Another World is Possible:

Tourism, Globalisation and the Responsible Alternative

B. Freya Higgins-Desbiolles

B.A. (University of Dallas), M.A. (Schiller International University, London)

A thesis submitted in total fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

September 2006

School of Political and International Studies
Faculty of Social Sciences
Flinders University of South Australia

Table of Contents

Table of Con	tents	i
List of figure	S	v
List of tables		vi
Summary		vii
Declaration		X
Acknowledge	ments	xi
Glossary of a	bbreviations	xii
Preface		xvii
Examining to	ourism: Critical ethnography and Indigenous research	
1.1 Introd	uction	1
1.1.1	The contribution of this study	2
1.1.2 1.1.3	Theoretical perspective and methodology Ethics and Indigenous research	6 12
1.2 Thesis	-	16
T		
Tourism as a	in industry versus tourism as a social force	
2.1 Backg	ground	19
2.1.1 2.1.2	Historical perspective The hegemony of the market	20 22
2.2 Touris	sm as an industry - the marketisation of tourism	27
2.3 Touris	sm as a social force - the transformative capacity of tourism	33
2.3.1	Tourism and travel as a human right	35
2.3.2 2.3.3	Social tourism – a forgotten commitment to humanity Alternative perspectives: "Non-Western" understandings	39
2.4 = :	of tourism	48
	sm - bigger than business	52 55
2.5 The promise of tourism		
2.6 Conclusion		

Globalisation

3.1 Introduction		
3.2 Historical outline		
3.3 Modern antecedents to globalisation: Modernisation		
and development	66	
3.4 Globalisation	70	
3.4.1 The sceptics versus the globalists	71	
3.4.2 Theoretical thinking on globalisation3.4.3 Three arenas of globalisation	73 76	
3.4.4 It is capitalist globalisation that matters	87	
3.4.5 Sklair's sociology of the global system	91	
3.4.5.1 Twin crises	103	
3.4.5.2 Towards socialist globalisation	106	
3.5 An Indigenous analysis of contemporary global order	114	
3.6 Conclusion	118	
From globalisation to corporatised tourism		
4.1 Introduction	121	
4.2 Context of the global tourism industry	122	
4.3 Globalisation and tourism	124	
4.4 The World Tourism Organization	128	
4.5 The World Travel and Tourism Council	137	
4.6 The World Bank and World Economic Forum: Non-tourism		
institutions foster the corporate tourism agenda	144	
4.7 Transnational capitalist class - a case study	147	
4.8 Tourism transnational practices	150	
4.8.1 Liberalisation under the General Agreement on	150	
Trade and Services (GATS)	150	
4.8.2 More TNPS - vertical integration and leveraging4.8.3 International Year of Ecotourism 2002 - celebration	164	
or review?	166	
4.9 Culture-ideology of consumerism and the right to travel	172	
4.10 Evidence of the twin crises in tourism	179	
4.11 Opposition fostered by the twin crises	187	
4.12 A word of caution	190	
4.13 Conclusion	192	

