

Understanding the relationship between the social determinants of health (SDH), Paediatric Emergency Department use and the provision of primary care: a mixed methods analysis

Yvonne Karen Parry
**RN, BA (Psychology & Public Policy), MHSM, GradCertEdu (Higher
Education)**
October 2011

School of Medicine,
Social Health Sciences,
Flinders Promotion Prevention and Primary Health Care,
Flinders University

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for the Degree of Doctor of
Philosophy

CONTENTS

Summary	x
Declaration	xi
Publications from this thesis	xiii
Peer reviewed chapters	xiii
Acknowledgements	xiii
Preface	xv
Topic choice	xvi
Chapter 1	1
Introduction	1
The biomedical model of health	2
Origins in mind-body dualism	2
Limitations of the biomedical model	4
i.) Failure to deal with psychological and social causes of disease	4
ii.) High costs of medical technology and biomedical solutions	5
iii.) Effectiveness of public interventions	6
iv.) Cost effectiveness of lifestyle changes	7
v.) Transition of disease causes from acute infection to chronic illness	7
vi.) Contradictory approach to medical evidence by practitioners	8
Biomedical model and health care access	9
Summary	10
The biopsychological model of health	11
Biopsychological model – definitions	11
Behaviourist approaches	11
Psychoanalytical approaches	12
Cognitive therapy approaches	12
Limitations of the biopsychological model	12
i.) Fails to account for the broader psychosocial causes of illness	13
ii.) Fails to account for the social patterns of illness	13
iii.) Fails to address prevention aspects of illness	13
iv. Social causes of psychological illness	14
Biopsychological model and health access	14
Summary	14
The biopsychosocial model of health	15
Biopsychosocial model – definitions	15
The social model of health and the social determinants of health (SDH).....	15
The social model approach to health.....	16
Social determinants of health (SDH)	16
The history and the formation of the social determinants of health (SDH).....	19
Neo liberal / market model of health.....	20
The effects of the ‘market-driven’ health policy	21
Social justice and the social model of health: implications for government policy	22
Conclusion.....	25
Chapter 2	27

Introduction	27
The significance of the social determinants of health (SDH)	28
The structural social determinants of health	28
Structural SDH result in social inequities	29
SDH as a form of social stratification	29
Power factors mediating health	32
Theoretical discussions of power	32
Karl Marx, Neo Marxism: Class and economics	32
Max Weber: Class status political affiliations	33
Michel Foucault: Knowledge/power	35
Anthony Giddens: Power to and power over	35
Feminist theories of power	36
Iris Marion Young's views of power	38
Overtness and covertness of power	39
Exploitation	40
Marginalisation	40
Powerlessness	42
Cultural imperialism	43
Violence	44
Summary of Young's theory of oppression	44
Power: implications for population health	45
The structural social determinants of health	46
Income	46
Power, income and health access	48
Occupation	48
Power, occupation and health access	50
Social class	51
Power, social class and health access	52
Education	52
Power, education and health access	53
Gender	53
Power, gender and health access	54
Ethnicity	55
Power, ethnicity and health access	55
Conclusion for the structural SDH	56
The intermediary social determinants of health	56
Social mechanisms, public policy and health	57
Public policy and the SDH	58
Conclusion	59
Chapter 3	62
Introduction	62
Conceptual frameworks	62
Socio-economic and political context	62
Health systems as a structural determinant of health	63
The public-integrated model	63
The public-contract model	64
The private insurance model	65
Health access	66

Payment options and health access	68
General practitioner (GP) access.....	68
Using emergency departments	70
Family access	73
The use of emergency departments for health access and its implications for continuing care	74
Significance of this research: research on inappropriate use of emergency department (ED) services	77
Epidemiological conditions	79
Significance.....	80
Conclusion.....	80
Chapter 4	82
Introduction	82
Statement of purpose	82
Methods statement	84
Mixed methods.....	84
Sequencing	86
Study Design	86
Research Process: Stages.....	86
Stage 1.....	87
Stage 2.....	88
Stage 3.....	89
Research process: HAS ED data	89
Determining the current Priority 5 usage rates: HAS ED data.....	89
Rationale for using HAS ED data.....	89
Rationale for using qualitative interviews.....	91
Narrative research and analysis	92
History	92
The use of narrative to determine social constructions	94
Structural elements of the narrative.....	95
Orientation in time and place.....	96
Complexity of the event.....	96
Complications of a critical event.....	96
Implications arising from the critical event.....	97
Meanings and actions assigned to the events.....	97
The result or outcome of the event.....	97
Social and power implications of narrative analysis	98
Rationale for using a CALD focus group.....	98
Rationale for using semi-structured questions.....	99
The qualitative research participants.....	100
Staff.....	103
Members checks	104
Quantitative data	104
Demographic data	104
Epidemiological data	104
Quantitative data collection	106
Quantitative participants	107
Analysis.....	107
Cross tabulation	107

