

**Natural variation in south-eastern South Australian
small mammal communities through the Late Quaternary**

Amy C. Macken
BSc (Honours) Botany and Ecology

School of Biological Sciences
Faculty of Science and Engineering
Flinders University of South Australia

9 August 2013

Supervisors:
Dr Elizabeth Reed (principal)
Dr Gavin Prideaux (associate)

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

For my grandma, Jean Le Cornu, who inspires me to persist against all odds,
and the memory of my late grandpa, Deane Le Cornu,
from whom I draw the strength to do so.

© Copyright by Amy C. Macken 2013
All Rights Reserved

Declaration

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgment any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I acknowledge that copyright of published works contained within this thesis (as listed below) resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

List of publications:

Macken, A.C., McDowell, M.C., Bartholomeusz, D.H. & Reed, E.H. (2013) Chronology and stratigraphy of the Wet Cave vertebrate fossil deposit, Naracoorte, and relationship to paleoclimatic conditions of the Last Glacial Cycle in south-eastern Australia. *Australian Journal of Earth Sciences* **60**, 271–281.

Macken, A.C., Staff, R.A. & Reed, E.H. (2013) Bayesian age-depth modelling of Late Quaternary deposits from Wet and Blanche Caves, Naracoorte, South Australia: a framework for comparative faunal analyses. *Quaternary Geochronology* **17**, 26–43

Macken, A.C & Reed, E.H. (2013) Late Quaternary small mammal faunas of the Naracoorte Caves World Heritage Area. *Transactions of the Royal Society of South Australia* **137**, 53–67.

Signed

Amy Macken

Date

Abstract

Natural variation is characterised as the normal types of change that occurs within ecosystems in response to disturbances at different spatial and temporal scales. Such changes may be expressed across a range of ecological attributes including community structure and composition. Changes in these attributes are often argued to provide the basis of ecosystem resilience to disturbance; that is, the ability of communities to adapt and reorganise whilst retaining their functional and structural traits. Consequently, the maintenance of natural variation within ecological systems has emerged as a primary biodiversity conservation strategy. However, our understanding of what normal patterns of variation may be expected in different ecosystems and the constraints on resilience within them, remains limited.

Palaeoecological deposits have increasingly been used to fill knowledge gaps about the range, type and extent of natural variation and resilience expressed by ecosystems over long time scales in response to disturbances such as climate change. Using two owl-pellet derived fossil assemblages of the Naracoorte Caves in south-eastern South Australia, this thesis examined patterns of natural variation and resilience of a small mammal palaeocommunity in terms of richness, composition, structure and relative abundances through the last glacial cycle (*c.* 51.4 to 10.2 kyr BP). More specifically, this thesis addressed the following questions:

- (a) Did the small mammal palaeocommunity reorganise in response to climate change associated with the last glacial cycle?
- (b) How did variation in different ecological variables contribute to the persistence or reorganisation of the palaeocommunity, and
- (c) How did sampling variation within and between sites, and temporal resolution, impact patterns detected in the fossil assemblages?

To address these questions, the stratigraphic and chronological contexts of the fossil assemblages were defined using sedimentary principles and age-depth modelling of radiocarbon data. Both deposits were found to be composed of five un-reworked sedimentary units which were statistically correlated between the two sites based on modelled ages. These units provided a coarse temporal scale corresponding to the major climatic phases of the last glacial cycle. Sedimentary layers were identified

within the stratigraphic units, providing a finer temporal scale for evaluating the faunal assemblage.

Faunal analyses showed that the two small mammal assemblages were statistically similar and exhibited very little compositional or structural change through the early glacial period and last glacial maximum (LGM). However, two episodes of significant palaeocommunity reorganisation were revealed at the finer temporal scale through the deglaciation/late glacial period. These changes were associated with (a) sea-surface temperatures (SSTs) warming past 16°C, post-dating the onset of warming following the LGM by *c.* 1 to 3 kyrs and (b) continued warming of mean SSTs past 18°C.