Alternative tourism as a path to alternative globalisation

5.1 Intro	duction	195	
5.2 Origi	ns of alternative tourism	196	
5.2.1	Definition of key concepts: Mass, alternative and		
522	corporatised tourism	197	
5.2.2	Alternative tourism in the context of alternative development	203	
5.3 Type	s of alternative tourism	209	
5.3.1	Ecotourism	209	
5.3.2		213	
5.3.3	Fair trade in tourism	219	
5.3.4	Pro-poor tourism	223	
5.3.5	Community-based tourism	226	
5.3.6	C	230	
5.3.7		233 236	
5.3.8			
	rmining and usurpation	244	
5.4.1	Usurpation of the environments of others	244	
5.4.2		247 250	
5.4.3 5.4.4	Greenwash	252	
	Ecological economics	260	
5.4.6	-	263	
5.4.7	Assimilation in the capitalist economy	267	
5.5 Trans	sformations through alternative tourism	269	
5.6 Conc	lusion	284	
Case study	of the Ngarrindjeri of South Australia		
6.1 Intro	duction	289	
6.2 Impa	cts of globalisation and tourism on Indigenous communities	290	
6.3 Indig	enous rights and tourism internationally	299	
6.4 The I	Ngarrindjeri of South Australia	309	
6.4.1	Conflicts	314	
6.4.	1.1 Hindmarsh Island Bridge conflict	314	
6.4.	1.2 IYE 2002 Australian launch	324	
6.4.2	Crossing bridges: Reconciliation in Australia	330	
6.4.3	\mathcal{E}		
6.4.4 Camp Coorong: Is it tourism?		354	
6.4.5	Ngarrindjeri paths to securing their Indigenous rights	358	
6.4.6	Ngarrindjeri perspectives Stakahalders versus gustadiens of the land	369	
6.4.7	Stakeholders versus custodians of the land	372	

6.5 Conclusion	376
Conclusion: Another tourism is possible	
7.1 Introduction	379
7.2 Review of thesis	379
7.3 Another world is possible	384
7.4 Another tourism is possible	388
7.5 Conclusion	392
Appendices	
Appendix A: From Mumbai to Porto Alegre: Statement of Concern of the Tourism Interventions Group at the 4th WSF (ECOT 2004)	396
Appendix B: Sample comments between 1990 and 2002 from guest books placed in the museum of Camp Coorong	397
Appendix C: Comments from post-trip survey of Adelaide Medical School students (Harkin, Newbury, Henneberg & Hudson 2000)	401
Appendix D: Outline of some of the significant events in Ngarrindjeri assertion of Indigenous rights	404
Appendix E: Proclamation of Ngarrindjeri sovereignty	406
Appendix F: Apology from Alexandrina Council	408
Appendix G: List of personal communications	409
Appendix H: List of associated publications	410
Bibliography	411

List of Figures

Figure 2.1:	Capacity to facilitate transformative experiences from	
	main tourism sectors with discrepancies in the fulfilment	
	of the right to travel between the minority elite and	
	the majority underpriviledged	49
Figure 2.2:	Contrasting attributes and effects of tourism: Tourism	
1 Igure 2.2.	as industry and tourism as social force	56
Figure 2.3:	The three trilogies model: Institutions, systems	
	and spatial scales (Stilwell, 2002)	61
Figure 4.1:	Model of the sociology of corporatised tourism	180
Figure 5.1:	Relationship between sustainable, alternative, mass and ecotourism (Weaver, 2001)	214
Figure 5.2:	Contrasting value systems for corporatised and alternative tourisms	270
Figure 5.3:	Transformative concepts applied to global order and tourism system	283
Figure 6.1:	Map showing some indicative boundaries (after Jenkin, 1979) of Ngarrindjeri country, South Australia	312

List of Tables

Table 2.1 :	Milestones in the evolution of the human		
	right to travel and tourism in the modern era	40	
Table 3.1 :	Sociology of the Global System (Sklair, 1999)	96	
Table 4.1 :	Sklair's (1999) model of the sociology of the		
	global system applied to tourism	178	

Summary

Utilising a critical theoretical perspective, this work examines contemporary corporatised tourism and capitalist globalisation. This analysis suggests that marketisation limits the understanding of the purposes of tourism to its commercial and "industrial" features, thereby marginalising wider understandings of the social importance of tourism.

Sklair's conceptualisation of capitalist globalisation and its dynamics, as expressed in his "sociology of the global system" (2002), is employed to understand the corporatised tourism phenomenon. This thesis explains how a corporatised tourism sector has been created by transnational tourism and travel corporations, professionals in the travel and tourism sector, transnational practices such as the liberalisation being imposed through the General Agreement on Trade in Services negotiations and the culture-ideology of consumerism that tourists have adopted. This thesis argues that this reaps profits for industry and exclusive holidays for privileged tourists, but generates social and ecological costs which inspire vigorous challenge and resistance.

