Table 3.7 Median weekly intake frequency scores of fish in the young cohort of the Australian Longitudinal Study on Women’s Health who consumed fish twice a week or more in 2003 and 2009 as estimated by the Dietary Questionnaire for Epidemiological Studies (Version 2).....	88
Table 3.8 Mean daily intake of fish products in the young cohort of the Australian Longitudinal Study on Women’s Health in 2003 and 2009 as estimated by the Dietary Questionnaire for Epidemiological Studies (Version 2)	89
Table 3.9 Median daily intake of fish products in the young cohort of the Australian Longitudinal Study on Women’s Health in 2003 and 2009 as estimated by the Dietary Questionnaire for Epidemiological Studies (Version 2)	89

Table 3.10 Fish consumption pattern in the young cohort of the Australian Longitudinal Study on Women’s Health in 2003 and 2009 as estimated by the Dietary Questionnaire for Epidemiological Studies (Version 2)	90
Table 4.1 Australian Dietary Guidelines — Sample daily food patterns for women 19–50 years.....	99
Table 4.2 Nutrient reference values (NRVs) for Australia and New Zealand ^a on selected nutrients for non-pregnant, non-lactating women aged 19–50 years.....	100
Table 4.3 Type of fish and seafood consumed by women aged 19–49 years in the 1995 National Nutrition Survey on the day of the survey using 24 hour recall (n=3506).....	102
Table 4.4 Number of serves of fish and seafood required per week to achieve recommendations as per Model 1 (i.e. current fish and seafood consumption pattern)	103
Table 4.5 Number of serves of fish and seafood required per week to achieve recommendations as per Model 2 (i.e. high LCn3PUFA fish must be included)	104
Table 4.6 Differences in food intakes between a lower fish diet (Model 3) and a higher fish diet (Model 4) assuming average height with sedentary to moderate physical activity levels	106
Table 4.7 Theoretical mean daily nutrient intake profile in women aged 19–50 years as estimated by the simulation of 1000 diets that followed the recommendations of the Australian Dietary Guidelines but with a lower fish content (around 1.5 serves of non-oily fish and seafood per week)	108
Table 4.8 Theoretical mean daily nutrient intake profile in women aged 19–50 years as estimated by the simulation of 1000 diets that followed the recommendations of the Australian Dietary Guidelines but with a higher fish content (around three serves of oily fish and seafood per week)	109
Table 4.9 Proportion of 1000 simulated diets meeting Suggested Dietary Targets (SDT) and FAO/WHO recommended daily intake of 250 mg of EPA+DHA.....	111
Table 4.10 Mean percentage contribution to dietary energy of macronutrients and proportion of diets within acceptable macronutrient distribution ranges (AMDR).....	111
Table 5.1 Proximates selected for analysis and analytical method details	119
Table 5.2 Fatty acids selected for analysis and analytical method details	120
Table 5.3 Minerals and heavy metals selected for analysis and analytical method details	121
Table 5.4 Vitamins selected for analysis and analytical method details	122
Table 5.5 Compositional profile for John West Atlantic Salmon (Skin Off)	131
Table 5.6 Compositional profile for John West Yellowtail Kingfish	134
Table 5.7 Compositional profile for John West Sardines in Tomato Sauce and Pink Salmon	137
Table 5.8 Compositional profile for John West Red Salmon and Salmon Tempters	139

Table 5.9 Compositional profile for John West Tuna Tempters and Tuna in Springwater	141
Table 5.10 Compositional profile for Birds Eye Atlantic Salmon Lemon Pepper.....	143
Table 5.11 Compositional profile for Birds Eye Lightly Seasoned Fish Fillets (Hoki) – Lemon & Cracked Pepper	145
Table 5.12 Compositional profile for Birds Eye Fish Fingers 1 kg (Hoki/Hake)	147
Table 5.13 Compositional profile for Birds Eye Oven Bake Fish Fillets (Hoki/Hake) Original Crumb 425 g.....	149
Table 5.14 Compositional profile for Birds Eye Deep Sea Dory Fish Portions Original Crumb 425 g.....	151
Table 6.1 Forward primers, reverse primers and probes used in the polymerase chain reaction	162
Table 6.2 Characteristics of study participants at baseline.....	171
Table 6.3 Minor allele frequencies and testing for Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium.....	172
Table 6.4 Mean (standard deviation) fatty acids levels by genotypes (count, %) at baseline	173
Table 6.5 Mean (standard deviation) total mercury and methyl mercury levels by genotypes (count, %) at baseline	174
Table 6.6 Estimated key nutrients intake (per day) prior to (Run-in [^]) and during the study period (Trial [^]) as obtained from the averages of 3-day weighed-food record.....	176
Table 6.7 Estimated intakes (per day) of selected vitamins prior to (Run-in [^]) and during the study period (Trial [^]) as obtained from the averages of 3-day weighed-food record	178
Table 6.8 Estimated intakes (per day) of selected minerals prior to (Run-in [^]) and during the study period (Trial [^]) as obtained from the averages of 3-day weighed-food record	179
Table 6.9 Acceptability of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) rated on a 1 to 7 scale	181
Table 6.10 Effects of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) on erythrocyte EPA, DPA, DHA and AA as a proportion of total fatty acids .	188
Table 6.11 Effects of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) on plasma phospholipids EPA, DPA, DHA and AA as a proportion of total fatty acids.....	190
Table 6.12 Effects of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) on serum lipid and lipoproteins.....	191
Table 6.13 Effects of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) on serum iron and haemoglobin levels.....	192
Table 6.14 Effects of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) on total mercury and methyl mercury levels	194
Table 6.15 Effects of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) on plasma and whole blood selenium levels	195