The relative abundances of individual species were sensitive to sampling effects and were variable through time at both temporal scales. The whole-palaeocommunity metrics were more robust and showed that a palaeocommunity can be stable for thousands of years, despite variable climatic conditions. Palaeocommunity change during the deglaciation shows that it is not disturbance per se that led to shifts between community states, but disturbance beyond palaeoclimatic thresholds within which particular states were able to persist. Further study of environmental thresholds for the palaeocommunity and individual species will be valuable for assessing the variability of species-environmental associations through time and the potential for their adaptation into the future.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost I acknowledge the support, guidance and insight of my principal supervisor, Dr Liz Reed. I thank her for providing access to resources, support with funding and for the opportunity to study the small mammal fossils that she methodically excavated from Blanche Cave. Most importantly, I acknowledge Liz's contribution to the project through the sharing of ideas and critique of my work. I am grateful to Liz for her unwavering confidence in the project and in me, which gave me the space and freedom to grow personally and professionally. I am also grateful for the support of my associate supervisor, Dr Gavin Prideaux. Gavin provided advice and feedback throughout my candidature and was always available at short notice to help with small, day-to-day problems and more complex questions associated with my research.

The majority of the work completed for this thesis benefited from the contributions and advice of collaborators and I extend my gratitude to those who worked with me on different aspects of the project: Dr Richard Staff who worked with me to produce the age-depth models for Wet and Blanche caves. Without his help, my ideas would not have made it to reality. Richard was generous with his time and knowledge and I am incredibly grateful for his commitment to teaching and guiding me through each step of the modelling, and for making me laugh along the way. Dr Matthew McDowell of Flinders University was a collaborator, friend and support through my candidature. I am grateful to Matt for his good-will as I revisited a site and fossil collection that he had previously studied. This project was only possible because of the previous work that had been completed on Late Quaternary aged sites of the Naracoorte Caves in which Matt was instrumental. I also thank him for allowing me to use unpublished data from his Masters thesis to complete the review of the Wet Cave stratigraphy. David Bartholomeusz led the excavation of the Wet Cave assemblage in 1997/1998. His field note books were vital for reconstructing the Wet Cave stratigraphy and I am grateful for his involvement in the Wet Cave review. For collaborating and taking the risk with me on a conference review paper, I thank Dr Patrick Moss, Dr Graeme Armstrong, Phuong Doan, Dr Beth Gott, Rosie Grundell, Dr Chris Johnson, Dr Matthew McDowell, Dr Jamie Wood and Dr Craig Woodward.

I am privileged to have been mentored and supported by highly experienced palaeontologists throughout my candidature. For their ongoing encouragement and advice I thank Emeritus Professor Rod Wells, Dr Trevor Worthy, Dr Alex Baynes and Steve Bourne. I am also grateful to have been surrounded by a diverse group of colleagues who provided encouragement, feedback on drafts and ideas, help with sorting and many laughs along the way. This wonderful ‘team’ included members of the Flinders University Palaeontology Lab and the broader Adelaide palaeontology community: Grant Gully, Dr Matt McDowell, Rachel Correll, Carey Burke, Dr Aaron Camens, Sam Arman, James Moore, Aidan Couzens, Elen Shute, Qam Nasrullah, Sean Adams, Dale Nelson, Celine Caris, Dr Graham Medlin, Dr Erick Bestland, Dr Nic Rawlence and Dr Maria Zammit; present and former staff of the Naracoorte Caves National Park: Deborah Craven-Carden, Decima McTernan, Jen McClean, Alison Rowe, Frank Bromley, Gavin Kluske, Barb Lobban, Julie Stone, Yarrow Lee, Jinhwa Lee, Ros Jones, Matt Crewe and Andrew Hansford and Friends of the Naracoorte Caves, Ann and Alan Attwood.