This challenge is most clearly evident in the alternative tourism movement which seeks to provide the equity and environmental sustainability undermined by the dynamics of corporatised tourism. Alternative tourism niches with a capacity to foster an "eco-humanism" are examined by focusing on ecotourism, sustainable tourism, pro-poor tourism, fair trade in tourism, community-based tourism, peace through tourism, volunteer tourism and justice tourism. While each of these

demonstrates certain transformative capacities, some prove to be mild reformist efforts and others promise more significant transformative capacity. In particular, the niches of volunteer tourism and justice tourism demonstrate capacities to mount a vigorous challenge to both corporatised tourism and capitalist globalisation. Since the formation of the Global Tourism Interventions Forum (GTIF) at the World Social Forum gathering in Mumbai in 2004, justice tourism has an agenda focused on overturning corporatised tourism and capitalist globalisation, and inaugurating a new alternative globalisation which is both "pro-people" and sustainable.

Following the development of these original, macro-level conceptualisations of tourism and globalisation, this thesis presents a micro-level case study of an Indigenous Australian tourism enterprise which illustrates some of these dynamics in a local context. Camp Coorong Race Relations and Cultural Education Centre established and run by the Ngarrindjeri Aboriginal community of South Australia has utilised tourism to foster greater equity and sustainability by working towards reconciliation through tourism. The Ngarrindjeri have also experienced conflicts generated from the pressures of inappropriate tourism development which has necessitated an additional strategy of asserting their Indigenous rights in order to secure Ngarrindjeri lifeways.

The case study analysis suggests that for alternative tourism to create the transformations that contemporary circumstances require, significant political change may be necessary. This includes fulfilment of economic, social and cultural rights to which a majority of nations have committed but have to date failed to implement. While this is a challenge for nation-states and is beyond the capacities of tourism

alone, tourism nonetheless can be geared toward greater equity and sustainability if the perspective that corporatised tourism is the only option is resisted. This thesis demonstrates that another tourism is possible; one that is geared to public welfare, human fulfilment, solidarity and ecological living.

Declaration

I declare that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief, it does not contain any materials previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

Signe	u		

B. Freya Higgins-Desbiolles

Acknowledgements

The contributions of a number of people are gratefully acknowledged.

A special appreciation goes to Ngarrindjeri community members who made the case study possible. Special thanks are due to Tom Trevorrow, Matt Rigney, Ellen Trevorrow, George Trevorrow, Grant Rigney, Veronica Brodie, Cherie Watkins, Syd Sparrow, Sharon Gollan, Daryle Rigney and Lester-Irabinna Rigney. The work of Camp Coorong was the key inspiration to envisioning the possibility of another tourism and another globalisation. Supporters of the Ngarrindjeri were also very helpful in the preparation of this work; these include Vesper Tjukonai, Joan Gibbs, Steve Hemming, Natalie Harkin and Adele Pring.

Thank you to my project supervisors, Dr. Tanya Lyons and Dr. Jane Robbins for their assistance with this project. Additionally, Dr. Olga Gostin's insights, intellect and humanity were instrumental in the development and finalisation of this work. Dr. Rowena Holloway also provided valuable advice in the final stages of the thesis.

I also acknowledge the financial assistance provided at the onset of this project in the form of an Australian Postgraduate Award from the Commonwealth Government, and later support from my current employer, the School of Management of the University of South Australia, which provided vital assistance at key times for the progress and completion of this thesis.

A number of fellow travellers on the PhD journey made the path intellectually and spiritually manageable. These include Jessie Byrne, Helen O'Grady, Kylie Anderson and Gabrielle Russell-Mundine.

Last but not least, I reserve a special thank you to my extended family for their unabated patience with my distractions and absences, especially my husband, Jacky Desbiolles, and my mother, Betsy Higgins, who both demonstrated a great deal of tolerance, faith and continuous support during the life of this PhD.