Table 6.16 Effects of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) on serum C-reactive protein (CRP) levels.....	196
Table 6.17 Effects of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) on weight, BMI and body composition.....	197
Table 6.18 Effects of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) on blood pressure	198
Table 6.19 Effects of a diet higher in fish (intervention) versus a low fish diet (control) on depression mood indicator.....	199
Table 7.1 Food provided to participants during the 8-week intervention period.....	207
Table 7.2 Unit costs of resources used	208
Table 7.3 Comparative costs of the study foods providing 200mg of DHA.....	209
Table 7.4 Cost effectiveness of a higher fish diet to achieve higher DHA intake and DHA level in red blood cells	209

List of Abbreviations

AA	Arachidonic acid
ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
AHP	Allied Health Professional
AHRQ	Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality
AI	Adequate intakes
ALA	Alpha-linolenic acid
ALSPAC	Avon Longitudinal Study of Parents and Children
ALSWH	Australian Longitudinal Study on Women's Health
AMDR	Acceptable macronutrient distribution ranges
AQ	AsureQuality Limited
BDI	Beck Depression Inventory
BMI	Body mass index
BSID	Bayley Scales of Infant Development-Mental Development
CLAMSDQ	Clinical Linguistic and Auditory Milestone Scale Developmental Quotients
CRP	C-reactive protein
CSIRO	Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation
CURF	Confidentialised Unit Record Files
CVFAS	Cold vapour atomic fluorescence spectroscopy
DHA	Docosahexaenoic acid
DOMInO	DHA to Optimize Mother Infant Outcome
DNBC	Danish National Birth Cohort
DPA	Docosapentaenoic acid
DQES	Dietary Questionnaire for Epidemiological Studies
EAR	Estimated average requirement
EEG	Electroencephalogram
EPA	Eicosapentaenoic acid
EPC	Evidence-based Practice Center

EPDS	Edinburgh Postnatal Depression Scale
ERG	Electroretinogram
FRDC	Fisheries Research & Development Corporation
FSANZ	Food Standards Australia New Zealand
GEE	Generalised estimating equations
HDL	High-density lipoprotein
HPLC	High-performance liquid chromatography
ICER	Incremental cost effectiveness ratio
IgE	Immunoglobulin E
IOM	The Institute of Medicine of the National Academies of Science
IUGR	Intrauterine growth retardation
LCn3PUFA	Long chain n-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids
LOR	Limit of Reporting
MADRS	Montgomery-Asberg Depression Rating Scale
MAR	Minimal angle of resolution
MDI	Mental Developmental Index
MeHg	Methyl mercury
NATA	National Association of Testing Authorities
NHANES	National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey
NHMRC	National Health and Medical Research Council
NMI	National Measurement Institute
NNS	National Nutrition Survey
NRV	Nutrient reference values
NUHEAL	Nutraceuticals for a Healthier Life
PAL	Physical activity level
PCR	Polymerase chain reaction
PDI	Psychomotor Development Index
PIH	Pregnancy-induced hypertension

PUFA	Polyunsaturated fatty acids
RCT	Randomised controlled trials
RDI	Recommended dietary intake
RMIT	Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology
RPD	Relative percentage difference
SARDI	South Australian Research and Development Institute
SCORAD	SCORing Atopic Dermatitis
SDT	Suggested dietary target
SiPS	Salmon in Pregnancy Study
SLS	Sodium lauryl sulphate
SNP	Single nucleotide polymorphisms
SPME	Solid phase microextraction
THg	Total mercury
UL	Upper level of intake
VEP	Visual evoked potential
WHO	World Health Organization

Summary

Epidemiological studies have consistently demonstrated positive association of infant neurodevelopment with maternal fish consumption, mostly attributed to the abundance of long chain n-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids (LCn3PUFA) in fish. However, fish consumption by Australian women is overall less than optimal. Secondary analysis of nationally conducted surveys [1995 National Nutrition Survey and the Australian Longitudinal Study on Women's Health (ALSWH) in 2003 and 2009] demonstrated that less than half of Australian women of child-bearing age would consume fish at least twice a week as recommended by the Australian Dietary Guidelines. Of concern was the even lower fish intake in women who were pregnant or had recently given birth when compared with other women in the ALSWH surveys. This observation suggests that women may consume less fish whilst pregnant for fear of potential contaminants that might be present in fish.