The use of chi square (χ^2)	108
Multiple regression model	109
Quantitative data checks	109
Ensuring rigour	110
Generalisability, reliability and validity	110
Qualitative and quantitative reliability in mixed methods	111
Triangulation of qualitative and quantitative results	112
Validity	115
Qualitative validity	115
Quantitative validity	115
Mixed methods validity	116
Limitations of the study design	117
Ethics approval	118
Conclusion	119
Chapter 5	121
Introduction	121
Section 1: International literature and themes of emergency department use	122
Characteristics of emergency department users	122
Socioeconomic influences on emergency department users	123
Availability of alternative services	124
Use and over-use of emergency departments	125
Deprivation as a proxy for the social determinants of health	128
Deprivation and the social determinants of health	130
Deprivation and use of the emergency department in South Australia at Women's and Children's Health Network (WCHN)	131
Univariate analysis of the seven postcodes areas with the most frequent use of WCHN Paediatric ED June 2009-December 2009.	134
Section 2: Transport, triage priority and admission status and the provision of primary care services such as general practitioners	138
Univariate analysis of the independent variables comparing characteristics of the total presentations to the WCHN Paediatric ED June 2009-December 2009	138
SEIFA IRSD score and transport	138
SEIFA IRSD area score and triage priority at attendance at the emergency department.	140
Departure and admission status	142
Provision of primary care services in areas representing the highest use of the ED.	145
GP service provision	145
The distance from the hospital and the emergency department use ..	147
A Chi square (χ^2) analysis of triage priority and distance using all 25,520 cases of South Australian attendance at the WCHN ED July 2009-December 2009.	149
Alternative services	149
Multivariate analysis of the independent variables and the use of ED for primary care services	151
Regression analysis	151

Multiple regression analysis	151
Operational definitions	152
Multiple regression procedure.....	153
Multiple regression results	153
Discussion of multiple regression results.....	156
Binary logistic regression results from all 25,520 attendances	157
Section 3	158
Social determinants of health (SDH)	158
Limitations of quantitative data	159
Conclusion.....	159
Chapter 6	162
Introduction	162
Qualitative Procedure	162
Narrative analysis.....	162
Introducing the families: Socio-Economic Index For Area (SEIFA) Index of Relative Social Disadvantage (IRSD) area score	163
SEIFA IRSD areas of families interviewed	164
i.) A lack of GP services.....	166
ii.) Children are a specific health consumer group: the GP has a limited skill set in treating and managing children, and the time taken to treat a child.....	170
iii.) Locum availability.....	172
iv.) Familial differences in health service use	173
v.) Constructions of ‘good parenting’	174
The social context of this narrative research	175
i.) Cost of attending a GP.....	175
Powerlessness of influencing health access	176
ii.) Other Emergency Departments: alternatives to WCHN ED.....	177
iii.) Use of telephone triage services.....	178
iv.) Violence in other Emergency Department services	181
v.) The need for specialist care.....	181
vi.) A lack of understanding of the role of this child and state specific Emergency Department.....	186
Limitations of the narrative accounts	188
Conclusions.....	188
Chapter 7	191
Introduction	191
Section 1	191
Attendance at the emergency department	191
Culturally And Linguistically Diverse (CALD) focus group	192
No after hours GP services	193
Locum use.....	194
Family differences in health use	195
An extension of community based services	196
Cost of GP health access.....	197
Parental constructs of being a good parent.....	197
Section 2	199
Staff interviews.....	199
The difficulties in diagnosing children.....	200