I also extend warm thanks to present and former staff of Flinders University who patiently answered my questions, helped me with access to resources, guided me through the paperwork, solved my IT problems and made Flinders warm and welcoming. This includes Maya Roberts, Kimberley Clift, Elke Eckhard, Sandra Marshall, Annie Flynn, Diane Colombelli-Négrel, Lyn Spencer, Mike Bull, Pam Stainer, John Marshall, Russell Stainer, Jenny Brand, Sonia Kleindorfer, Brett Norsworthy, Raphael Russell-Livingstone, Andrew Daddow and the staff of the Document Delivery services unit of the Flinders University Library. I also thank Pawel Skuza for his advice on a range of statistical approaches and for pointing me towards resources that proved invaluable to my research.

I am also grateful to have had the support of palaeoecologist, Dr Jessica Blois over my candidature. Jessica generously gave me a crash course in using the program R and provided me with a copy of an R script that she constructed for her own PhD. These resources were vital for the faunal analyses completed in this thesis. I also thank her for sharing her own experiences in research, publishing and coordinating collaborative projects. Our discussions have stuck with me and will be a source of advice and guidance for years to come.

Collection managers and curators of mammal collections from museums across Australia were also generous in sharing their data for use in constructing species distribution maps (Appendix F) and for allowing access to specimens for comparison. I especially thank David Stemmer of the South Australian Museum and Sandy Ingleby of the Australian Museum.

I also acknowledge financial support that has come from a wide range of sources. This includes an Australian Government Post-graduate Award and a top-up scholarship from the Playford Memorial Trust. The Linnean Society of New South Wales provided me with funding for radiocarbon dating. I have also been privileged to attend conferences of the Ecological Society of Australia with financial support from the Society, Flinders University of South Australia, the Australian Federation of Graduate Women and the research funds of Dr Liz Reed. I also attended workshops in palaeoecology/phylogenetics at the expense of the Australian Institute of Nuclear Science and Engineering and The National Postgraduate Workshop in Systematics. The research presented in the thesis was also supported through the Australian Government Caring for Our Country funding scheme (project: OC11-00487) and a grant from the Nature Foundation SA Inc. awarded to Dr Liz Reed.

Finally, I extend warm thanks to my family and friends. They were and remain a source of strength, confidence, motivation and inspiration. To Indigo and Joey, thank you for always being ready with an open ear, warm tea and thoughtful words. Julie, Sue and Grandma, thank you for being model to me of strong, successful women. To my dad, Michael, thank you for wanting only the best for me, and to my mum, Cathy, for your confidence and endless support. It gives me more strength than you could imagine. Thank you too for sharing in my successes and for consoling me when things didn't go as planned. And to my partner, James, thank you for being my ally, for believing in me and being ready with open arms and ears every day of the last three and a half years. This thesis is better for my having been able to share it with you.

Contents

<i>Declaration</i>	<i>iv</i>
<i>Abstract</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>vii</i>
1. Introduction	1
Fossil deposits of the Naracoorte Caves World Heritage Area.....	2
Faunal responses to Pleistocene climate change	4
Application to biodiversity conservation	5
Study Assemblages.....	7
Aims	9
Supporting objectives	9
Thesis Structure	13
Introduction to the literature review	13
Introduction to the research chapters, style and progression.....	13
2. Literature Review	17
Natural variation in (palaeo)ecological assemblages: scale, measurement and interpretation.	17
Introduction	17
Climate change: biodiversity adaptation and resilience	17
Palaeoecology and biodiversity conservation	19
Fossil deposits of the Naracoorte Caves World Heritage Area.....	21
Scientific and natural history values	21
Geological Context.....	22
Palaeontological Research.....	24
Palaeoecology of the NCWHA	39
Palaeoenvironmental reconstructions.....	39
Climate change effects on local faunas	44
Defining natural variation and resilience in palaeoecological systems.....	52
Resilience of Naracoorte mammal faunas to past climate change	52
Natural variation/resilience framework.....	53
Numeric and ecological hierarchy of natural variation.....	55
Forward projection of trends: challenges and potential	59
3. Chronology and stratigraphy of the Wet Cave vertebrate fossil deposit, Naracoorte, and relationship to paleoclimatic conditions of the Last Glacial Cycle in south-eastern Australia	61
Abstract	63
Introduction	64
Site Description, Excavation and Original Sedimentary Analysis.....	65
Geological Setting	65
Excavation	65
Sedimentary Analysis.....	67
Methods	67