Glossary of Abbreviations

AI Amnesty International

AIATSIS Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies

AITO Association of Independent Tour Operators

AkTE Arbeitskreis Tourismus Entwicklung

ALT Aboriginal Lands Trust

ANTaR Australians for Native Title and Reconciliation

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

ATA Aboriginal Tourism Australia

ATC Australian Tourism Commission (now Tourism Australia)

ATO Alternative trade organisation

ATSI Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander

ATSIC Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission

BITS International Bureau of Social Tourism

CAA Community Aid Abroad

CAR Council for Aboriginal Reconciliation

CBD Convention on Biological Diversity

CBT Community-based tourism

CDEP Community Development and Employment Program

CI Conservation International

CNP Coorong National Park

CPR Common pool resource

CSD United Nations Commission for Sustainable Development

CSR Corporate social responsibility

CWL Coorong Wilderness Lodge

DFID Department for International Development (UK)

EAA Ecotourism Association of Australia

ECOSOC United Nations Economic and Social Council

ECOT Ecumenical Coalition on Tourism (formerly ECTWT)

ECTWT Ecumenical Coalition on Third World Tourism

ETE Ecological Tourism Europe

EU European Union

EZLN Zapatista Army of National Liberation or *Ejército Zapatista de*

Liberación Nacional

FTT Fair trade in tourism

Group of 8 industrialised nations

GATS General Agreement on Trade in Services

GDP Gross domestic product

GTIF Global Tourism Interventions Forum

GX Global Exchange

HIB Hindmarsh Island Bridge

HREOC Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission (Australia)

IBA Indigenous Business Australia

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

ICRT International Centre for Responsible Tourism

ICTP International Council of Tourism Partners

IFAW International Fund for Animal Welfare

IFI International Financial Institution

IGO International governmental organisation

IIED International Institute for the Environment and Development

IIPT International Institute for Peace through Tourism

ILC Indigenous Land Corporation

ILO International Labour Organization

IMF International Monetary Fund

INGO International non-government organisation

ISEC International Society for Ecology and Culture

ITRI Indigenous Tourism Rights International (formerly RTP)

IUCN World Conservation Union (formerly the International Union for the

Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources)

IUOTO International Union for Official Tourism Organizations

IYE 2002 International Year of Ecotourism 2002

LAC Limits of acceptable change

LDC Less developed countries

LETS Local Exchange Trading Systems

MAI Multilateral Agreement on Investment

MDBC Murray-Darling Basin Commission

MOU Memorandum of understanding

NAFTA North America Free Trade Agreement

NATSITIS National Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Tourism Strategy

NGO Non-government organisation

NIEO New International Economic Order

NHMRC National Health and Medical Research Council (Australia)

NLPA Ngarrindjeri Lands and Progress Association

NPWSA National Parks and Wildlife of South Australia

NRWG Ngarrindjeri Ramsar Working Group

ODI Overseas Development Institute

OECD Organisation of Economic Cooperation and Development

PATA Pacific Asia Travel Association

P-CC Producer-consumer co-operative

PPT Pro-poor tourism

PRSP Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (formerly known as SAPs)

REKA Swiss Travel Saving Fund

RCIADIC Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody

ROC Respecting Our Cultures (Indigenous Accreditation Program)

RTP Rethinking Tourism Project

SAP Structural adjustment program (now known as PSRP)

SATC South Australian Tourism Commission

SIT Special interest tourism

SME Small to medium enterprise

STCRC Cooperative Research Centre for Sustainable Tourism

ST-EP Sustainable Tourism as a Tool for Eliminating Poverty

TAT Tourism Authority of Thailand

TCC Transnational capitalist class

TEN The European Network

TIES The International Ecotourism Society

TIG Tourism Interventions Group

TIM-Team Tourism Investigation and Monitoring Team

TINA There is no alternative (to capitalism)