Masking illness.....	200
Indirect diagnosis.....	201
Issues for GP services	201
Examination process for a child.....	201
Remuneration for examinations.....	202
Lack of GP appointments.....	203
Lack of after hours GP services.....	203
Unsuitability of a locum service.....	204
The deterioration in the GP skill set over time	204
Cost of GP visits	205
The use of the emergency department for specialist tests	206
Limits to the use of Emergency Departments for primary care.....	207
CALD health access.....	208
Closing of paediatric services.....	208
Staff themes summary	209
Community health care provision interviews – alternative services to the emergency department	209
GP Plus Clinic services	209
GP Plus Clinic 1.....	210
GP Plus Clinic 2.....	213
Summary of the GP Plus centres.....	213
Extended Care Paramedics (ECP).....	214
Discussions	215
Conclusions.....	215
Chapter 8	218
Introduction	218
Background to this study	219
Part one.....	220
Research question	220
A summary of the research methods.....	220
Summary of quantitative methods	220
Summary of qualitative methods.....	221
Summary of mixed methods	221
Theoretical Triangulation	222
Findings.....	222
Part two	226
SDH and Health access	226
General summary of the SDH	226
Deprivation at a theoretical level	226
Deprivation and SDH	227
ED use and deprivation.....	227
Not only deprivation but a lack of services.....	228
Constructions of parenting and the provision of health care.....	228
Parental constructions of good parenting	229
Health access as a family organised process	230
Part three	230
Models of health care	230
Policy, power and the provision of health care	232
Power and the medical professional.....	233
Incremental structural inertia	235

Incremental structural inertia and Medicare.....	238
The health system as a structural social determinant of health.....	238
The need to address children’s health access	239
The possible solutions: Future service provision	240
GP Plus and GP Super Clinic services.....	240
Nurse Practitioners (NP) and Extended Care Paramedics (ECP)	241
Conclusion.....	241
Recommendations	242
Intermediary SDH.....	242
Structural SDH	243
Future research	243
References	245
Appendices	271
Appendix A	271
Staff semi-structured interview schedule	274
ED Staff Questions.....	274
Thank you, for your time and assistance in this research.....	277
Staff Consent	278
Family interview schedule	280
Participant Consent.....	281
Participant Letter of Introduction.....	283
Appendix C	1
Appendix D	1
Stein formula.....	1

FIGURES

Figure 1.1 Social view of health (CNHAS 2010, p. 2).....	17
Figure 2.1 Determinants of health (Dahlgren & Whitehead 1991).....	31
Figure 2.2 The structural and intermediary SDH	57
Figure 2.3 The structural and intermediary SDH	59
Figure 3.1 Social determinants of health influencing health access.....	80
Figure 4.1 Research Logic Model (adapted from Kumar 2005)	83
Figure 4.2 Study design and stages (adapted from Kumar 2005 and Woolley 2009).....	87
Figure 5.1 Numbers of children attending per South Australian postcode ...	134
Figure 5.2 Postcode areas of children with the seven highest rates of attendance at WCHN Paediatric ED	135
Figure 5.3 WCHN ED use by the seven highest use postcode areas showing the SEIFA IRSD of each postcode area	137
Figure 5.4 SEIFA IRSD area score and the frequency of differing modes of transport	139

Figure 5.5 SEIFA IRSD area score and the triage priority score on attendance at ED.....	141
Figure 5.6 percentage of children discharged from ED by SEIFA IRSD quintile score June 2009-December 2009.	142
Figure 5.7 WCHN ED (in pink) attendance rates for the top seven postcodes	144
Figure 5.8 The model used to explain the impact of the independent variables and the dependent variable triage priority 4 and 5.....	154
Figure 8.1 Proposed familial model of health access	229

TABLES

Table 2.1 Unemployment of Indigenous peoples vs Non-Indigenous peoples by remoteness	41
Table 4.1 Percentage of Paediatric ED attendance by priority level 2007-200891	
Table 4.2 Qualitative research participants (families).....	102
Table 4.3 Postcode data, area, local government area (LGA) and statistical location area (SLA)	106
Table 5.1 Characteristics forming the ABS IRSD measure for the SEIFA score	129
Table 5.2 Quintile ranges	133
Table 5.3 SEIFA IRSD area score and the corresponding postcode area and number of children presenting to ED service	136
Table 5.4 The top seven postcode areas and access to GP services by head of population and distance from the WCHN ED department 2009	148
Table 5.5 Beta coefficients for triage priority 4 and 5 (Coefficients a)	155
Table 6.1 SEIFA IRSD area code for each family interviewed	164
Table 7.1 The staff designation of the ten staff interviewed.....	199
Table 7.2 Area of GP Plus and GP Super clinics by the numbers of population per GP and area SEIFA IRSD quintile score.....	210

Summary

Understanding the relationship between the social determinants of health (SDH) and the use of emergency departments (ED) for triage priority 4 and 5 presentations, that are discharged, that would be better serviced by primary care providers, rather than an emergency response, is complex. The difficulty with a SDH approach, is in determining appropriate measures. A number of researchers have addressed this difficulty by focusing on the relationship between deprivation, as a measure, and attendance at ED. This thesis provides an overview of relevant research on the relationship between deprivation and attendance at a Paediatric Emergency Department.