Stratigraphic sequence.....	67
Radiocarbon Dating.....	69
Results	71
Sedimentary Sequence and Chronology.....	71
Discussion	75
Relationship to other Upper Pleistocene sequences of the NCWHA.....	75
Paleoclimatic Context.....	76
Conclusions	84
Acknowledgements	85
4. Bayesian age-depth modelling of Late Quaternary deposits from Wet and Blanche Caves, Naracoorte, South Australia: a framework for comparative faunal analyses.....	86
Abstract	88
Introduction	88
Regional Setting and Study Sites	91
Geological setting of the Naracoorte Caves	91
Wet Cave (5U10, 11).....	93
Blanche Cave (5U4, 5, 6)	95
Materials and Methods	99
Bayesian age-depth models.....	99
Correlation of Wet and Blanche Cave Phases.....	104
Results	104
Wet and Blanche Cave Bayesian Models.....	104
Phase Durations and Potential Hiatuses	105
Correlation of Wet and Blanche Cave Phases.....	117
Discussion	119
Wet and Blanche Cave Bayesian age-depth model priors	119
Outliers	121
Phase durations, hiatuses and chronological interpretation.....	125
Correlation of Wet and Blanche Cave Phases.....	128
Conclusion.....	130
Acknowledgements	131
5. Late Quaternary small mammal faunas of the Naracoorte Caves World Heritage Area.....	132
Abstract	133
Introduction	133
Methods	135
Study site	135
Fossil assemblages	137
Accumulation mode	139
Species identification	140
Results	141
Diversity	141

Discussion	145
Late Quaternary small mammal diversity	145
Faunal turnover and biogeographic implications	146
Fossil records as biodiversity baselines for conservation	148
Conclusion.....	149
Acknowledgements	150
6. Late glacial reorganisation of a small mammal palaeocommunity in southern Australia reveals thresholds of change.....	151
Abstract	152
Introduction	153
Study region	158
Geological setting of the Naracoorte Caves	161
Chronology and stratigraphy of Wet and Blanche caves	161
Methods	163
Sample collection and fossil identification	163
Faunal analysis: data standardisation	165
Faunal analysis: whole-palaeocommunity and individual species variables ..	166
Faunal analysis: site- and time-effects	167
Palaeoclimatic and environmental context.....	169
Results	170
Data summary.....	170
Sampling variation of the local palaeocommunity: site-effects	170
Macroscale time-effects on palaeocommunity metrics	177
Mesoscale time effects on palaeocommunity metrics	178
Time-effects on individual species relative abundances	182
Discussion	187
Similarity of Wet and Blanche Cave fossil assemblages: palaeocommunity variables.....	187
Similarity of Wet and Blanche Cave fossil assemblages: relative abundance of individual species	188
Macro- versus mesoscale patterns of natural variation, persistence and intrinsic thresholds of change	190
Palaeoclimatic and environmental thresholds	193
Conclusions	200
Acknowledgments	201
7. Concluding Discussion	203
Stratigraphic and temporal analyses (chapters three and four)	204
Late Quaternary small mammal faunas of the Naracoorte Caves (chapters five and six)	208
Final Synthesis	217
Appendix A	223
Appendix B.....	247
Appendix C.....	251
Appendix D	257

Appendix E.....	277
Appendix F.....	296
References	299