TOMM Tourism Optimisation Management Model

TNC Transnational corporation

TNP Transnational practice

TRIMS Trade-Related Investment Measures Agreement

TRIPS Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights Agreement

TSA Tourism satellite account

TUI A. G. Touristik Union International

TWN Third World Network

UN United Nations

USAID United States Agency for International Development

UNAT Union Nationale des Associations de Tourisme

UNCTAD United Nations Conference on Trade and Development

UNDP United Nations Development Program

UNEP United Nations Environment Program

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund (formerly United Nations

International Emergency Children's Fund)

UNWTO World Tourism Organization

WB World Bank

WDM World Development Movement

WEF World Economic Forum

WGIP Working Group on Indigenous Populations

WGTD Working Group on Tourism and Development

WHO World Health Organization

WSF World Social Forum

WTO World Trade Organization

WTOBC World Tourism Organization Business Council

WTO-OMC The former acronym for the World Trade Organization

WTO-OMT The former acronym for the World Tourism Organization

WTTC World Travel and Tourism Council

WWF Worldwide Fund for Nature (formerly the World Wildlife Fund)

Preface

One's perspective on things is perhaps irrevocably shaped by experiences and insights that are gained in one's early years. This is certainly the case for me. I come from a small island just off the coast of North Carolina in the United States and in my heart this is my island. When my mother moved to this island just over fortytwo years ago, it had a permanent population of some five hundred souls, but these would be joined in summer by (wealthier) people from upstate and interstate who had holiday homes on our island. At that time we still had the swamps and the marshes that were a feature of many southern coastal areas. We had alligators and fresh water turtles, as well as egrets and other marsh birds which thrived on the mud and marsh that sat between our island and the mainland. We also had foxes, bears and even the odd mountain lion in addition to numerous possums, raccoons and squirrels that featured in this area. On the seashore, loggerhead sea turtles would bury their eggs in summer and after nearly two months their hatchlings would then try to make the precarious journey from the shore to the sea. Seashells abounded in these prolific waters. This is how my family made a living, collecting and trading sea shells and selling them to the tourists in the summer season. Locals complained about the impacts of outsiders (among which my family was included), but still built their businesses and jobs on the economic opportunities that these outsiders offered to their small, poor and out-of-the-way community. Life had a rhythm to it: summer brought the tourists and second-home owners, higher prices in our shops and increased traffic on our one road and bridge off the island; but winter followed when life returned to a more sedate pace, prices lowered, we had the island to ourselves and the shells washed up on the shore from the winter storms.

The peak would always be the week of the fourth of July as nearby Southport held one of the country's oldest celebrations. Over the years, visitation for this event escalated from a few thousand visitors, to 1972 when the Fourth of July Festival was declared as the official North Carolina Fourth of July Festival and visitation skyrocketed to tens of thousands more tourists. Today more than 50,000 people are attracted to this small community during this time. It was in my teenage years that I noticed that many locals would choose to stay at home rather than join the long queue of cars that would take hours to reach the highlight of the festival, the annual parade. Most were working long hours during this time in order to make the money that would tide them over in the off-season.

Things changed dramatically during these years. A permanent bridge replaced the floating, pontoon bridge that a drunken barge boat captain knocked out in 1971. Numerous facilities were built to service the tourists which the locals grew to appreciate, including cafes, restaurants, bars, large retail chains, a cinema and entertainment complexes featuring arcade games, water slides and miniature golf. This ameliorated the boredom for youth and mitigated the need for adults to travel some seventy-five miles to access such facilities on the mainland.

As the ranks of second-home owners increased and were joined by other types of tourists, more facilities were developed including golf courses, marinas, hotels and up-market residential developments, some of which attracted the more wealthy locals as clients, but more often provided much needed employment in this rather poor area of the state.

I do not know when it was that I realised that the Island I loved no longer existed.