This research employed a mixed methods approach utilising Hospital Admission Status data (HAS ED), Social Health Atlas data (demographic data), measures of deprivation (Socioeconomic Index For Area [SEIFA] the Index of Relative Social Disadvantage [IRSD]), levels of primary care provision data (epidemiological) and parent and staff interviews to explore the factors relating to high attendances at a paediatric ED in South Australia.

The qualitative findings indicate that a dearth of services, such as limited service provision (lack of GP appointments), or after hours services and a lack of broader community based primary services (for example the provision of blood tests, x-rays) influences high Paediatric ED attendances rather than distance to ED, or cost. In addition, the quantitative findings found the highest levels of primary care Paediatric ED attendance were from areas with high levels of deprivation. Further, there were significant positive relationships between possible primary care attendance and discharge status, distance to ED, and attending ED using a private vehicle (rather than emergency vehicle). The epidemiological data suggests that there is a dearth of GP services in areas with higher than average levels of illness. Reasonably, this may impact on the ability of parents to access timely and appropriate health care services from primary care providers.

The lack of a child specific skill set in GPs, no after hours GP services, and differences in familial health access were some of the major qualitative findings from the study. These findings differ from other studies that showed: intra-familial consistency of ED use; and that parental anxiety increases ED use. Further, the respondents described the influences and characteristics of service provision that influence their use of ED for primary health care. These factors are of a structural social determinants of health (SDH) nature. The changes to universal health care provision impacting on paediatric ED use have occurred gradually over time. This is termed here as ‘incremental structural inertia’ and has led in recent times to a decrease in the provision of GP services that may have increased the use of ED for primary health care. The most distinctive contribution this research makes to the body of knowledge regarding health access is that despite the usefulness of the GP Plus and GP Super Clinics in addressing some of the intermediary SDH such as social support, parenting support and preventative health interventions, the GP Plus and GP Super Clinics will not change the numbers of category 4 and 5 presentations to ED unless there is an increase in the numbers of: GPs, paediatrically trained community health care providers and after hours services.

Declaration

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any materials previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text;

Signed

Dated

Publications from this thesis

Peer reviewed chapters

Parry Y & Willis E, 2009, “The Social Context of Psychological Behaviour”, chapter 5 in Barkway P, *Psychology for Health Professionals*. Elsevier: Sydney.

Parry Y & Willis E, 2011, “The social determinants of health and the health care system”, chapter 19 in Liamputtong P, Fanany R & Verrinder G, *Health, Illness and Wellbeing: Perspectives and the Social Determinants of Health*. Oxford University Press: Melbourne.

Willis E & Parry Y, 2011, “Understanding the Australian Health system”, chapter 1 in Willis E, Keleher H & Reynolds L, *Understanding the Australian Health Care System: An Introduction for Health Professionals*. Elsevier: Sydney.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost I would like to thank my principle supervisor Associate Professor Eileen Willis for her encouragement, and steadfast certainty in me and my ability, and for the questions that helped me formulate ideas, and concepts, and filled me with the enthusiasm to do more, and work harder. I would also like to thank Eileen for her pursuit of my best interests, her determination in challenging me to extend myself and her sense of humour which made our supervision sessions both highly productive and enjoyable.

A further note of thanks goes to my two other supervisors Prof Carol Grbich and Dr Judith Peppard for their ongoing encouragement and support.

I would most sincerely like to thank Mr Pawel Skuse for his guidance encouragement and support in chapter 5 with the SPSS analysis. Pawel has provided hours of discussion and reference material encouraging me to read more and complete yet more analysis. I would also sincerely like to thank Dr Shahid Ullah, Biostatistician, for checking the statistical analysis to ensure the appropriateness of methods, and the accuracy of the results.

I would also like to thank Ms Wendy Green and Ms Liz Avery for their useful comments and editing in the earlier drafts of this thesis.

I would also like to express my gratitude and appreciation for the effort and assistance afforded me by Dr Jeremy Raftos, the then medical director of the Emergency Department, Ms Monique Annions, the nursing director of the ED and Ms Anna Piscelleneo, the administration officer, for their assistance and encouragement in this research, in the mail-out of letters inviting families to participate and their support in the staff interview process. This assistance was immeasurable and invaluable. Without it the research could not have proceeded and I am very grateful. Thank you.

I would like to thank the staff and patient families of the Women's and Children's Health Network ED for giving up their valuable time and participating in this research. The CALD focus group and the staff of the community health service providers also require thanking as without their assistance the alternative community base perspectives could not have been explored.