A dietary modelling exercise based on the food consumption pattern from the Australian Dietary Guidelines confirms that one would need to consume three serves of oily or high LCn3PUFA fish per week to meet the suggested dietary target of 430 mg of LCn3PUFA for women as recommended by the National Health and Medical Research Council.

In order to ascertain the levels of LCn3PUFA and other nutrients present in Australian fish/fish products, several commonly consumed fish/fish products selected for use in the ensuing randomised trial were analysed following standardised procedure. Mercury contents of these fish study foods were also tested and found to be relatively low (range: 1.1 µg–7.0 µg/100 g).

To assess the acceptability of a diet that included more fish and its effects on biological parameters, a single-blinded randomised controlled eight-week trial was conducted in healthy women aged 18–50 years who normally consumed no more than one oily fish meal per week. The higher fish diet included four serves per week of a variety of fresh and convenience fish products (including canned and frozen, oily and non-oily) and were provided to the participants. The control group was asked to maintain their usual lower fish/higher meat diet and participants were provided with four serves of beef, chicken or deli-meat per week. After eight weeks,

significant increases in mean eicosapentaenoic acid (EPA), docosahexaenoic acid (DHA) and methyl mercury levels were observed in the intervention group when compared to the control group. Although blood mercury level did rise with increased fish intake, it was still at a level accepted as safe. The median acceptability score for both diets was the same suggesting no difference in diet acceptance.

A cost-effectiveness study conducted post-trial demonstrated that including fish in a diet is an economical means to obtain LCn3PUFA. To obtain equal amount of DHA, it would have cost sixty times more if consuming the meat study food compared to the fish study food.

In conclusion, it has been demonstrated that consuming a variety of fish and fish products several times a week is an acceptable and cost-effective means of improving LCn3PUFA status without causing detrimental increases in mercury levels, provided low-mercury containing fish are consumed. Women of child-bearing age are advised to consume high-LCn3PUFA but low-mercury containing fish as part of a healthy diet.

Declaration

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgment any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

Lily L H Chan

Presentations

Poster presentation

Chan, L, Grieger, JA, Miller, Cobiac, L 2010, 'Simulation of fish intake in women of child-bearing age', poster presented to the 2010 Annual Scientific Meeting of the Nutrition Society of Australia, Perth, Australia, 30 November–3 December.

Oral presentation

Chan, L, Grieger, JA, Cobiac, L 2010, 'Fish and seafood intake in Australian women of child-bearing age', abstract presented to the International Seafood & Health Conference, Melbourne, Australia, 8–10 November.

Chan, L, Miller, M, Thompson, C, Midgley, J, Cobiac, L 2011, 'Assessment of the effects and acceptability of a higher fish diet in women of child-bearing age' abstract presented to the 35th Annual Scientific Meeting of the Nutrition Society of Australia and New Zealand, Queenstown, New Zealand, 30 November–2 December.

Oral presentation at the Flinders Clinical and Molecular Medicine Cluster Seminar Series, Flinders University, 25 August 2010 and 3 August 2011.

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank my supervisors Professor Lynne Cobiac, Associate Professor Michelle Miller and Professor Campbell Thompson for their support, both on an academic level and on a personal level. They provided continual guidance on my research and unlimited reassurance and encouragement throughout my candidature.

I would also like to thank the Australian Seafood Cooperative Research Centre (CRC) for funding the project. In addition, the CRC also provided opportunities and programmes to assist with the development of various skills and insight into the industry.

Many thanks also go to Simplot Australia, another sponsor of our project, and its staff. Dr Jocelyn Midgley, Ms Sasha King and Ms Crystal Yam have all been very helpful and provided valuable comments on the draft reports.

I would also like to thank Dr Susan Kim and Mr Pawel Skuza who have on many occasions enlightened me with their statistical expertise.

I am indebted to Dr Kathryn Burdon and her staff and students in the Department of Ophthalmology (Flinders University), and Professor Robert Gibson and his staff at the Fatty Acid Laboratory (Adelaide University) for allowing me to work in their laboratories and to learn from them. I also appreciate the help from Professor Julie Ratcliffe who guided me through the cost-effective analysis.

The Australian Bureau of Statistics and the PSA Committee of Australian Longitudinal Study on Women's health have both kindly provided survey data for the secondary analysis of fish consumption in Australian women.

Professional editor, Dr Gaye Wilson, provided copyediting and proofreading services, according to the guidelines laid out in the university-endorsed national guidelines, 'The editing of research theses by professional editors'. The integrity of the final submitted thesis remains my responsibility.

And last but not least, I would like to thank my family, in particular, my mother who has accompanied me all through this journey in search of knowledge and making sure that I have adequate rest and nutrition.