Perhaps it was the secret joy that hurricanes brought as potential sources of cleansing the coastline which made me aware that my relationship to this place had altered as dramatically as the place itself.

What is this Island (no longer my Island) like now? The marshes have given way to elite coastal properties vying for that elusive "water view". What place is there now for the alligators and egrets whose habitat no longer exists? Bears and mountain lions have long since gone. Possums still turn up on people's doorsteps, rummaging through rubbish or pet food, or feature as road kill on ever busy streets. Loggerhead turtles are endangered, but some tourist facilities have fostered conservation projects to protect their nests for the numerous tourists who wish to view them in the egglaying and hatching periods. What peace can laying mothers or hatchlings find on a beach where every bit of the coastline is now privatised and developed; where human activity has increased dramatically and safe habitat has receded? Seashells can no longer be found in much of these coastal waters due to habitat destruction through repeated dredging to deepen channels, and the over-exploitation of shell-collectors, both tourists and professionals. And what about the locals with whom I grew up? They are moving away, inland, leaving the Island to the newcomers. There are a multitude of reasons, including: the loss of social amenity as noise and congestion disrupt well-being; increased costs of living which come from inflation, higher taxes and more costly insurance rates; and perhaps most ironically, a loss of "place attachment" as what they had loved about their island no longer exists and is unlikely to return.

This true, anecdotal story of my childhood is iconic of the tourism phenomenon. There is an inherent tendency for tourism to lay the "seeds of its own destruction" (Crick, 1989, p. 338). As it seeks to capitalise on the attractions of place, people and lifestyle, it inevitably changes the assets that were the original attraction. Numerous reactions can flow from a realisation of such dynamics. Developers attune to a globalised world know that replacement destinations for their investments abound. Local government and others interested in maintaining the place realise that sound planning and management are needed to retain the essence of the attraction and will try to manage and mitigate the impacts of change. Some locals and visitors will embrace the changes as a more upmarket and entertaining place is developed and the unpleasant features of the past (such as smelly swamps, poor infrastructure and dangerous wildlife) disappear. Those who choose to abandon the locality perhaps move on to more amenable places as change brings opportunities to access jobs, education and experiences not available in their former locality.

But my reaction is to ask: what is lost? My place, my culture and my habitat no longer exist. Like the alligator and the loggerhead sea turtle I must adjust myself to changes beyond my control and to my detriment. But it is not just the three of us who are out of kilter with the profound changes upon us. Nor is this simply a personal lament, but possibly an inexorable outcome of present circumstances, for my Island is only one among a multitude of places experiencing the same dynamics around the globe. At the time that my swamp was being slowly stifled by encroaching development, the swamps and mangroves of Cancun, Mexico were being filled in to create a resort destination in a formerly pristine area.

I must emphasise that I am not a "knee-jerk" anti-tourist. As stated, my family were originally tourist encroachers on my Island and we made our enjoyable living from selling shells to the tourists. Members of my family, including myself, have also been frequent tourists over the years, enjoying the habitats of others and perhaps contributing unwittingly to similar profound changes in other places.

The intuition seeded in my youth has sparked my interest in this thesis on contemporary tourism and globalisation. The analysis which follows moves beyond anecdote to examine the dynamics of contemporary tourism under the dominant capitalist system driven by the economic imperatives of unrestrained economic growth and development. It is suggested that such dynamics hold grave implications for our collective well-being and we should ask ourselves whether "another world is possible". ¹

.

¹ The phrase "another world is possible" became the catchery of the global justice movement following the Porte Alegre, Brazil meeting of the World Social Forum in 2001. As will be discussed in Chapters three, four and five, the global justice and justice tourism movements oppose capitalist globalisation and envision a more just, equitable and sustainable alternative. See the World Social Forum Charter of Principles for an outline of the contours of this vision at http://www.forumsocialmundial.org.br/main.php?id_menu=4&cd_language=2.