My most heartfelt thanks to my husband Gary Derek Walkden for his practical support in organising everything else in our lives so I could concentrate on my PhD, and for his unwavering love, confidence and validation of my abilities even in my darkest moments when writing another word seemed too hard.

Last but not least, I would like to thank our three children Leela, Toby and Tiffany for their love, countenance and unfaltering support. The knowledge that so many believed in me made the journey easier.

Completing a PhD is a large objective and the following quotation by Alfred Wainwright has helped to inspire me:

One should always have a definite objective, in a walk, as in life it is so much more satisfying to reach a target by personal effort than to wander aimlessly. An objective is an ambition and life without ambition is ... well aimless wandering. (1972)

Preface

Health access is one of the first steps in the process of maintaining optimum health. Using health services for health access also needs to be sustainable. The use of Emergency Departments (ED) for primary care is not only a costly and inefficient use of health resources, but also may fail to provide the appropriate longer term care often required by children. There is a need to investigate the nexus between the provision of primary care and the use of ED. Why do parents choose ED over community based primary care for non-urgent health conditions? Further, does attendance at ED influence decisions on future health access? Does the use of ED for primary care represent a familial pattern of health access? These questions are important in understanding the influences on health access. This thesis explores the complex relationships involved in the use of paediatric ED for primary care.

The research question: How do the Social Determinants of Health (SDH) and the provision of primary care impact on the use of Paediatric ED for primary care. The aim of this study was to use Hospital Admission Status data, Social Health Atlas data, measures of deprivation, levels of primary care provision data and interviews with parents, staff and community service providers to explore factors relating to high attendance at a South Australian Paediatric ED.

This thesis is divided into eight chapters. Chapter 1 provides a discussion on the models of health. This outlines a framework for understanding how health is structured and the influence of these models on health delivery. Further, Chapter 1 traces the development of the SDH and its impact on health access. In addition, Chapter 1 explores aspects of health access from an ethical perspective. Chapter 2 further develops the concepts of SDH in conjunction with Young's theory of the relations of power. These constructs are applied to health. Chapter 3 advances the discussion on the socio-political context of health systems, services and access. The impact of use of ED by families and the significance of this research is also investigated in Chapter 3. Chapter 4 provides the questions and methods statements and the rationale for the use of mixed methods; the qualitative method of interviews

and narrative analysis, the collection and analysis of quantitative data; epidemiological, demographic, and chi square (χ^2) and multiple regression. The use of mixed methods for triangulation and validity are elucidated. Chapter 5 is divided into three sections. The first reviews the literature on ED use and deprivation. The second provides the results from the quantitative analysis, while the third section discusses these findings within a SDH framework. Chapter 6 furnishes a narrative analysis of the parent in-depth interviews and an analysis of the reoccurring concepts into themes. Chapter 7 has two sections. Section one analyses the results of a Culturally and Linguistically Diverse focus group. Section two provides the results of the staff interviews. A comparison on the main themes from all of the interviews provides a triangulation and summary of the interview data. The final chapter (8) reviews the results of all the data using a SDH and Young's theories on power to develop a concept of incremental structural inertia. Using these findings, this chapter then explores the impact of the development of new services such as, GP Plus, GP Super Clinics and Medicare Locals on health access.

Topic choice

The use of mixed methods for this type of research seemed appropriate for three reasons. Firstly, investigating health access and the use of ED requires a technique that utilises both quantitative and qualitative procedures in order to capture the amount and the reasons for use. Secondly, the World Health Organisation (WHO) recommends the use of mixed methods for researching health access (Solar & Irwin 2010). Finally, a mixed method potentially increases the robustness of the research process by triangulating the results through multiple methods and sources of information.

Qualitative researchers have a close engagement with the research process, participant selection and research outcomes. As a consequence, it is important that their personal characteristics and training be explained (Tong, Sainsbury & Craig 2007). My interest in this topic stems from my experiences as a single parent, and a former resident, having completed my schooling in one of the lowest SEIFA IRSD areas in South Australia. Further, as a Registered Nurse, the health of others and the influence of deprivation, and socio-cultural aspects of disadvantage became evident

to me during the course of a 30 year career¹. A Bachelor degree in Psychology and Public Policy also highlighted the demographic distribution of mental health issues and the need for a political will to intervene in order to change population differences in health outcomes. This insight directed the choice of topic.

¹ I am a migrant and the first in my family both here and internationally to complete a University degree